

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R1.1 [for F1]	By the end of Fiscal Year 2024, HSH, working with the Controller's Office and the Homelessness Oversight Commission, should develop a set of contract performance outcomes that will be consistently applied across all contracts for the provision of homelessness services and that will link directly to HSH's Home By the Bay strategic goals.	Office of the Mayor [August 27, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	Most HSH agreements are grant agreements with nonprofit providers. The Civil Grand Jury report notes that grant agreement G-100 forms are for nonprofits, while P-600s are for for-profit providers. While this is mostly the case, Personal Services Contracts, or P-600s, are used for nonprofits in some cases, including when nonprofit providers are caring for a City asset or there are labor considerations. A small percentage of HSH's agreements are P-600 contracts that involve the Office of Contract Administration (OCA). HSH's grant agreements do not involve OCA, so they play a limited role in this report's findings. In the responses to all these findings and recommendations, HSH uses the term "agreement" to refer to both contract and grant agreements with providers. HSH is committed to developing more standardization in performance outcomes and to track metrics that produce reliable and actionable improvements, impacting system-wide outcomes that demonstrate the effectiveness of various interventions in overall homelessness. In FY 2023-24, HSH is developing a comprehensive Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) as referenced in the new citywide Strategic Plan on homelessness, the "Home by the Bay" plan. It will include performance outcomes for each intervention that will align with the new system-wide goals described in Home by the Bay and it will include a framework for assessing individual program performance. The framework will prioritize core metrics for program reporting and a process by which these will be reflected and monitored in all agreements. The process to update Appendix A service and outcome objectives for all of HSH's agreements is a substantial undertaking and will take place over the next few years due to the varied nature of programs, mixed funding streams with associated requirements, and different agreement term durations. This process will require a high level of effort and thoughtfulness to communicate new metrics to providers, set achievable targets per provider, and develop tools to calculate and monitor measures across the system. This work includes eliminating measures that may be less meaningful, as the Civil Grand Jury identified (ex. 100% of guests with referral needs shall be provided referrals). HSH expects to finalize this comprehensive Homelessness Response System Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) in FY 2023-24 and expects that several measures will be calculable within the next 1-2 years, even as updates to existing agreements are still taking place. HSH agreements will have standardized new metrics integrated as services are reproced or as agreements are amended.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	In FY 23-24, HSH began our work to create a list of comprehensive service and outcome objectives that will be included in the Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) anticipated to be published by the end of the calendar year. The PMP, as referenced in the citywide Strategic Plan on homelessness, Home by the Bay, will include performance outcomes for each intervention that will align with the new system-wide goals described in Home by the Bay. The process to update Appendix A service and outcome objectives for all of HSH's agreements is a substantial undertaking and will take place over the next few years as part of the department's multi-year procurement plan which will reprocur services by program area. Due to the varied nature of programs, mixed funding streams with associated requirements, and different agreement term durations, adding updated objectives to contracts will require a high level of effort and thoughtfulness. This work will include tailoring some of the outcome objectives and targets unique to that program, and eliminating measures that may be less meaningful, as the Civil Grand Jury identified (ex. 100% of guests with referral needs shall be provided referrals). Part of the department's work in FY 23-24 was to develop the data infrastructure needed to ensure we can track all metrics included in the PMP. The department is currently working on developing calculations for the PMP metrics to review and analyze current performance. This baselining will inform program-specific targets as we begin to integrate these measures into our contracts. Integrating these metrics into our contracts will also enable our ability to hold providers accountable to agreed upon performance targets. In addition, we are beginning work with the Harvard Government Performance Lab who will provide recommendations and strategies for implementing the performance measures, setting targets, and driving towards results-based contracting.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R1.1 [for F1]	By the end of Fiscal Year 2024, HSH, working with the Controller's Office and the Homelessness Oversight Commission, should develop a set of contract performance outcomes that will be consistently applied across all contracts for the provision of homelessness services and that will link directly to HSH's Home By the Bay strategic goals.	Office of the Controller [August 27, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	The Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing is working with consultants on the goals of this recommendation presently. The Controller's Office staff are available to support as needed.	Recommendation Implemented	The Controller's Office is still available to support the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing as needed. The Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing is working with their consultants on this project and has not made additional requests to the Controller's Office.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R1.1 [for F1]	Inconsistent use of specific results-based outcome measures in contracts and grants impairs the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing's ability to measure and evaluate the success of its programs and the performance of the CBOs who provide homelessness services.	Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing [August 27, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	Most HSH agreements are grant agreements with nonprofit providers. The Civil Grand Jury report notes that grant agreement G-100 forms are for nonprofits, while P-600s are for for-profit providers. While this is mostly the case, Personal Services Contracts, or P-600s, are used for nonprofits in some cases, including when nonprofit providers are caring for a City asset or there are labor considerations. A small percentage of HSH's agreements are P-600 contracts that involve the Office of Contract Administration (OCA). HSH's grant agreements do not involve OCA, so they play a limited role in this report's findings. In the responses to all these findings and recommendations, HSH uses the term "agreement" to refer to both contract and grant agreements with providers. HSH is committed to developing more standardization in performance outcomes and to track metrics that produce reliable and actionable improvements, impacting system-wide outcomes that demonstrate the effectiveness of various interventions in overall homelessness. In FY 2023-24, HSH is developing a comprehensive Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) as referenced in the new citywide Strategic Plan on homelessness, the "Home by the Bay" plan. It will include performance outcomes for each intervention that will align with the new system-wide goals described in Home by the Bay and it will include a framework for assessing individual program performance. The framework will prioritize core metrics for program reporting and a process by which these will be reflected and monitored in all agreements. The process to update Appendix A service and outcome objectives for all of HSH's agreements is a substantial undertaking and will take place over the next few years due to the varied nature of programs, mixed funding streams with associated requirements, and different agreement term durations. This process will require a high level of effort and thoughtfulness to communicate new metrics to providers, set achievable targets per provider, and develop tools to calculate and monitor measures across the system. This work includes eliminating measures that may be less meaningful, as the Civil Grand Jury identified (ex. 100% of guests with referral needs shall be provided referrals). HSH expects to finalize this comprehensive Homelessness Response System Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) in FY 2023-24 and expects that several measures will be calculable within the next 1-2 years, even as updates to existing agreements are still taking place. HSH agreements will have standardized new metrics integrated as services are reproced or as agreements are amended.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	In FY 23-24, HSH began our work to create a list of comprehensive service and outcome objectives that will be included in the Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) anticipated to be published by the end of the calendar year. The PMP, as referenced in the citywide Strategic Plan on homelessness, Home by the Bay, will include performance outcomes for each intervention that will align with the new system-wide goals described in Home by the Bay. The process to update Appendix A service and outcome objectives for all of HSH's agreements is a substantial undertaking and will take place over the next few years as part of the department's multi-year procurement plan which will reprocur services by program area. Due to the varied nature of programs, mixed funding streams with associated requirements, and different agreement term durations, adding updated objectives to contracts will require a high level of effort and thoughtfulness. This work will include tailoring some of the outcome objectives and targets unique to that program, and eliminating measures that may be less meaningful, as the Civil Grand Jury identified (ex. 100% of guests with referral needs shall be provided referrals). Part of the department's work in FY 23-24 was to develop the data infrastructure needed to ensure we can track all metrics included in the PMP. The department is currently working on developing calculations for the PMP metrics to review and analyze current performance. This baselining will inform program-specific targets as we begin to integrate these measures into our contracts. Integrating these metrics into our contracts will also enable our ability to hold providers accountable to agreed upon performance targets. In addition, we are beginning work with the Harvard Government Performance Lab who will provide recommendations and strategies for implementing the performance measures, setting targets, and driving towards results-based contracting.

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R1.1 [for F1]	By the end of Fiscal Year 2024, HSH, working with the Controller's Office and the Homelessness Oversight Commission, should develop a set of contract performance outcomes that will be consistently applied across all contracts for the provision of homelessness services and that will link directly to HSH's Home By the Bay strategic goals.	Homelessness Oversight Commission [August 27, 2023]			Will Be Implemented in the Future	In FY 23-24, HSH made substantial progress on a list of comprehensive service and outcome objectives that will be included in the Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) anticipated to be published by the end of the calendar year. The PMP, as referenced in the citywide Strategic Plan on homelessness, Home by the Bay, includes performance outcomes for each intervention that will align with the new system-wide goals described in Home by the Bay. The process to update Appendix A service and outcome objectives for all of HSH's agreements to reflect PMP metrics is a substantial undertaking and will take place over the next few years as part of the department's multi-year procurement plan which will reprocure services by program area. Due to the varied nature of programs, mixed funding streams with associated requirements, and different agreement term durations, adding updated objectives to contracts will require a high level of effort and thoughtfulness. This work will include tailoring some of the outcome objectives and targets unique to that program, and eliminating measures that may be less meaningful, as the Civil Grand Jury identified (ex.100% of guests with referral needs shall be provided referrals"). Part of the department's work in FY 23-24 was to develop the data infrastructure needed to ensure we can track all metrics included in the PMP. The department is currently working on developing calculations for the PMP metrics and will review and analyze performance metrics in advance of their integration into contracts. This baselining will inform program-specific targets as we begin to integrate these measures into our contracts. Integrating these metrics into our contracts will also enable our ability to hold providers accountable to agreed upon performance targets. In addition, we are beginning work with the Harvard Government Performance Lab who will provide recommendations and strategies for implementing the performance measures, setting targets, and driving towards results-based contracting.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R1.1 [for F1]	By the end of Fiscal Year 2024, HSH, working with the Controller's Office and the Homelessness Oversight Commission, should develop a set of contract performance outcomes that will be consistently applied across all contracts for the provision of homelessness services and that will link directly to HSH's Home By the Bay strategic goals.	Office of Contract Administration [August 27, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	As noted in the findings, OCA has no operational role in the administration or monitoring of HSH contracts or grants. Most HSH agreements are grant agreements with nonprofit providers. The Civil Grand Jury report notes that grant agreement G-100 forms are for nonprofits, while P-600s are for forprofit providers. While this is mostly the case, Personal Services Contracts, or P-600s, are used for nonprofits in some cases, including when nonprofit providers are caring for a City asset or there are labor considerations. A small percentage of HSH's agreements are P-600 contracts that involve the Office of Contract Administration (OCA). HSH's grant agreements do not involve OCA, so they play a limited role in this report's findings. In the responses to all these findings and recommendations, HSH uses the term "agreement" to refer to both contract and grant agreements with providers. HSH is committed to developing more standardization in performance outcomes and to track metrics that produce reliable and actionable improvements, impacting system-wide outcomes that demonstrate the effectiveness of various interventions in overall homelessness. In FY 2023-24, HSH is developing a comprehensive Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) as referenced in the new citywide Strategic Plan on homelessness, the "Home by the Bay" plan. It will include performance outcomes for each intervention that will align with the new system-wide goals described in Home by the Bay and it will include a framework for assessing individual program performance. The framework will prioritize core metrics for program reporting and a process by which these will be reflected and monitored in all agreements. The process to update Appendix A service and outcome objectives for all of HSH's agreements is a substantial undertaking and will take place over the next few years due to the varied nature of programs, mixed funding streams with associated requirements, and different agreement term durations. This process will require a high level of effort and thoughtfulness to communicate new metrics to providers, set achievable targets per provider, and develop tools to calculate and monitor measures across the system. This work includes eliminating measures that may be less meaningful, as the Civil Grand Jury identified (ex. 100% of guests with referral needs shall be provided referrals"). HSH expects to finalize this comprehensive Homelessness Response System Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) in FY 2023-24 and expects that several measures will be calculable within the next 1-2 years, even as updates to existing agreements are still taking place. HSH agreements will have standardized new metrics integrated as services are reprocured or as agreements are amended.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	OCA has no operational role in the administration or monitoring of HSH contracts or grants. As noted in responses submitted by the Mayor's Office, HSH has implemented a number of recommendations from the Civil Grand Jury Report, and will continue to report on the progress of those efforts.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R1.2 [for F1]	By the end of Fiscal Year 2024, HSH should include, in all contracts for the provision of homelessness services, measures to facilitate tracking the outcome of the services provided across all homelessness subpopulations identified in the Home By the Bay plan, including the chronically homeless.	Office of the Mayor [August 27, 2023]	Has been implemented	HSH is treating this recommendation as applicable to all agreements (i.e., both contracts and grants). As referenced in Finding 1, HSH has included requirements in all agreements to hold providers accountable to tracking client-level data in the Department's centralized HMIS data system. This database is the tool that allows us to track outcomes for populations referenced in the Home by the Bay plan. The Home by the Bay plan references that the City will develop strategies and track outcomes related to 11 populations: veterans, youth, families, people who are justice-involved, people with behavioral health care needs, transgender and gender non-conforming people, survivors, people with disabilities, older adults, people experiencing chronic homelessness, and immigrant communities. As referenced in R1.1, the forthcoming Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) related to the citywide Home by the Bay plan will be published in fall 2023. This PMP will inform the outcomes and measures that are tracked for the groups above. Broadly speaking, the goal is to ensure all relevant subpopulations are identifiable in HMIS data so that any metrics calculated can be analyzed at a subpopulation level. Most of these populations are already identifiable in HMIS data. Certain populations, including people who are justice-involved, people with behavioral health care needs, and immigrant communities, are new areas of focus for HSH. These populations already have potential identifiers in the ONE system, but may need additional definition as HSH works to develop tailored strategies for each subpopulation.	**	

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R1.2 [for F1]	By the end of Fiscal Year 2024, HSH should include, in all contracts for the provision of homelessness services, measures to facilitate tracking the outcome of the services provided across all homelessness subpopulations identified in the Home By the Bay plan, including the chronically homeless.	Office of the Controller [August 27, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	The Controller's Office will be developing guidelines and standards for performance monitoring of nonprofit contractors in the coming year, including guidelines for on-site monitoring practices by City departments, and standards for the types of performance measures departments should apply. It may not be feasible for City departments to implement these standards within the timeline of this recommendation.	Recommendation Implemented	CSA Performance Division published the guidelines and standards for performance monitoring of nonprofit contractors on December 9, 2024. The Summary of Controller's Office Policies and Tools for Nonprofit Oversight Memorandum is posted here: https://www.sf.gov/sites/default/files/2024-12/Policy%20Suite%20Publication%20Cover%20Memo%2012.9.24%20-%20Final_2.pdf
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R1.2 [for F1]	By the end of Fiscal Year 2024, HSH should include, in all contracts for the provision of homelessness services, measures to facilitate tracking the outcome of the services provided across all homelessness subpopulations identified in the Home By the Bay plan, including the chronically homeless.	Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing [August 27, 2023]	Has been implemented	HSH is treating this recommendation as applicable to all agreements (i.e., both contracts and grants). As referenced in Finding 1, HSH has included requirements in all agreements to hold providers accountable to tracking client-level data in the Department's centralized HMIS data system. This database is the tool that allows us to track outcomes for populations referenced in the Home by the Bay plan. The Home by the Bay plan references that the City will develop strategies and track outcomes related to 11 populations: veterans, youth, families, people who are justice-involved, people with behavioral health care needs, transgender and gender non-conforming people, survivors, people with disabilities, older adults, people experiencing chronic homelessness, and immigrant communities. As referenced in R1.1, the forthcoming Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) related to the citywide Home by the Bay plan will be published in fall 2023. This PMP will inform the outcomes and measures that are tracked for the groups above. Broadly speaking, the goal is to ensure all relevant subpopulations are identifiable in HMIS data so that any metrics calculated can be analyzed at a subpopulation level. Most of these populations are already identifiable in HMIS data. Certain populations, including people who are justice-involved, people with behavioral health care needs, and immigrant communities, are new areas of focus for HSH. These populations already have potential identifiers in the ONE system, but may need additional definition as HSH works to develop tailored strategies for each subpopulation.	**	
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R1.2 [for F1]	By the end of Fiscal Year 2024, HSH should include, in all contracts for the provision of homelessness services, measures to facilitate tracking the outcome of the services provided across all homelessness subpopulations identified in the Home By the Bay plan, including the chronically homeless.	Homelessness Oversight Commission [August 27, 2023]			Recommendation Implemented	Under the oversight of the Commission, HSH includes requirements in all agreements to hold providers accountable to tracking client-level data in the Department's centralized data system, the ONE System. This database is the tool that allows HSH to track outcomes for most of the populations referenced in the Home by the Bay plan. The Home by the Bay plan references that the City will develop strategies and track outcomes related to 11 populations: veterans, youth, families, people who are justice-involved, people with behavioral health care needs, transgender and gender non-conforming people, survivors, people with disabilities, older adults, people experiencing chronic homelessness, and immigrant communities. HSH's Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) related to the citywide Home by the Bay plan is near completion. This PMP informs the outcomes and measures that are tracked for the groups above. Broadly speaking, the goal is to ensure subpopulations are identifiable in the ONE System so that any metrics calculated can be analyzed at a subpopulation level. Most of these populations are already identifiable in HSH's data system.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R2 [for F2]	By the end of Fiscal Year 2024, HSH should include, in all contracts for the provision of homelessness services, measures to facilitate tracking the outcome of the services provided across all homelessness subpopulations identified in the Home By the Bay plan, including the chronically homeless.	Office of Contract Administration [August 27, 2023]	Has been implemented	OCA has no operational role in the administration or monitoring of HSH contracts or grants. HSH is treating this recommendation as applicable to all agreements (i.e., both contracts and grants). As referenced in Finding 1, HSH has included requirements in all agreements to hold providers accountable to tracking client-level data in the Department's centralized HMIS data system. This database is the tool that allows us to track outcomes for populations referenced in the Home by the Bay plan. The Home by the Bay plan references that the City will develop strategies and track outcomes related to 11 populations: veterans, youth, families, people who are justice-involved, people with behavioral health care needs, transgender and gender non-conforming people, survivors, people with disabilities, older adults, people experiencing chronic homelessness, and immigrant communities. As referenced in R1.1, the forthcoming Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) related to the citywide Home by the Bay plan will be published in fall 2023. This PMP will inform the outcomes and measures that are tracked for the groups above. Broadly speaking, the goal is to ensure all relevant subpopulations are identifiable in HMIS data so that any metrics calculated can be analyzed at a subpopulation level. Most of these populations are already identifiable in HMIS data. Certain populations, including people who are justice-involved, people with behavioral health care needs, and immigrant communities, are new areas of focus for HSH. These populations already have potential identifiers in the ONE system, but may need additional definition as HSH works to develop tailored strategies for each subpopulation.	**	
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R2 [for F2]	By the end of FY24, HSH, working with the Controller's office, should develop standards for program and contract monitoring designed to increase on-site program monitoring; improve evaluation of, collaboration with, and support for CBOs; and minimize burdens on CBOs by consolidating overall contract and program monitoring visits from multiple agencies to the extent possible.	Office of the Mayor [August 27, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	In FY 2022-23, HSH developed the departmental policy described in the response to Finding 2 that outlines standards for program and fiscal monitoring and addresses this recommendation. These expectations will be implemented by the end of FY 2023-24. HSH's processes already attempt to minimize the burden on non-profit providers: for example, fiscal monitoring is a joint visit that covers multiple City departments/agreements, and HSH has consolidated site visits for program monitoring for housing sites that receive funding from various sources. The Department will continue to evaluate opportunities to minimize the monitoring burden on HSH's non-profit partners.	Recommendation Implemented	HSH completed the Program Operations Manual in Fall 2024 that includes standards for program and contract monitoring. The Manual was socialized with all staff on October 15, 2024 with trainings to support implementation across the department. HSH will continue to work closely with the Controller's Office to ensure new guidance on the citywide fiscal monitoring and another citywide monitoring processes are incorporated as appropriate.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R2 [for F2]	By the end of FY24, HSH, working with the Controller's office, should develop standards for program and contract monitoring designed to increase on-site program monitoring; improve evaluation of, collaboration with, and support for CBOs; and minimize burdens on CBOs by consolidating overall contract and program monitoring visits from multiple agencies to the extent possible.	Office of the Controller [August 27, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	The Controller's Office will be developing guidelines and standards for performance monitoring of nonprofit contractors in the coming year, including guidelines for on-site monitoring practices by City departments, and standards for the types of performance measures departments should apply. It may not be feasible for City departments to implement these standards within the timeline of this recommendation.	Recommendation Implemented	CSA Performance Division published the guidelines and standards for performance monitoring of nonprofit contractors on December 9, 2024. The Summary of Controller's Office Policies and Tools for Nonprofit Oversight Memorandum is posted here: https://www.sf.gov/sites/default/files/2024-12/Policy%20Suite%20Publication%20Cover%20Memo%2012.9.24%20-%20Final_2.pdf

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R2 [for F2]	By the end of FY24, HSH, working with the Controller's office, should develop standards for program and contract monitoring designed to increase on-site program monitoring; improve evaluation of, collaboration with, and support for CBOs; and minimize burdens on CBOs by consolidating overall contract and program monitoring visits from multiple agencies to the extent possible.	Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing [August 27, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	In FY 2022-23, HSH developed the departmental policy described in the response to Finding 2 that outlines standards for program and fiscal monitoring and addresses this recommendation. These expectations will be implemented by the end of FY 2023-24. HSH's processes already attempt to minimize the burden on non-profit providers: for example, fiscal monitoring is a joint visit that covers multiple City departments/agreements, and HSH has consolidated site visits for program monitoring for housing sites that receive funding from various sources. The Department will continue to evaluate opportunities to minimize the monitoring burden on HSH's non-profit partners.	Recommendation Implemented	HSH completed the Program Operations Manual in Fall 2024 that includes standards for program and contract monitoring. The Manual was socialized with all staff on October 15, 2024 with trainings to support implementation across the department. HSH will continue to work closely with the Controller's Office to ensure new guidance on the citywide fiscal monitoring and another citywide monitoring processes are incorporated as appropriate.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R2 [for F2]	By the end of FY24, HSH, working with the Controller's office, should develop standards for program and contract monitoring designed to increase on-site program monitoring; improve evaluation of, collaboration with, and support for CBOs; and minimize burdens on CBOs by consolidating overall contract and program monitoring visits from multiple agencies to the extent possible.	Office of Contract Administration [August 27, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	OCA has no operational role in the administration or monitoring of HSH contracts or grants. In FY 2022-23, HSH developed the departmental policy described in the response to Finding 2 that outlines standards for program and fiscal monitoring and addresses this recommendation. These expectations will be implemented by the end of FY 2023-24. HSH's processes already attempt to minimize the burden on non-profit providers: for example, fiscal monitoring is a joint visit that covers multiple City departments/agreements, and HSH has consolidated site visits for program monitoring for housing sites that receive funding from various sources. The Department will continue to evaluate opportunities to minimize the monitoring burden on HSH's non-profit partners.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	OCA has no operational role in the administration or monitoring of HSH contracts or grants. As noted in responses submitted by the Mayor's Office, HSH has implemented a number of recommendations from the Civil Grand Jury Report, and will continue to report on the progress of those efforts.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By the end of FY24, HSH, working with the City Controller and the City Administrator, should augment the City Performance Scorecard for Homelessness Benchmarking to provide regular reports on progress made in reducing homelessness for all subpopulations of homeless identified in the Home by the Bay strategic plan, including the chronically homeless.	Office of the Mayor [August 27, 2023]	Requires further analysis	The City Performance Scorecards are designed to visualize a subset of measures per issue area to highlight a bird's eye view of city performance. Additionally, these measures are held consistent year over year, when possible, to develop a longitudinal understanding of City Performance. The Home by the Bay plan is a five-year time-limited plan. A total of 11 subpopulations were identified as special focus areas specific to the plan, with forthcoming strategies to be developed to improve outcomes for these populations. Due to the breadth of subpopulations identified in this context, the time-limited nature of the strategic framework, and the work still to be developed in formulating strategies to address these populations, HSH does not think that this is appropriate for reporting in the City Scorecard. Instead, HSH will be developing a format to produce annual reporting on the Home by the Bay plan's progress for the duration of the five-year time span. Additionally, HSH will be working with City Performance to ensure the new Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) currently in development is used to inform improvements to the Mayor's Budget Book and City Scorecard measures at a more general level. The Department will revisit these measures in November 2023.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	As noted above, HSH anticipates publishing our Performance Metric Plan (PMP) by the end of the calendar year. The metrics included in the PMP may inform updates to the City's Scorecard. Additionally, in October 2024, HSH published the Year 1 Progress Report on our Strategic Plan (available on our website). HSH will continue to report out on progress towards our strategic plan goals that include a greater level of detail than is appropriate for the City's Scorecards and which are specific to a five-year time span.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By the end of FY24, HSH, working with the City Controller and the City Administrator, should augment the City Performance Scorecard for Homelessness Benchmarking to provide regular reports on progress made in reducing homelessness for all subpopulations of homeless identified in the Home By the Bay strategic plan, including the chronically homeless.	Office of the Controller [August 27, 2023]	Requires further analysis	The Controller's Office Scorecards are designed to provide timely information on the efficiency of San Francisco government services. Scorecards choose a few key indicators to provide a high-level view of a department's performance over time. This product is not intended to illustrate all of a department's goals and outcomes but can be used to spotlight high-priority measures, as relevant to the department. The Controller's Office Benchmarking products are designed to compare areas of San Francisco government to other peer jurisdictions. The Controller's Office published the Homelessness Benchmarking Report on July 26, 2023, which compares population and inventory of services across 17 peers between 2019 and 2022. Annual Performance Measures can be defined by a department to align to both the strategic and operational goals that department outlines in its strategic plan. This tool may be the preferred option to support the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing to monitor its progress toward achieving specific results with priority populations. The Controller's Office publishes an "Annual Performance Report" which documents annual measures and spotlighted trends each fall.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	The Controller's Office Scorecards are designed to provide timely information on the efficiency of San Francisco government services. Scorecards choose a few key indicators to provide a high-level view of a department's performance over time. This product is not intended to illustrate all of a department's goals and outcomes but can be used to spotlight high-priority measures, as relevant to the department. The Controller's Office Benchmarking products are designed to compare areas of San Francisco government to other peer jurisdictions. The Controller's Office published the Homelessness Benchmarking Report on July 26, 2023, which compares population and inventory of services across 17 peers between 2019 and 2022. Annual Performance Measures can be defined by a department to align to both the strategic and operational goals that department outlines in its strategic plan. This tool may be the preferred option to support the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing to monitor its progress toward achieving specific results with priority populations. The Controller's Office publishes an "Annual Performance Report" which documents annual measures and spotlighted trends each fall.
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By the end of FY24, HSH, working with the City Controller and the City Administrator, should augment the City Performance Scorecard for Homelessness Benchmarking to provide regular reports on progress made in reducing homelessness for all subpopulations of homeless identified in the Home By the Bay strategic plan, including the chronically homeless.	Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing [August 27, 2023]	Requires further analysis	The City Performance Scorecards are designed to visualize a subset of measures per issue area to highlight a bird's eye view of city performance. Additionally, these measures are held consistent year over year, when possible, to develop a longitudinal understanding of City Performance. The Home by the Bay plan is a five-year time-limited plan. A total of 11 subpopulations were identified as special focus areas specific to the plan, with forthcoming strategies to be developed to improve outcomes for these populations. Due to the breadth of subpopulations identified in this context, the time-limited nature of the strategic framework, and the work still to be developed in formulating strategies to address these populations, HSH does not think that this is appropriate for reporting in the City Scorecard. Instead, HSH will be developing a format to produce annual reporting on the Home by the Bay plan's progress for the duration of the five-year time span. Additionally, HSH will be working with City Performance to ensure the new Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) currently in development is used to inform improvements to the Mayor's Budget Book and City Scorecard measures at a more general level. The Department will revisit these measures in November 2023.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	As noted above, HSH anticipates publishing our Performance Metric Plan (PMP) by the end of the calendar year. The metrics included in the PMP may inform updates to the City's Scorecard. Additionally, in October 2024, HSH published the Year 1 Progress Report on our Strategic Plan (available on our website). HSH will continue to report out on progress towards our strategic plan goals that include a greater level of detail than is appropriate for the City's Scorecards and which are specific to a five-year time span.

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title (Publication Date)	Recommendation Number (for Finding Number)	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text (provided by Civil Grand Jury)	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Hitting the Performance Bullseye: Contracting for Better Outcomes in Homelessness Services [June 28, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By the end of FY24, HSH, working with the City Controller and the City Administrator, should augment the City Performance Scorecard for Homelessness Benchmarking to provide regular reports on progress made in reducing homelessness for all subpopulations of homeless identified in the Home By the Bay strategic plan, including the chronically homeless.	Office of the City Administrator [August 27, 2023]	Requires further analysis	The City Administrator's Office does not play a direct role in developing or maintaining City Performance Scorecards. City Performance Scorecards are designed to visualize a subset of measures per issue area to highlight a bird's eye view of city performance. Additionally, these measures are held consistent year over year, when possible, to develop a longitudinal understanding of City Performance. The Home by the Bay plan is a five-year time-limited plan. A total of 11 subpopulations were identified as special focus areas specific to the plan, with forthcoming strategies to be developed to improve outcomes for these populations. Due to the breadth of subpopulations identified in this context, the time-limited nature of the strategic framework, and the work still to be developed in formulating strategies to address these populations, HSH does not think that this is appropriate for reporting in the City Scorecard. Instead, HSH will be developing a format to produce annual reporting on the Home by the Bay plan's progress for the duration of the five-year time span. Additionally, HSH will be working with City Performance to ensure the new Performance Measurement Plan (PMP) currently in development is used to inform improvements to the Mayor's Budget Book and City Scorecard measures at a more general level. The Department will revisit these measures in November 2023.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	The City Administrator does not play a direct role in developing or maintaining City Performance Scorecards. As noted in responses submitted by the Mayor's Office, HSH has implemented a number of recommendations from the Civil Grand Jury Report, and will continue to report on the progress of those efforts.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R1 [for F1]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop hiring plans that staff critical service departments at a target vacancy rate of no more than 5% for Fiscal Year 2024-25.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The Department of Human Resources (DHR) is moving classes with high turn-over and high vacancy rates to a continuous testing model to ensure constant availability of qualified candidates. In addition, DHR is a renewed focus on recruiting efforts and is better marketing these hard-to-staff positions. However, a permanent vacancy rate of 5% is lower than the City's pre-COVID permanent patterns of an annual vacancy rate of approximately 7%.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R1 [for F1]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop hiring plans that staff critical service departments at a target vacancy rate of no more than 5% for Fiscal Year 2024-25.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The Department of Human Resources (DHR) is moving classes with high turn-over and high vacancy rates to a continuous testing model to ensure constant availability of qualified candidates. In addition, DHR is a renewed focus on recruiting efforts and is better marketing these hard-to-staff positions. However, a permanent vacancy rate of 5% is lower than the City's pre-COVID permanent patterns of an annual vacancy rate of approximately 7%.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.1 [for F2]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should collaborate to modify civil service rules and City policies to establish a hiring timeline goal of 60 days from when a job posting closes to when the hiring department makes a conditional job offer.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Requires further analysis	DHR is collaborating with the Civil Service Commission (CSC) and organized labor to revise the Civil Service rules to allow us to compete with private sector hiring timelines and align with current technology and labor market realities. This includes the authority to shorten various selection process time periods based on the specifics of the recruitment rather than the previous one-size-fits-all approach. DHR has also made a number of administrative processes and policy changes to streamline the hiring process. The City's shared goal is to reduce the time to hire while maintaining the core principles of the merit system. A 60-day timeline is an aspirational goal that would be very challenging for the city to attain. There are several factors which could preclude meeting the goal of a 60-day hiring timeline such as the need to review large applicant pools, conduct exams and interviews, and lengthy required background investigations which are required for certain roles. CSC plans to continue to collaborate with DHR to work towards reducing hiring timelines to an ideal and realistic goal.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	The City has collaborated with the CSC over the past two years to enact a suite of rule changes to facilitate a faster hiring process. Highlights include eliminating unnecessary review periods, changes to support more automation in our candidate processing, and changes to support the expansion of rule-of-the-list for certain classes. These support a Citywide effort to conduct more hiring for key service job classes via continuous processes. In addition, DHR has modified a series of hiring policies in an effort to expedite time-to-hire. DHR is in the process of rolling out a suite of structured interviewing reforms to support a faster and more consistent interviewing process. This includes a new Hiring Manager 101 training, the creation of hundreds of questions for interview question banks, and standard interviewing protocols to be used by teams throughout the City. DHR has also enacted candidate vetting reforms, including (1) streamlining the fingerprinting process, (2) securing additional medical clinic resources to reduce delays associated with pre-employment medical clearance checks, and (3) onboarding a new vendor to automate the employment verification process. The City typically measures time-to-hire from when a request-to-fill has been fully approved until when a candidate starts work. Under this definition, the City has made substantial process in reducing the total hiring timeline by 30 percent. DHR intends to continue to aggressively pursue strategies to reduce time-to-hire, however a 60-day timeline may be infeasible while maintaining the core elements of civil service merit based hiring.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.1 [for F2]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should collaborate to modify civil service rules and City policies to establish a hiring timeline goal of 60 days from when a job posting closes to when the hiring department makes a conditional job offer.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Requires further analysis	DHR is collaborating with the Civil Service Commission (CSC) and organized labor to revise the Civil Service rules to allow us to compete with private sector hiring timelines and align with current technology and labor market realities. This includes the authority to shorten various selection process time periods based on the specifics of the recruitment rather than the previous one-size-fits-all approach. DHR has also made a number of administrative processes and policy changes to streamline the hiring process. The City's shared goal is to reduce the time to hire while maintaining the core principles of the merit system. A 60-day timeline is an aspirational goal that would be very challenging for the city to attain. There are several factors which could preclude meeting the goal of a 60-day hiring timeline such as the need to review large applicant pools, conduct exams and interviews, and lengthy required background investigations which are required for certain roles. CSC plans to continue to collaborate with DHR to work towards reducing hiring timelines to an ideal and realistic goal.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	The City has collaborated with the CSC over the past two years to enact a suite of rule changes to facilitate a faster hiring process. Highlights include eliminating unnecessary review periods, changes to support more automation in our candidate processing, and changes to support the expansion of rule-of-the-list for certain classes. These support a Citywide effort to conduct more hiring for key service job classes via continuous processes. In addition, DHR has modified a series of hiring policies in an effort to expedite time-to-hire. DHR is in the process of rolling out a suite of structured interviewing reforms to support a faster and more consistent interviewing process. This includes a new Hiring Manager 101 training, the creation of hundreds of questions for interview question banks, and standard interviewing protocols to be used by teams throughout the City. DHR has also enacted candidate vetting reforms, including (1) streamlining the fingerprinting process, (2) securing additional medical clinic resources to reduce delays associated with pre-employment medical clearance checks, and (3) onboarding a new vendor to automate the employment verification process. The City typically measures time-to-hire from when a request-to-fill has been fully approved until when a candidate starts work. Under this definition, the City has made substantial process in reducing the total hiring timeline by 30 percent. DHR intends to continue to aggressively pursue strategies to reduce time-to-hire, however a 60-day timeline may be infeasible while maintaining the core elements of civil service merit based hiring.

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title (Publication Date)	Recommendation Number (for Finding Number)	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text (provided by Civil Grand Jury)	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.1 [for F2]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should collaborate to modify civil service rules and City policies to establish a hiring timeline goal of 60 days from when a job posting closes to when the hiring department makes a conditional job offer.	Civil Service Commission [August 20, 2023]	Requires further analysis	DHR is collaborating with the Civil Service Commission (CSC) and organized labor to revise the Civil Service rules to allow us to compete with private sector hiring timelines and align with current technology and labor market realities. This includes the authority to shorten various selection process time periods based on the specifics of the recruitment rather than the previous one-size-fits-all approach. DHR has also made a number of administrative processes and policy changes to streamline the hiring process. The City's shared goal is to reduce the time to hire while maintaining the core principles of the merit system. A 60-day timeline is an aspirational goal that would be very challenging for the city to attain. There are several factors which could preclude meeting the goal of a 60-day hiring timeline such as the need to review large applicant pools, conduct exams and interviews, and lengthy required background investigations which are required for certain roles. CSC plans to continue to collaborate with DHR to work towards reducing hiring timelines to an ideal and realistic goal.	Recommendation Implemented	The recommendation has been implemented and continues to be worked on. CSC Rules were amended in FY 2023-24 and FY 2024-25 to expedite hiring by allowing the Human Resources Director to determine length of time for job postings, applicants' response of interest, and more. Both of our departments plan to propose further amendments in this fiscal year to expedite hiring and create pathways leading to permanent civil service positions.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.2 [for F2]	By November 1st, 2023, the Mayor should establish a timeframe of 5 business days to take action on all requests for budgeted positions that require Mayoral approval.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The Mayor's Office has the authority and discretion to oversee City departments and their staffing. The Office mainly reviews budgeted positions for high level managerial positions, including directors and deputy directors, and the use of temporary funding for staff. The Office may also review positions for departments that are at risk of over-spending their budgets. Typically, positions are reviewed within several days of being escalated by the department to the Mayor's Office. However, there are positions that may require further analysis by the Mayor's Budget Office. In other cases, a position may be pending Mayor's Office approval, but it has not yet been escalated to the designated contact in the Mayor's Office for review. These reasons may mean a position is pending for more than 5 business days. Nonetheless, the Mayor's Office can and will expedite position review when appropriate.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.3 [for F2]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should create a system for tracking and evaluating delays of more than 20 days during the post-referral selection process.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	HR Analysts can identify the main contributing factor for delays in the post-referral selection process.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.3 [for F2]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should create a system for tracking and evaluating delays of more than 20 days during the post-referral selection process.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	HR Analysts can identify the main contributing factor for delays in the post-referral selection process.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.4 [for F2]	By January 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop a process to enable hiring managers to better anticipate impending employee separations and begin recruiting their replacements.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	Prior to developing a process, DHR will first research where separations are most acute and differ from historical patterns. (DHR has already begun portions of this analysis by researching likely retirement patterns.) The anticipated timeline for this research is July 1, 2024. Once this is complete, DHR will begin process redesign work to ensure voluntary separations are noted earlier.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	The City remains committed to forecasting emerging hiring patterns and intends to complete this work. To accomplish this type of reporting, DHR has developed a People Analytics Team that has recently launched the Citywide People Analytics Portal with a variety of metrics related to the hiring process. A next step in this work is to support hiring managers and HR teams in analyzing turnover patterns once this initial hiring work concludes.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.4 [for F2]	By January 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop a process to enable hiring managers to better anticipate impending employee separations and begin recruiting their replacements.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	Prior to developing a process, DHR will first research where separations are most acute and differ from historical patterns. (DHR has already begun portions of this analysis by researching likely retirement patterns.) The anticipated timeline for this research is July 1, 2024. Once this is complete, DHR will begin process redesign work to ensure voluntary separations are noted earlier.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	The City remains committed to forecasting emerging hiring patterns and intends to complete this work. To accomplish this type of reporting, DHR has developed a People Analytics Team that has recently launched the Citywide People Analytics Portal with a variety of metrics related to the hiring process. A next step in this work is to support hiring managers and HR teams in analyzing turnover patterns once this initial hiring work concludes.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.5 [for F2]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should explore and develop incentives for hiring managers to complete the post-referral selection process in a timely manner, including prioritizing reviewing applicants and entering data into the applicant tracking system in real time.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR is currently in the process of developing trainings for hiring managers on the hiring process. In addition, DHR is finalizing a list of recommendations to streamline interviewing—the key component of the post-referral selection process Both of these elements will be implemented by July 1, 2024.	Recommendation Implemented	DHR completed work on the Hiring Manager 101 training and has launched the tool with Citywide HR teams, as well as conducting meetings with departments' HR Directors, with the final to conclude in early November. The content of this training covers both how to better leverage the City's applicant tracking system, as well as structured interviewing techniques for a more standardized and timely hiring process. DHR intends to release the training for all Citywide supervisors by the end of November 2024.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.5 [for F2]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should explore and develop incentives for hiring managers to complete the post-referral selection process in a timely manner, including prioritizing reviewing applicants and entering data into the applicant tracking system in real time.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR is currently in the process of developing trainings for hiring managers on the hiring process. In addition, DHR is finalizing a list of recommendations to streamline interviewing—the key component of the post-referral selection process Both of these elements will be implemented by July 1, 2024.	Recommendation Implemented	DHR completed work on the Hiring Manager 101 training and has launched the tool with Citywide HR teams, as well as conducting meetings with departments' HR Directors, with the final to conclude in early November. The content of this training covers both how to better leverage the City's applicant tracking system, as well as structured interviewing techniques for a more standardized and timely hiring process. DHR intends to release the training for all Citywide supervisors by the end of November 2024.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.6 [for F2]	By January 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should jointly develop and present a plan for evaluating and reducing the number of job classifications.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	Since March 2023, the City has abolished 63 job classifications. The department is continuing this effort and looking into further streamlining classes for consolidation and abolishment. DHR has an existing commitment to engage in this work with the Civil Service Commission, with the next report due January 2024. DHR anticipates continuing this work in collaboration with the Civil Service Commission.	Recommendation Implemented	Since the prior report, DHR has discontinued an additional 6 obsolete classifications. In addition, since August of 2024, DHR has blocked the usage of 22 classifications in preparation for discontinuation. DHR is currently conducting an annual audit of classifications that are no longer utilized. Furthermore, DHR is exploring CalHR's major class consolidation initiative to evaluate potential strategies for the City's classification system. DHR will continue to report to the Civil Service Commission on progress.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.6 [for F2]	By January 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should jointly develop and present a plan for evaluating and reducing the number of job classifications.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	Since March 2023, the City has abolished 63 job classifications. The department is continuing this effort and looking into further streamlining classes for consolidation and abolishment. DHR has an existing commitment to engage in this work with the Civil Service Commission, with the next report due January 2024. DHR anticipates continuing this work in collaboration with the Civil Service Commission.	Recommendation Implemented	Since the prior report, DHR has discontinued an additional 6 obsolete classifications. In addition, since August of 2024, DHR has blocked the usage of 22 classifications in preparation for discontinuation. DHR is currently conducting an annual audit of classifications that are no longer utilized. Furthermore, DHR is exploring CalHR's major class consolidation initiative to evaluate potential strategies for the City's classification system. DHR will continue to report to the Civil Service Commission on progress.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R2.6 [for F2]	By January 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should jointly develop and present a plan for evaluating and reducing the number of job classifications.	Civil Service Commission [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	Since March 2023, the City has abolished 63 job classifications. The department is continuing this effort and looking into further streamlining classes for consolidation and abolishment. DHR has an existing commitment to engage in this work with the Civil Service Commission, with the next report due January 2024. DHR anticipates continuing this work in collaboration with the Civil Service Commission.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	The Human Resources Director provides updates on DHR's projects at every Civil Service Commission meeting. We look forward to the next report on class consolidation.

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title (Publication Date)	Recommendation Number (for Finding Number)	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text (provided by Civil Grand Jury)	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By December 31st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should make available an option that allows job seekers to monitor the status of their applications. To the extent this requires the development or modification of existing website(s) or technology, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors should include funds in the FY 2024–2025 budget for this purpose.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	This functionality is currently available through SmartRecruiters at a high-level. Candidates are currently able to view the status of their applications through SmartRecruiters. To the extent that the City would like to provide candidates with additional detail into the status of their applications, DHR would require additional engineering staffing resources beginning in FY24-25 to build out this functionality.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By December 31st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should make available an option that allows job seekers to monitor the status of their applications. To the extent this requires the development or modification of existing website(s) or technology, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors should include funds in the FY 2024–2025 budget for this purpose.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	This functionality is currently available through SmartRecruiters at a high-level. Candidates are currently able to view the status of their applications through SmartRecruiters. To the extent that the City would like to provide candidates with additional detail into the status of their applications, DHR would require additional engineering staffing resources beginning in FY24-25 to build out this functionality.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R4 [for F4]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop hiring plans to staff citywide HR positions at a target vacancy rate of no more than 5% for Fiscal Year 2024–25.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	To increase HR Analyst staffing levels, the City has implemented continuous testing for 1241 and 1244 HR Analysts, which will support increased availability of candidates on eligible lists for departments to hire from.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R4 [for F4]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop hiring plans to staff citywide HR positions at a target vacancy rate of no more than 5% for Fiscal Year 2024–25.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	To increase HR Analyst staffing levels, the City has implemented continuous testing for 1241 and 1244 HR Analysts, which will support increased availability of candidates on eligible lists for departments to hire from.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R5.1 [for F5]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should prepare a report evaluating the feasibility of expanding remote-work policies to compete with private sector employees.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	Competing with private sector employees is only one of many goals of the City's remote-work policies. The City is San Francisco's largest employer, public or private. The Mayor has a goal of leading all employers and their staff back into the office, and believes the City must set an example to ensure the broader economic benefits of in-person work, among other considerations. The Department of Human Resources, in consultation with the Mayor's Office and City departments, has developed a remote work policy that aims to be flexible for certain job classifications and recognize departments' differing staffing needs.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R5.1 [for F5]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should prepare a report evaluating the feasibility of expanding remote-work policies to compete with private sector employees.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	Competing with private sector employees is only one of many goals of the City's remote-work policies. The City is San Francisco's largest employer, public or private. The Mayor has a goal of leading all employers and their staff back into the office, and believes the City must set an example to ensure the broader economic benefits of in-person work, among other considerations. The Department of Human Resources, in consultation with the Mayor's Office and City departments, has developed a remote work policy that aims to be flexible for certain job classifications and recognize departments' differing staffing needs.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R5.2 [for F5]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should collaborate with public employee unions to develop recruiting and apprenticeship plans for the City's critical service departments for Fiscal Year 2024–25.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR began this work in FY22-23 and FY23-24. First, the department worked with labor unions to secure changes to MQs and rule of the list for 1820 and 1822 Administrative Analysts. This culminated in a Citywide post-referral selection process that is anticipated to half the vacancy rates for these classes. Many of the City's critical service departments are the beneficiaries of this program. In addition, the City has undertaken a program to transition hundreds of exempt employees to permanent positions. Through FY 24-25, DHR intends to continue its collaboration with City stakeholders to address critical staffing needs. This	Recommendation Implemented	DHR continues its efforts from FY22-23 and FY23-24 to expedite hiring and reduce the City's vacancy rate, which is now at half of its peak in October 2022. In fiscal In FY22-23 and FY23-24, DHR collaborated with Labor to amend Civil Service Rules that prolonged the hiring process and could be changed due to advancements in technology. DHR also increased the use of continuous testing to expand applicant pools, reduce the time to hire, and to always have a pool of candidates available for positions that have a high vacancy rate, high turnover, and are difficult to recruit. Continuous testing also allows candidates to apply for positions when they are in the job search process rather than having to wait for a recruitment to be posted. In FY 24-25, DHR will continue to expand its use of continuous testing to other classifications used by critical service departments. In addition, in the spring of 2024, DHR negotiated with the public employee unions representing all City employees, except police officers and firefighters, successor collective bargaining agreements, effective July 1, 2024 through June 30, 2027. The negotiated agreements included commitments to collaborate with Labor to develop additional apprenticeship programs for several of the unions that represent skilled trades employees that support the operations of many of the City's critical service departments. DHR and the unions have started those discussions and will continue to develop apprenticeship programs in FY24-25. New and/or inactive apprenticeship programs being discussed include: Pile Workers, Stationary Engineer, Maintenance Machinist, Utility Electrician, and Heavy Duty Truck Mechanic.

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R5.2 [for F5]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should collaborate with public employee unions to develop recruiting and apprenticeship plans for the City's critical service departments for Fiscal Year 2024-25.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR began this work in FY22-23 and FY23-24. First, the department worked with labor unions to secure changes to MQs and rule of the list for 1820 and 1822 Administrative Analysts. This culminated in a Citywide post-referral selection process that is anticipated to half the vacancy rates for these classes. Many of the City's critical service departments are the beneficiaries of this program. In addition, the City has undertaken a program to transition hundreds of exempt employees to permanent positions. Through FY 24-25, DHR intends to continue its collaboration with City stakeholders to address critical staffing needs. This	Recommendation Implemented	DHR continues its efforts from FY22-23 and FY23-24 to expedite hiring and reduce the City's vacancy rate, which is now at half of its peak in October 2022. In fiscal In FY22-23 and FY23-24, DHR collaborated with Labor to amend Civil Service Rules that prolonged the hiring process and could be changed due to advancements in technology. DHR also increased the use of continuous testing to expand applicant pools, reduce the time to hire, and to always have a pool of candidates available for positions that have a high vacancy rate, high turnover, and are difficult to recruit. Continuous testing also allows candidates to apply for positions when they are in the job search process rather than having to wait for a recruitment to be posted. In FY 24-25, DHR will continue to expand its use of continuous testing to other classifications used by critical service departments. In addition, in the spring of 2024, DHR negotiated with the public employee unions representing all City employees, except police officers and firefighters, successor collective bargaining agreements, effective July 1, 2024 through June 30, 2027. The negotiated agreements included commitments to collaborate with Labor to develop additional apprenticeship programs for several of the unions that represent skilled trades employees that support the operations of many of the City's critical service departments. DHR and the unions have started those discussions and will continue to develop apprenticeship programs in FY24-25. New and/or inactive apprenticeship programs being discussed include: Pile Workers, Stationary Engineer, Maintenance Machinist, Utility Electrician, and Heavy Duty Truck Mechanic.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R5.3 [for F5]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should collaborate with public employee unions to develop plans for retention and succession of City workers in critical service departments for Fiscal Year 2024-25.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR will be meeting with unions starting in July 2023 to identify where there are issues of retention and succession and how this can be addressed in the bargaining process. These will be negotiated in the Spring of 2024 to go into effect July of 2024.	Recommendation Implemented	In spring 2024, DHR negotiated with the public employee unions representing all City employees, except police officers and firefighters, successor collective bargaining agreements, effective July 1, 2024 through June 30, 2027. The negotiated agreements included several additions to the contracts to promote the retention and career development of existing employees. The agreements resulted in general wage increases of 13% for all employees and guaranteed a minimum wage of \$25 per hour. The agreements also included additional compensation for classifications with retention challenges such as many of the City's healthcare classifications, sworn Sheriff Department personnel, and Deputy Probation Officers. In addition, the City agreed to pursue additional Civil Service Rule changes to create expedited hiring paths for exempt employees to become permanent and to further pursue promotive pathways for current employees. The City and Labor also agreed to perform a phased in review of exempt positions for possible conversion to permanent civil service in FY24-25 and FY25-26.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R5.3 [for F5]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should collaborate with public employee unions to develop plans for retention and succession of City workers in critical service departments for Fiscal Year 2024-25.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR will be meeting with unions starting in July 2023 to identify where there are issues of retention and succession and how this can be addressed in the bargaining process. These will be negotiated in the Spring of 2024 to go into effect July of 2024.	Recommendation Implemented	In spring 2024, DHR negotiated with the public employee unions representing all City employees, except police officers and firefighters, successor collective bargaining agreements, effective July 1, 2024 through June 30, 2027. The negotiated agreements included several additions to the contracts to promote the retention and career development of existing employees. The agreements resulted in general wage increases of 13% for all employees and guaranteed a minimum wage of \$25 per hour. The agreements also included additional compensation for classifications with retention challenges such as many of the City's healthcare classifications, sworn Sheriff Department personnel, and Deputy Probation Officers. In addition, the City agreed to pursue additional Civil Service Rule changes to create expedited hiring paths for exempt employees to become permanent and to further pursue promotive pathways for current employees. The City and Labor also agreed to perform a phased in review of exempt positions for possible conversion to permanent civil service in FY24-25 and FY25-26.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R6.1 [for F6]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should work with the City Controller and City Administrator to produce a public dashboard, updated monthly, that reports time-to-hire and vacancy rates for critical service positions and departments.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR will work with departments to explore the best options available to share a dashboard with the public.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	As part of its latest round of bargaining, DHR made a commitment to our labor unions to produce a public-facing vacancy dashboard by December 31, 2024. Recent state legislation (AB 2561) also requires the City to provide vacancy data on a budgetary basis to the Board of Supervisors. To date, DHR has collaborated with the City Controller to develop and refine a vacancy dashboard that assesses unfilled positions on a budgetary basis. This is currently available to HR analysts throughout the City and DHR is in the process of making this publicly available by December 31, 2024.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R6.1 [for F6]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should work with the City Controller and City Administrator to produce a public dashboard, updated monthly, that reports time-to-hire and vacancy rates for critical service positions and departments.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR will work with departments to explore the best options available to share a dashboard with the public.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	As part of its latest round of bargaining, DHR made a commitment to our labor unions to produce a public-facing vacancy dashboard by December 31, 2024. Recent state legislation (AB 2561) also requires the City to provide vacancy data on a budgetary basis to the Board of Supervisors. To date, DHR has collaborated with the City Controller to develop and refine a vacancy dashboard that assesses unfilled positions on a budgetary basis. This is currently available to HR analysts throughout the City and DHR is in the process of making this publicly available by December 31, 2024.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R6.1 [for F6]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should work with the City Controller and City Administrator to produce a public dashboard, updated monthly, that reports time-to-hire and vacancy rates for critical service positions and departments.	Office of the City Administrator [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR will work with departments to explore the best options available to share a dashboard with the public.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	The Office of the City Administrator does not have a role in the implementation of this recommendation. DHR will report directly on progress made on the recommendations in this report.

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title (Publication Date)	Recommendation Number (for Finding Number)	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text (provided by Civil Grand Jury)	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R6.1 [for F6]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should work with the City Controller and City Administrator to produce a public dashboard, updated monthly, that reports time-to-hire and vacancy rates for critical service positions and departments.	Office of the Controller [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	As discussed in our response to the related finding, the Controller's Office is available to support DHR and others to develop public dashboards and other regular public reporting, at their direction.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	The Controller's Office has been in support of the Department of Human Resources to develop and refine the dashboards to be publicly available by December 31, 2024.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R6.2 [for F6]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should jointly develop and present improved explanatory materials and training resources for educating City workers, hiring managers and applicants on the City's hiring process.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR has already developed online content on careers.sf.gov detailing how the hiring process works for applicants (City workers and external). DHR plans to expand on this work in collaboration with the CSC, while also building out improved explanatory materials and training resources for hiring managers by July 1, 2024.	Recommendation Implemented	DHR has launched the Hiring Manager 101 training and will roll it out to all hiring managers by the end of November 2024. The training includes four distinct modules, including (1) an overview of CCSF's hiring process, (2) non-interview selection strategies, (3) how to prepare for interviews, and (4) how to conduct interviews. The first of these modules provides an in-depth overview for hiring managers. In addition, DHR's website continues to provide City employees and applicant an overview of the City's hiring process, and DHR opened a Career Center in City Hall to assist applicants and city employees with the hiring process.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R6.2 [for F6]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should jointly develop and present improved explanatory materials and training resources for educating City workers, hiring managers and applicants on the City's hiring process.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR has already developed online content on careers.sf.gov detailing how the hiring process works for applicants (City workers and external). DHR plans to expand on this work in collaboration with the CSC, while also building out improved explanatory materials and training resources for hiring managers by July 1, 2024.	Recommendation Implemented	DHR has launched the Hiring Manager 101 training and will roll it out to all hiring managers by the end of November 2024. The training includes four distinct modules, including (1) an overview of CCSF's hiring process, (2) non-interview selection strategies, (3) how to prepare for interviews, and (4) how to conduct interviews. The first of these modules provides an in-depth overview for hiring managers. In addition, DHR's website continues to provide City employees and applicant an overview of the City's hiring process, and DHR opened a Career Center in City Hall to assist applicants and city employees with the hiring process.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R6.2 [for F6]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should jointly develop and present improved explanatory materials and training resources for educating City workers, hiring managers and applicants on the City's hiring process.	Civil Service Commission [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR has already developed online content on careers.sf.gov detailing how the hiring process works for applicants (City workers and external). DHR plans to expand on this work in collaboration with the CSC, while also building out improved explanatory materials and training resources for hiring managers by July 1, 2024.	Recommendation Implemented	Implemented; Commission staff partnered with human resources divisions in every department in conducting trainings on the merit system to educate human resources analysts, hiring managers, and racial equity leaders on the hiring process for permanent civil service/provisional/exempt positions and what they can do to build a well-qualified diverse applicant pool of candidates in advance of a job vacancy. The trainings are much in demand so Commission staff will continue scheduling these trainings in 2025.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R6.3 [for F6]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop a plan to train hiring managers on hiring process changes in a timely manner while tracking feedback on how process changes are working.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR is currently working on the development of recorded hiring manager trainings, which will be complete by July 1, 2024. To understand how hiring managers and HR Analysts are affected by process changes, DHR is in the process of developing both stakeholder sentiment surveys and pre/post evaluations of process changes. DHR will then develop dashboards to display these findings for internal stakeholders.	Recommendation Implemented	DHR has launched the Hiring Manager 101 training and will roll it out to all hiring managers by the end of November 2024. The training includes four distinct modules, including (1) an overview of CCSF's hiring process, (2) non-interview selection strategies, (3) how to prepare for interviews, and (4) how to conduct interviews. The first of these modules provides an in-depth overview for hiring managers. In addition to the hiring manager sentiment surveys that DHR continues to design, the department has begun a practice of conducting surveys both prior to a hiring process improvement and following its implementation. This allows the department to measure perceptions on the impact of a particular change. Finally, DHR has begun to conduct audits of departments' usage of our hiring systems to better understand the degree to which they have implemented suggested process changes.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R6.3 [for F6]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop a plan to train hiring managers on hiring process changes in a timely manner while tracking feedback on how process changes are working.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	DHR is currently working on the development of recorded hiring manager trainings, which will be complete by July 1, 2024. To understand how hiring managers and HR Analysts are affected by process changes, DHR is in the process of developing both stakeholder sentiment surveys and pre/post evaluations of process changes. DHR will then develop dashboards to display these findings for internal stakeholders.	Recommendation Implemented	DHR has launched the Hiring Manager 101 training and will roll it out to all hiring managers by the end of November 2024. The training includes four distinct modules, including (1) an overview of CCSF's hiring process, (2) non-interview selection strategies, (3) how to prepare for interviews, and (4) how to conduct interviews. The first of these modules provides an in-depth overview for hiring managers. In addition to the hiring manager sentiment surveys that DHR continues to design, the department has begun a practice of conducting surveys both prior to a hiring process improvement and following its implementation. This allows the department to measure perceptions on the impact of a particular change. Finally, DHR has begun to conduct audits of departments' usage of our hiring systems to better understand the degree to which they have implemented suggested process changes.
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R7 [for F7]	By January 1st, 2024, the Mayor should develop incentives for City departments to remove vacant positions from their annual budgets that are unlikely to be filled in that Fiscal Year, to determine more precise vacancy rates starting with Fiscal Year 2024-25.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Annually as part of the budget process, the Mayor's Office sets budget reduction targets for departments. The Mayor's Office encourages departments to first review vacant positions, and consider the priority of those positions as they relate to core department functions. Eliminating vacant positions is one of the key ways departments meet target reductions. On its own, however, expanding this practice will not necessarily improve the reliability of measuring vacancy rates citywide since there are other factors within each department that need to be considered.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R8 [for F8]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop a plan to formally audit the use of temporary exempt positions each year to minimize their overuse.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Exempt positions and appointments are audited by DHR and the CSC on a semiannual basis. DHR provides reports to the CSC to support these audits. To help augment temporary hiring for permanent positions, DHR has also begun to expand the use of continuous class tests, temporary provisional hires, and more up-to-date active lists.	**	
2022-23	Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis [June 21, 2023]	R8 [for F8]	By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop a plan to formally audit the use of temporary exempt positions each year to minimize their overuse.	Department of Human Resources [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Exempt positions and appointments are audited by DHR and the CSC on a semiannual basis. DHR provides reports to the CSC to support these audits. To help augment temporary hiring for permanent positions, DHR has also begun to expand the use of continuous class tests, temporary provisional hires, and more up-to-date active lists.	**	

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R1 [for F1]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors should take the legislative and budgetary steps necessary to make First Year Free a permanent program.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Requires further analysis	The success of the First Year Free program continues to be analyzed, and as it has been, so too has it been extended with additional budgetary support. Additional analysis is needed to ensure that permanence is the best route for this program and for the total funding spent on it, as well as the fees included. This analysis will continue through June 30, 2024 when the program is set to expire. Leading up to then, the City will include this recommendation during its annual budget process.	Requires further analysis	Funding to extend the First Year Free program will be considered during the Mayor's phase of the City's annual budget process.
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R1 [for F1]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors should take the legislative and budgetary steps necessary to make First Year Free a permanent program.	Board of Supervisors [September 19, 2023]	Requires further analysis	The Board of Supervisors requests the Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office to study the financial impacts of making First Year Free a permanent program and provide a report by June 30, 2024	Requires further analysis	On September 27, 2024, the Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office submitted their study on the financial impacts of making First Year Free a permanent program. Board File No. 230726, the Hearing file tracking follow-up on this Report, remains pending in the GAO Committee and may be heard to close out this recommendation in 2025.
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R1 [for F1]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors should take the legislative and budgetary steps necessary to make First Year Free a permanent program.	Office of the Treasurer and Tax Collector [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The Mayor introduced legislation to make First Year Free a permanent program, and provided one year of funding in the Budget Process for the budget adopted in June, 2023 for FY 23-24. The Board of Supervisors was not comfortable approving permanent legislation without funding, and agreed to continue the program for one year, and to seek more permanent funding for First Year Free, and/or to provide fee relief to small businesses through other channels.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R2 [for F2]	By January 1, 2024, the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector should prepare a "master list" of all fees subject to waiver under the First Year Free program, which should be regularly updated and disseminated to the public, to the Office of Small Business and to all City agencies and departments that impose fees covered by the program.	Office of the Treasurer and Tax Collector [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	The recommendation has not been implemented but will be within a set timeframe as provided.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	The list is complete and is under review by the permitting departments. Will be available publicly by the end of 2024.
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By January 1, 2024, the Mayor should direct that the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector, the Planning Department, the Department of Building Inspection, the Department of Public Health, the Department of Public Works, the Entertainment Commission, the Fire Department, the Police Department, and any other City departments that impose fees covered by the First Year Free program, should implement procedures to ensure that fees are properly waived for all businesses enrolled in First Year Free, that any billing errors are promptly identified, and that any fees that are improperly charged are promptly refunded to the affected business without requiring any action by the affected business.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Departments have already implemented this recommendation. In those cases where fees are mistakenly assessed, they are refunded without requiring actions by the affected business. In addition, groups like the Office of Small Business and the Permit Center assist in proactively identifying First Year Free refund candidates.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By January 1, 2024, the Mayor should direct that the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector, the Planning Department, the Department of Building Inspection, the Department of Public Health, the Department of Public Works, the Entertainment Commission, the Fire Department, the Police Department, and any other City departments that impose fees covered by the First Year Free program, should implement procedures to ensure that fees are properly waived for all businesses enrolled in First Year Free, that any billing errors are promptly identified, and that any fees that are improperly charged are promptly refunded to the affected business without requiring any action by the affected business.	Office of the Treasurer and Tax Collector [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Departments have already implemented this recommendation. In those cases where fees are mistakenly assessed, they are refunded without requiring actions by the affected business. In addition, groups like OSB and the Permit Center assist in proactively identifying FYF refund candidates.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By January 1, 2024, the Mayor should direct that the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector, the Planning Department, the Department of Building Inspection, the Department of Public Health, the Department of Public Works, the Entertainment Commission, the Fire Department, the Police Department, and any other City departments that impose fees covered by the First Year Free program, should implement procedures to ensure that fees are properly waived for all businesses enrolled in First Year Free, that any billing errors are promptly identified, and that any fees that are improperly charged are promptly refunded to the affected business without requiring any action by the affected business.	Planning Department [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Departments have already implemented this recommendation. In those cases where fees are mistakenly assessed, they are refunded without requiring actions by the affected business. In addition, groups like the Office of Small Business and the Permit Center assist in proactively identifying First Year Free refund candidates.	**	

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title (Publication Date)	Recommendation Number (for Finding Number)	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text (provided by Civil Grand Jury)	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By January 1, 2024, the Mayor should direct that the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector, the Planning Department, the Department of Building Inspection, the Department of Public Health, the Department of Public Works, the Entertainment Commission, the Fire Department, the Police Department, and any other City departments that impose fees covered by the First Year Free program, should implement procedures to ensure that fees are properly waived for all businesses enrolled in First Year Free, that any billing errors are promptly identified, and that any fees that are improperly charged are promptly refunded to the affected business without requiring any action by the affected business.	Department of Building Inspection [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Departments have already implemented this recommendation. In those cases where fees are mistakenly assessed, they are refunded without requiring actions by the affected business. In addition, groups like the Office of Small Business and the Permit Center assist in proactively identifying First Year Free refund candidates.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By January 1, 2024, the Mayor should direct that the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector, the Planning Department, the Department of Building Inspection, the Department of Public Health, the Department of Public Works, the Entertainment Commission, the Fire Department, the Police Department, and any other City departments that impose fees covered by the First Year Free program, should implement procedures to ensure that fees are properly waived for all businesses enrolled in First Year Free, that any billing errors are promptly identified, and that any fees that are improperly charged are promptly refunded to the affected business without requiring any action by the affected business.	Department of Public Health [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Departments have already implemented this recommendation. In those cases where fees are mistakenly assessed, they are refunded without requiring actions by the affected business. In addition, groups like the Office of Small Business and the Permit Center assist in proactively identifying First Year Free refund candidates.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By January 1, 2024, the Mayor should direct that the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector, the Planning Department, the Department of Building Inspection, the Department of Public Health, the Department of Public Works, the Entertainment Commission, the Fire Department, the Police Department, and any other City departments that impose fees covered by the First Year Free program, should implement procedures to ensure that fees are properly waived for all businesses enrolled in First Year Free, that any billing errors are promptly identified, and that any fees that are improperly charged are promptly refunded to the affected business without requiring any action by the affected business.	Department of Public Works [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Departments have already implemented this recommendation. In those cases where fees are mistakenly assessed, they are refunded without requiring actions by the affected business. In addition, groups like the Office of Small Business and the Permit Center assist in proactively identifying First Year Free refund candidates.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By January 1, 2024, the Mayor should direct that the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector, the Planning Department, the Department of Building Inspection, the Department of Public Health, the Department of Public Works, the Entertainment Commission, the Fire Department, the Police Department, and any other City departments that impose fees covered by the First Year Free program, should implement procedures to ensure that fees are properly waived for all businesses enrolled in First Year Free, that any billing errors are promptly identified, and that any fees that are improperly charged are promptly refunded to the affected business without requiring any action by the affected business.	Entertainment Commission [August 20, 2023]			Recommendation Implemented	The City-wide program went into effect in November 2021. Since then, the EC has followed the billing procedure implemented by the Treasurer and Tax Collector (TTX) to properly waive the cost of our eligible departmental fees for businesses who qualify for the FYF program.
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By January 1, 2024, the Mayor should direct that the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector, the Planning Department, the Department of Building Inspection, the Department of Public Health, the Department of Public Works, the Entertainment Commission, the Fire Department, the Police Department, and any other City departments that impose fees covered by the First Year Free program, should implement procedures to ensure that fees are properly waived for all businesses enrolled in First Year Free, that any billing errors are promptly identified, and that any fees that are improperly charged are promptly refunded to the affected business without requiring any action by the affected business.	San Francisco Fire Department [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Departments have already implemented this recommendation. In those cases where fees are mistakenly assessed, they are refunded without requiring actions by the affected business. In addition, groups like the Office of Small Business and the Permit Center assist in proactively identifying First Year Free refund candidates.	**	

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title (Publication Date)	Recommendation Number (for Finding Number)	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text (provided by Civil Grand Jury)	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By January 1, 2024, the Mayor should direct that the Office of Treasurer and Tax Collector, the Planning Department, the Department of Building Inspection, the Department of Public Health, the Department of Public Works, the Entertainment Commission, the Fire Department, the Police Department, and any other City departments that impose fees covered by the First Year Free program, should implement procedures to ensure that fees are properly waived for all businesses enrolled in First Year Free, that any billing errors are promptly identified, and that any fees that are improperly charged are promptly refunded to the affected business without requiring any action by the affected business.	San Francisco Police Department [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	Departments have already implemented this recommendation. In those cases where fees are mistakenly assessed, they are refunded without requiring actions by the affected business. In addition, groups like the Office of Small Business and the Permit Center assist in proactively identifying First Year Free refund candidates.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R4 [for F4]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor, in consultation with the Office of the City Administrator, should convene a working group of all departments and agencies involved in assisting small businesses whose commercial projects are eligible for 30-day permit processing under Proposition H (as defined in this report), which will be tasked with promptly developing and implementing mechanisms and procedures to (a) accurately determine eligibility under Proposition H for 30-day permit processing; and (b) accurately and regularly track and publicly report the City's compliance with the 30-day timeline.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Planning Department, in its role as implementor, established a crossdepartmental working group in 2021. Through this working group, the 30-day permit review process for qualifying businesses has been operationalized in each department without the ongoing need for frequent meetings. Regular monitoring of the program helps the Planning Department determine if some issues or projects necessitate convening the working group. Additionally, the Permit Center has restructured its governance model to include a steering committee focused on business topics and will include the participation of stakeholders involved in regulating and stimulating business activity in San Francisco. The new business-focused steering committee will be convened by September 1, 2023, to identify the strategic work for the Permit Center for FY23-FY25.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R4 [for F4]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor, in consultation with the Office of the City Administrator, should convene a working group of all departments and agencies involved in assisting small businesses whose commercial projects are eligible for 30-day permit processing under Proposition H (as defined in this report), which will be tasked with promptly developing and implementing mechanisms and procedures to (a) accurately determine eligibility under Proposition H for 30-day permit processing; and (b) accurately and regularly track and publicly report the City's compliance with the 30-day timeline.	Office of the City Administrator [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Planning Department, in its role as implementor, established a cross-departmental working group in 2021. Through this working group, the 30-day permit review process for qualifying businesses has been operationalized in each department without the ongoing need for frequent meetings. Regular monitoring of the program helps the Planning Department determine if some issues or projects necessitate convening the working group. Additionally, the Permit Center has restructured its governance model to include a steering committee focused on business topics and will include the participation of stakeholders involved in regulating and stimulating business activity in San Francisco. The new business-focused steering committee will be convened by September 1, 2023, to identify the strategic work for the Permit Center for FY23-FY25.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R4 [for F4]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor, in consultation with the Office of the City Administrator, should convene a working group of all departments and agencies involved in assisting small businesses whose commercial projects are eligible for 30-day permit processing under Proposition H (as defined in this report), which will be tasked with promptly developing and implementing mechanisms and procedures to (a) accurately determine eligibility under Proposition H for 30-day permit processing; and (b) accurately and regularly track and publicly report the City's compliance with the 30-day timeline.	Planning Department [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Planning Department, in its role as implementor, established a cross-departmental working group in 2021. Through this working group, the 30-day permit review process for qualifying businesses has been operationalized in each department without the ongoing need for frequent meetings. Regular monitoring of the program helps the Planning Department determine if some issues or projects necessitate convening the working group. Additionally, the Permit Center has restructured its governance model to include a steering committee focused on business topics and will include the participation of stakeholders involved in regulating and stimulating business activity in San Francisco. The new business-focused steering committee will be convened by September 1, 2023, to identify the strategic work for the Permit Center for FY23-FY25.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R4 [for F4]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor, in consultation with the Office of the City Administrator, should convene a working group of all departments and agencies involved in assisting small businesses whose commercial projects are eligible for 30-day permit processing under Proposition H (as defined in this report), which will be tasked with promptly developing and implementing mechanisms and procedures to (a) accurately determine eligibility under Proposition H for 30-day permit processing; and (b) accurately and regularly track and publicly report the City's compliance with the 30-day timeline.	Department of Building Inspection [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Planning Department, in its role as implementor, established a cross-departmental working group in 2021. Through this working group, the 30-day permit review process for qualifying businesses has been operationalized in each department without the ongoing need for frequent meetings. Regular monitoring of the program helps the Planning Department determine if some issues or projects necessitate convening the working group. Additionally, the Permit Center has restructured its governance model to include a steering committee focused on business topics and will include the participation of stakeholders involved in regulating and stimulating business activity in San Francisco. The new business-focused steering committee will be convened by September 1, 2023, to identify the strategic work for the Permit Center for FY23-FY25.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R5 [for F5]	By November 30, 2023, the Board of Supervisors should resolve to allow an additional period of three years (from December 2023 through December 2026) before initiating or considering proposals to delete or amend the provisions of Proposition H (as defined in this report) requiring 30-day permit processing and elimination of neighborhood notification for eligible commercial projects.	Board of Supervisors [September 19, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	The recommendation has not been implemented but will be implemented by June 30, 2024.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	Board File No. 230726, the Hearing file tracking follow-up on this Report, remains pending in the GAO Committee and may be heard to close out this recommendation in 2025. (There has been no further action on this matter at the Board of Supervisors or its committees since the 2022 Response.)

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R6 [for F6]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor should establish an inter-departmental working group, chaired by the Office of Small Business, with membership from City departments involved in small business registration, planning, and permitting, which shall hold regular cross-departmental meetings to collaborate on implementation and troubleshooting of programs to assist small businesses, including but not limited to First Year Free and Proposition H.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Permit Center is in the process of establishing a new governance structure, under which business permitting issues would be addressed through specific working groups. The Office of Small Business will play a key role in identifying the key issues to be addressed by such working groups. The new governance structure will be implemented by September 1, 2023 with a goal of identifying the strategic work that the Permit Center will take on for FY23-24. Additionally, The City has established working groups for inter-departmental collaboration including: 1. OEWD hosted Recovery Business Permitting (monthly) 2. Permit Center Monthly Huddles (monthly) 3. Permit Center Business Steering Committee (cadence to be determined) 4. Permit Center Construction / Land Use Steering Committee (monthly) 5. Permit Center Customer Service Steering Committee (monthly) 6. Permit Center Strategic Steering Committee (met monthly and is migrating to the Permit Center Strategic Council) 7. Prop H Stakeholder Meeting (ad hoc)	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R6 [for F6]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor should establish an inter-departmental working group, chaired by the Office of Small Business, with membership from City departments involved in small business registration, planning, and permitting, which shall hold regular cross-departmental meetings to collaborate on implementation and troubleshooting of programs to assist small businesses, including but not limited to First Year Free and Proposition H.	Office of Small Business [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Permit Center is in the process of establishing a new governance structure, under which business permitting issues would be addressed through specific working groups. The Office of Small Business will play a key role in identifying the key issues to be addressed by such working groups. The new governance structure will be implemented by September 1, 2023 with a goal of identifying the strategic work that the Permit Center will take on for FY23-24. Additionally, The City has established working groups for inter-departmental collaboration including: 1. OEWD hosted Recovery Business Permitting (monthly) 2. Permit Center Monthly Huddles (monthly) 3. Permit Center Business Steering Committee (cadence to be determined) 4. Permit Center Construction / Land Use Steering Committee (monthly) 5. Permit Center Customer Service Steering Committee (monthly) 6. Permit Center Strategic Steering Committee (met monthly and is migrating to the Permit Center Strategic Council) 7. Prop H Stakeholder Meeting (ad hoc)	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R6 [for F6]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor should establish an inter-departmental working group, chaired by the Office of Small Business, with membership from City departments involved in small business registration, planning, and permitting, which shall hold regular cross-departmental meetings to collaborate on implementation and troubleshooting of programs to assist small businesses, including but not limited to First Year Free and Proposition H.	Planning Department [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Permit Center is in the process of establishing a new governance structure, under which business permitting issues would be addressed through specific working groups. The Office of Small Business will play a key role in identifying the key issues to be addressed by such working groups. The new governance structure will be implemented by September 1, 2023 with a goal of identifying the strategic work that the Permit Center will take on for FY23-24. Additionally, The City has established working groups for inter-departmental collaboration including: 1. OEWD hosted Recovery Business Permitting (monthly) 2. Permit Center Monthly Huddles (monthly) 3. Permit Center Business Steering Committee (cadence to be determined) 4. Permit Center Construction / Land Use Steering Committee (monthly) 5. Permit Center Customer Service Steering Committee (monthly) 6. Permit Center Strategic Steering Committee (met monthly and is migrating to the Permit Center Strategic Council) 7. Prop H Stakeholder Meeting (ad hoc)	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R6 [for F6]	By November 30, 2023, the Mayor should establish an inter-departmental working group, chaired by the Office of Small Business, with membership from City departments involved in small business registration, planning, and permitting, which shall hold regular cross-departmental meetings to collaborate on implementation and troubleshooting of programs to assist small businesses, including but not limited to First Year Free and Proposition H.	Department of Building Inspection [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Permit Center is in the process of establishing a new governance structure, under which business permitting issues would be addressed through specific working groups. The Office of Small Business will play a key role in identifying the key issues to be addressed by such working groups. The new governance structure will be implemented by September 1, 2023 with a goal of identifying the strategic work that the Permit Center will take on for FY23-24. Additionally, The City has established working groups for inter-departmental collaboration including: 1. OEWD hosted Recovery Business Permitting (monthly) 2. Permit Center Monthly Huddles (monthly) 3. Permit Center Business Steering Committee (cadence to be determined) 4. Permit Center Construction / Land Use Steering Committee (monthly) 5. Permit Center Customer Service Steering Committee (monthly) 6. Permit Center Strategic Steering Committee (met monthly and is migrating to the Permit Center Strategic Council) 7. Prop H Stakeholder Meeting (ad hoc)	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R7 [for F7]	By March 1, 2024, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors should take the legislative and budgetary steps necessary for the City to implement a cross-departmental technology integration strategy for the deployment of a federated computer system that will increase data visibility across all departments involved in business registration, planning, and permitting, for improved collaboration and to enable compilation of disparate system data into transparent and usable output for small business customers.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Requires further analysis	The City does not support a one-size-fits-all technology solution, recognizing the diversity of requirements across departments and stakeholders. The City remains cognizant of the potential drawbacks of a single system, which include increased implementation costs, prolonged timelines, and heightened risks. Instead, we are looking towards a more agile and adaptive strategy that leverages industry-leading practices. We agree that systems could be better integrated, and data can be aggregated to provide the department greater visibility in the end-to-end customer journey. When possible, data is being integrated, APIs are being created, and data structured to allow visibility across diverse technology is being developed.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	The City continues to remain cognizant of the potential drawbacks of a single system with a deeper consideration of the cost to provide such a system while the City is facing financial hardship.

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title (Publication Date)	Recommendation Number (for Finding Number)	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text (provided by Civil Grand Jury)	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R7 [for F7]	By March 1, 2024, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors should take the legislative and budgetary steps necessary for the City to implement a cross-departmental technology integration strategy for the deployment of a federated computer system that will increase data visibility across all departments involved in business registration, planning, and permitting, for improved collaboration and to enable compilation of disparate system data into transparent and usable output for small business customers.	Board of Supervisors [September 19, 2023]	Requires further analysis	The Board of Supervisors requests the Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office to study the financial and process impacts of making departments, including the Department of Building Inspection, move to a new computer system and provide a report by September 30, 2024.	Requires further analysis	On September 27, 2024, the Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office submitted their study on the financial and process impacts of making departments, including the Department of Building Inspection, move to a new computer system. Board File No. 230726, the Hearing file tracking follow-up on this Report, remains pending in the GAO Committee and may be heard to close out this recommendation in 2025.
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R7 [for F7]	By March 1, 2024, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors should take the legislative and budgetary steps necessary for the City to implement a cross-departmental technology integration strategy for the deployment of a federated computer system that will increase data visibility across all departments involved in business registration, planning, and permitting, for improved collaboration and to enable compilation of disparate system data into transparent and usable output for small business customers.	Office of the City Administrator [August 20, 2023]	Requires further analysis	The City does not support a one-size-fits-all technology solution, recognizing the diversity of requirements across departments and stakeholders. The City remains cognizant of the potential drawbacks of a single system, which include increased implementation costs, prolonged timelines, and heightened risks. Instead, we are looking towards a more agile and adaptive strategy that leverages industry-leading practices. We agree that systems could be better integrated, and data can be aggregated to provide the department greater visibility in the end-to-end customer journey. When possible, data is being integrated, APIs are being created, and data structured to allow visibility across diverse technology is being developed.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	While we are working to integrate systems to provide greater transparency and a better end-to-end system for permit customers, the City is wary of the potential drawbacks of a single system given the associated costs while the City is facing financial hardship.
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.1 [for F8]	By December 31, 2023, OSB, in consultation with OEWD and other departments responsible for small business assistance programs, with the participation of the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce and neighborhood merchants' associations, should schedule a public Small Business Summit, to be held on at least an annual basis, to promote small business assistance programs and to address obstacles faced by small businesses, and produce a public Summit report listing action items.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	The Office of Small Business understands, based on experience and feedback received, that small business owners prefer direct outreach, given challenges they have with attending meetings. The Office of Small Business regularly and proactively conducts merchant walks to share small business resources and gather feedback on obstacles faced by small businesses. Office of Small Business staff also regularly participate in meetings and events with merchant associations, the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce, and other organizations to promote the City's small business assistance programs. The feedback gathered inform the work and priorities of the Office of Small Business. Additionally, the Small Business Commission, in collaboration with San Francisco State University, has conducted several in-depth surveys to better understand the needs of small businesses. These survey results, along with surveys conducted by community-based organizations that collaborate with the City, provide useful data points to guide the work of the Office of Small Business. The qualitative and quantitative data gathered from these surveys provide the City with the same type of information as would be generated from a Summit report.	Recommendation Implemented	FY2023-24, the Office of Small Business participated in 134 merchant walks and outreach events to meet business owners, assist with business challenges, and share small business resources.
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.1 [for F8]	By December 31, 2023, OSB, in consultation with OEWD and other departments responsible for small business assistance programs, with the participation of the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce and neighborhood merchants' associations, should schedule a public Small Business Summit, to be held on at least an annual basis, to promote small business assistance programs and to address obstacles faced by small businesses, and produce a public Summit report listing action items.	Office of Small Business [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The Office of Small Business understands, based on experience and feedback received, that small business owners prefer direct outreach, given challenges they have with attending meetings. The Office of Small Business regularly and proactively conducts merchant walks to share small business resources and gather feedback on obstacles faced by small businesses. Office of Small Business staff also regularly participate in meetings and events with merchant associations, the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce, and other organizations to promote the City's small business assistance programs. The feedback gathered inform the work and priorities of the Office of Small Business. Additionally, the Small Business Commission, in collaboration with San Francisco State University, has conducted several in-depth surveys to better understand the needs of small businesses. These survey results, along with surveys conducted by community-based organizations that collaborate with the City, provide useful data points to guide the work of the Office of Small Business. The qualitative and quantitative data gathered from these surveys provide the City with the same type of information as would be generated from a Summit report.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.1 [for F8]	By December 31, 2023, OSB, in consultation with OEWD and other departments responsible for small business assistance programs, with the participation of the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce and neighborhood merchants' associations, should schedule a public Small Business Summit, to be held on at least an annual basis, to promote small business assistance programs and to address obstacles faced by small businesses, and produce a public Summit report listing action items.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The Office of Small Business understands, based on experience and feedback received, that small business owners prefer direct outreach, given challenges they have with attending meetings. The Office of Small Business regularly and proactively conducts merchant walks to share small business resources and gather feedback on obstacles faced by small businesses. Office of Small Business staff also regularly participate in meetings and events with merchant associations, the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce, and other organizations to promote the City's small business assistance programs. The feedback gathered inform the work and priorities of the Office of Small Business. Additionally, the Small Business Commission, in collaboration with San Francisco State University, has conducted several in-depth surveys to better understand the needs of small businesses. These survey results, along with surveys conducted by community-based organizations that collaborate with the City, provide useful data points to guide the work of the Office of Small Business. The qualitative and quantitative data gathered from these surveys provide the City with the same type of information as would be generated from a Summit report.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.2 [for F8]	By December 31, 2023, OSB should prepare a user-friendly guide for small businesses in paper and electronic format describing First Year Free and streamlined permit processing under Proposition H, including instructions regarding how to access these benefits and how to use the Online Portal. OSB should distribute this guide online, at the Permit Center and to San Francisco merchants' associations.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Office of Small Business has already created information available online regarding the First Year Program and Proposition H online. Additionally, businesses are first alerted upon business registration through the Treasurer and Tax Collector's Office. The Office of Small Business shares information about these programs regularly with businesses and merchants associations through in-person visits, meetings, and the office newsletter. These resources are usually shared electronically and are available in the City's threshold languages, and they can easily be printed.	**	

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title (Publication Date)	Recommendation Number (for Finding Number)	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text (provided by Civil Grand Jury)	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.2 [for F8]	By December 31, 2023, OSB should prepare a user-friendly guide for small businesses in paper and electronic format describing First Year Free and streamlined permit processing under Proposition H, including instructions regarding how to access these benefits and how to use the Online Portal. OSB should distribute this guide online, at the Permit Center and to San Francisco merchants' associations.	Office of Small Business [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	The Office of Small Business has already created information available online regarding the First Year Program and Proposition H online. Additionally, businesses are first alerted upon business registration through the Treasurer and Tax Collector's Office. The Office of Small Business shares information about these programs regularly with businesses and merchants associations through in-person visits, meetings, and the office newsletter. These resources are usually shared electronically and are available in the City's threshold languages, and they can easily be printed.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.3 [for F8]	By February 1, 2024, OSB should develop and regularly update a public dashboard or scorecard that demonstrates the impact of San Francisco's small business assistance programs.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	Currently, the Office of Small Business makes publicly available its annual report, which provides information about the impact of San Francisco's small business assistance programs. Additional data beyond what is shared in the annual report, and which is available, can be found through the City's DataSF portal. If a public dashboard or scorecard on the permitting process is requested, this would require significant investment in technology/systems changes of each of the permitting agencies.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.3 [for F8]	By February 1, 2024, OSB should develop and regularly update a public dashboard or scorecard that demonstrates the impact of San Francisco's small business assistance programs.	Office of Small Business [August 20, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	Currently, the Office of Small Business makes publicly available its annual report, which provides information about the impact of San Francisco's small business assistance programs. Additional data beyond what is shared in the annual report, and which is available, can be found through the City's DataSF portal. If a public dashboard or scorecard on the permitting process is requested, this would require significant investment in technology/systems changes of each of the permitting agencies.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.4 [for F8]	By November 30, 2023, OEWD should commit to report at Small Business Commission meetings at least once a year regarding developments, practices, trends, initiatives, investments and potential or proposed policies or legislation affecting San Francisco's small businesses.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	OEWD leadership already does report at Small Business Commission meetings on a regular basis to provide these types of updates and help answer questions.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.4 [for F8]	By November 30, 2023, OEWD should commit to report at Small Business Commission meetings at least once a year regarding developments, practices, trends, initiatives, investments and potential or proposed policies or legislation affecting San Francisco's small businesses.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 20, 2023]	Has been implemented	OEWD leadership already does report at Small Business Commission meetings on a regular basis to provide these types of updates and help answer questions.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R8.5 [for F8]	By December 31, 2023, each member of the Board of Supervisors should conduct meetings on at least a quarterly basis with small businesses and merchants' associations within his or her district, to address issues impacting small business formation and operation and potential solutions, and to disseminate information (with appropriate contact information for City personnel) regarding small business assistance programs such as First Year Free, Proposition H, and any materials developed in response to R8.2 and R8.3 above. Each Supervisor should include a summary report of each such meeting in any publication or newsletter issued by his or her office and provide a copy to OSB.	Board of Supervisors [September 19, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	Will not be implemented because it is not reasonable since each Supervisorial district is unique and contains different institutions, non-profits, merchant associations, and community stakeholders, and that most offices already hold these meetings regularly.	**	
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R9 [for F9]	By January 31, 2024, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors, in consultation with OSB, should approve funding sufficient to develop and launch a sophisticated marketing campaign to promote San Francisco as a welcoming and supportive environment for new small businesses to open, and to encourage support for existing small businesses, with reference as appropriate to programs such as First Year Free and Proposition H.	Office of the Mayor [August 20, 2023]	Requires further analysis	With limited resources, City funding should prioritize programs that significantly benefit small business owners, rather than marketing alone. For example, an investment in funding to extend indefinitely the City's First Year Free program would serve both purposes of helping small business entrepreneurs while marketing to the small business community that San Francisco is a welcoming and supportive environment for new or expanding small businesses. Another example would be to invest funding in technology/systems improvements, which would create efficiencies in the permitting process while offering small businesses a supportive environment throughout their permitting journey. Currently, the Office of Small Business has used existing resources to market and promote San Francisco as a welcoming and supportive environment for small businesses, having launched the ShopDineSF campaign online and through social media (sf.gov/ShopDineSF) and collaborated with SFGovTV on promotional videos featuring local small businesses that have felt supported by the City. These efforts are ongoing.	Requires further analysis	Currently, the Office of Small Business uses existing resources to market and promote San Francisco as a welcoming and supportive environment for small businesses, having launched the ShopDineSF campaign online, through social media (sf.gov/ShopDineSF), and collaborated with SFGovTV on promotional videos featuring local small businesses that have felt supported by the City. In 2024, marketing campaigns and events included a Legacy Business Passport program to encourage residents and visitors to explore San Francisco Legacy Businesses, partnering with SFMTA to display summer campaign advertisements on the interior and exterior of Muni, and hosting two small business popup events, featuring 40-50 vendors and attracting nearly 500 attendees. These efforts are ongoing. Rather than focusing on marketing alone, additional resources should prioritize programs with significant benefits to small businesses. Examples include extending the City's First Year Free program or investing funds in technology/systems improvements, which would create efficiencies in the permitting process while offering small businesses a supportive environment throughout their permitting journey.
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R9 [for F9]	By January 31, 2024, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors, in consultation with OSB, should approve funding sufficient to develop and launch a sophisticated marketing campaign to promote San Francisco as a welcoming and supportive environment for new small businesses to open, and to encourage support for existing small businesses, with reference as appropriate to programs such as First Year Free and Proposition H.	Board of Supervisors [September 19, 2023]	Has been implemented	Has been implemented with existing resources dedicated to marketing and promoting the City's supportive environment for small businesses through the ShopDineSF campaign and raising awareness through information videos and handouts of Proposition H's as well as First-Year-Free's provisions to small business applicants at the permit center and online.	**	

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R9 [for F9]	By January 31, 2024, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors, in consultation with OSB, should approve funding sufficient to develop and launch a sophisticated marketing campaign to promote San Francisco as a welcoming and supportive environment for new small businesses to open, and to encourage support for existing small businesses, with reference as appropriate to programs such as First Year Free and Proposition H.	Office of Small Business [August 20, 2023]	Requires further analysis	With limited resources, City funding should prioritize programs that significantly benefit small business owners, rather than marketing alone. For example, an investment in funding to extend indefinitely the City's First Year Free program would serve both purposes of helping small business entrepreneurs while marketing to the small business community that San Francisco is a welcoming and supportive environment for new or expanding small businesses. Another example would be to invest funding in technology/systems improvements, which would create efficiencies in the permitting process while offering small businesses a supportive environment throughout their permitting journey. Currently, the Office of Small Business has used existing resources to market and promote San Francisco as a welcoming and supportive environment for small businesses, having launched the ShopDineSF campaign online and through social media (sf.gov/ShopDineSF) and collaborated with SFGovTV on promotional videos featuring local small businesses that have felt supported by the City. These efforts are ongoing.	Requires further analysis	Currently, the Office of Small Business uses existing resources to market and promote San Francisco as a welcoming and supportive environment for small businesses, having launched the ShopDineSF campaign online, through social media (sf.gov/ShopDineSF), and collaborated with SFGovTV on promotional videos featuring local small businesses that have felt supported by the City. In 2024, marketing campaigns and events included a Legacy Business Passport program to encourage residents and visitors to explore San Francisco Legacy Businesses, partnering with SFMTA to display summer campaign advertisements on the interior and exterior of Muni, and hosting two small business popup events, featuring 40-50 vendors and attracting nearly 500 attendees. These efforts are ongoing. Rather than focusing on marketing alone, additional resources should prioritize programs with significant benefits to small businesses. Examples include extending the City's First Year Free program or investing funds in technology/systems improvements, which would create efficiencies in the permitting process while offering small businesses a supportive environment throughout their permitting journey.
2022-23	Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses [June 21, 2023]	R9 [for F9]	By January 31, 2024, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors, in consultation with OSB, should approve funding sufficient to develop and launch a sophisticated marketing campaign to promote San Francisco as a welcoming and supportive environment for new small businesses to open, and to encourage support for existing small businesses, with reference as appropriate to programs such as First Year Free and Proposition H.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 20, 2023]	Requires further analysis	With limited resources, City funding should prioritize programs that significantly benefit small business owners, rather than marketing alone. For example, an investment in funding to extend indefinitely the City's First Year Free program would serve both purposes of helping small business entrepreneurs while marketing to the small business community that San Francisco is a welcoming and supportive environment for new or expanding small businesses. Another example would be to invest funding in technology/systems improvements, which would create efficiencies in the permitting process while offering small businesses a supportive environment throughout their permitting journey. Currently, the Office of Small Business has used existing resources to market and promote San Francisco as a welcoming and supportive environment for small businesses, having launched the ShopDineSF campaign online and through social media (sf.gov/ShopDineSF) and collaborated with SFGovTV on promotional videos featuring local small businesses that have felt supported by the City. These efforts are ongoing.	Will Not Be Implemented: Not Warranted or Not Reasonable	As limited resources continue, a City-led marketing campaign on top of work already underway by OSB is likely less effective, and therefore a lower priority, than more cost-effective tactics already underway such as: continuation of the City's First Year Free program, expansion of the City's small business exemption threshold under recently adopted tax reform, permitting improvements including the installation of new permit staff to focus on commercial permits, and ongoing grants to support the opening of new small businesses.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R1 [for F1]	Prior to the start of the 2024–2025 school year, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to prepare an annual public report on SFUSD's efforts to recruit and retain credentialed teachers.	Superintendent of Schools [August 14, 2023]		My office will regularly update the Board of Education regarding the recruitment and retention of credentialed teachers. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	SFUSD Human Resources provided a status update on these items to the Board of Education in September 2024. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R1 [for F1]	Prior to the start of the 2024–2025 school year, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to prepare an annual public report on SFUSD's efforts to recruit and retain credentialed teachers.	Board of Education [September 13, 2023]		The Board has directed the Superintendent to provide annual public reports on SFUSD's efforts to recruit and retain credentialed teachers by the end of the 2023-2024 school year.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R2.1 [for F2]	Prior to the start of the 2024–2025 school year, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to prepare an annual public report on SFUSD's credentialed teacher salaries relative to United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) Income Limits.	Superintendent of Schools [August 14, 2023]		My office will regularly update the Board of Education regarding the salaries of credentialed teachers. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	SFUSD Human Resources will abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education on this item. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R2.1 [for F2]	Prior to the start of the 2024–2025 school year, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to prepare an annual public report on SFUSD's credentialed teacher salaries relative to United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) Income Limits.	Board of Education [September 13, 2023]		The Board has directed the Superintendent to provide annual public reports on SFUSD's credentialed teacher salaries relative to United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) Income Limits by the end of the 2023-2024 school year.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R2.2 [for F2]	Prior to the start of the 2024–2025 school year, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to prepare an annual public report on SFUSD's credentialed teacher salaries relative to those of other school districts in the San Francisco Bay Area.	Superintendent of Schools [August 14, 2023]		My office will regularly update the public regarding the salaries of credentialed teachers. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	In Fall 2023, SFUSD and our labor partners agreed to historic raises for educators. We have provided regular updates to the public on these raises and current salaries for credentialed staff. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R2.2 [for F2]	Prior to the start of the 2024–2025 school year, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to prepare an annual public report on SFUSD's credentialed teacher salaries relative to those of other school districts in the San Francisco Bay Area.	Board of Education [September 13, 2023]		The Board has directed the Superintendent to provide annual public reports on SFUSD's credentialed teacher salaries relative to those of other school districts in the San Francisco Bay Area by the end of the 2023-2024 school year.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By December 30, 2023, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to expand its promotion of SFUSD's pension and benefits programs and San Francisco's teacher housing subsidies in its recruiting materials.	Superintendent of Schools [August 14, 2023]		My office will promote the benefits of becoming a credentialed teacher in SFUSD. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	SFUSD regularly promotes benefits of becoming a credentialed teacher, such as by sharing information on Shirley Chisholm Village affordable housing opportunities for educators. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R3 [for F3]	By December 30, 2023, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to expand its promotion of SFUSD's pension and benefits programs and San Francisco's teacher housing subsidies in its recruiting materials.	Board of Education [September 13, 2023]		The Board has directed the Superintendent to expand its promotion of SFUSD's pension and benefits programs and San Francisco's teacher housing subsidies in its recruiting materials by the end of the 2023-2024 school year.	**	

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R4.1 [for F4]	By September 30, 2023, the Mayor should request that the San Francisco Controller's Office prepare a public report that performs a root-cause analysis of the San Francisco Unified School District's purchase and implementation of EMPowerSF.	Office of the Mayor [August 14, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The San Francisco Controller's Office has provided ongoing assistance to SFUSD over the past number of months to support them in resolving their payroll issues. Specifically, the San Francisco Controller's Office of Payroll and Systems Divisions offered and provided functional and technical experts to assist SFUSD with problem triage and prioritization considerations. However, the San Francisco Controller's Office is at capacity and will not be able to provide a root-cause analysis as described above. If a recommendation of the Civil Grand Jury is that a root-cause analysis of SFUSD's purchase and implementation of their EMPowerSF payroll system should be performed, we believe that this should be administered by the California State Controller's Office, or most appropriate state entity, not by the San Francisco Controller's Office.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R4.1 [for F4]	By September 30, 2023, the Mayor should request that the San Francisco Controller's Office prepare a public report that performs a root-cause analysis of the San Francisco Unified School District's purchase and implementation of EMPowerSF.	Superintendent of Schools [August 14, 2023]		To the extent I am asked, I will continue to work collaboratively with the Mayor and her team. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	To the extent I am asked, I will continue to work collaboratively with the Mayor and her team. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R4.1 [for F4]	By September 30, 2023, the Mayor should request that the San Francisco Controller's Office prepare a public report that performs a root-cause analysis of the San Francisco Unified School District's purchase and implementation of EMPowerSF.	Board of Education [September 13, 2023]		To the extent the District is asked, the Board will ask the Superintendent to work collaboratively with the Mayor and her team.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R4.1 [for F4]	By September 30, 2023, the Mayor should request that the San Francisco Controller's Office prepare a public report that performs a root-cause analysis of the San Francisco Unified School District's purchase and implementation of EMPowerSF.	Office of the Controller [August 14, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	While we believe that a post-stabilization review of the SFUSD's implementation of a new payroll system is warranted, we do not believe that our office has the jurisdiction, capacity, or technical knowledge of SAP payroll systems to provide the recommended analysis. However, it is also helpful to note that the Controller's Office — in an effort to assist the SFUSD with their payroll stabilization efforts — has provided senior leadership-level participation on the SFUSD's Corrective Action Plan Governance Steering Committee, along with functional payroll procedures guidance and other assistance. A new systems implementation assessment, of the sort recommended by the Civil Grand Jury, we believe is better provided by an SAP-experienced Independent Verification and Validation consultant, conducted at the direction of the SFUSD's governing board or superintendent.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R4.2 [for F4]	By September 30, 2023, the Mayor should request that the San Francisco Controller's Office prepare a public report that performs a root-cause analysis of the San Francisco Unified School District's failure to correctly report staff tax withholdings to the California Franchise Tax Board.	Office of the Mayor [August 14, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The San Francisco Controller's Office has provided ongoing assistance to SFUSD over the past number of months to support them in resolving their payroll issues. Specifically, the San Francisco Controller's Office of Payroll and Systems Divisions offered and provided functional and technical experts to assist SFUSD with problem triage and prioritization considerations. However, the San Francisco Controller's Office is at capacity and will not be able to provide a root-cause analysis as described above. If a recommendation of the Civil Grand Jury is that a root-cause analysis of SFUSD's failure to correctly report staff tax withholdings to the California Franchise Tax Board should be performed, we believe that this should be administered by the California State Controller's Office, or most appropriate state entity, not by the San Francisco Controller's Office City entity.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R4.2 [for F4]	By September 30, 2023, the Mayor should request that the San Francisco Controller's Office prepare a public report that performs a root-cause analysis of the San Francisco Unified School District's failure to correctly report staff tax withholdings to the California Franchise Tax Board.	Superintendent of Schools [August 14, 2023]		To the extent I am asked, I will continue to work collaboratively with the Mayor and her team. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	To the extent I am asked, I will continue to work collaboratively with the Mayor and her team. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R4.2 [for F4]	By September 30, 2023, the Mayor should request that the San Francisco Controller's Office prepare a public report that performs a root-cause analysis of the San Francisco Unified School District's failure to correctly report staff tax withholdings to the California Franchise Tax Board.	Board of Education [September 13, 2023]		To the extent the District is asked, the Board will ask the Superintendent to work collaboratively with the Mayor and her team.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R4.2 [for F4]	By September 30, 2023, the Mayor should request that the San Francisco Controller's Office prepare a public report that performs a root-cause analysis of the San Francisco Unified School District's failure to correctly report staff tax withholdings to the California Franchise Tax Board.	Office of the Controller [August 14, 2023]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	While we believe that a post-stabilization review of the SFUSD's implementation of a new payroll system is warranted, we do not believe that our office has the jurisdiction, capacity, or technical knowledge of SAP payroll systems to provide the recommended analysis. However, it is also helpful to note that the Controller's Office — in an effort to assist the SFUSD with their payroll stabilization efforts — has provided senior leadership-level participation on the SFUSD's Corrective Action Plan Governance Steering Committee, along with functional payroll procedures guidance and other assistance. A new systems implementation assessment, of the sort recommended by the Civil Grand Jury, we believe is better provided by an SAP-experienced Independent Verification and Validation consultant, conducted at the direction of the SFUSD's governing board or superintendent.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R5.1 [for F5]	By December 30, 2023, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to incorporate the appropriate training, protocols, and software tooling to record the reasons credentialed teachers do not accept job offers in SFUSD, and prepare an annual summary report analyzing these factors.	Superintendent of Schools [August 14, 2023]		My office will endeavor to collect information as to why credentialed teachers turn down employment with SFUSD, and update the Board as to those findings. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	My office will endeavor to collect information as to why credentialed teachers turn down employment with SFUSD, and update the Board as to those findings. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R5.1 [for F5]	By December 30, 2023, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to incorporate the appropriate training, protocols, and software tooling to record the reasons credentialed teachers do not accept job offers in SFUSD, and prepare an annual summary report analyzing these factors.	Board of Education [September 13, 2023]		The Board has directed the Superintendent to incorporate the appropriate training, protocols, and software tooling to record the reasons credentialed teachers do not accept job offers in SFUSD, and prepare an annual summary report analyzing these factors by the end of the 2023-2024 school year.	**	

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.

Status of the Recommendations
by the Civil Grand Jury
2022-23

CGJ Year	Report Title [Publication Date]	Recommendation Number [for Finding Number]	Recommendation	Response Required	Original 2023 Response	Original 2023 Response Text <i>(provided by Civil Grand Jury)</i>	2024 Response ⁽¹⁾	2024 Response Text
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R5.2 [for F5]	By December 30, 2023, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to incorporate the appropriate training, protocols, and software tooling to record the reasons credentialed teachers leave SFUSD—for example, exit interviews—and prepare an annual summary report analyzing these factors.	Superintendent of Schools [August 14, 2023]		My office will endeavor to collect information as to why credentialed teachers leave SFUSD, and update the Board as to those findings. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	Human Resources has launched a process as of May 2024 to collect exit interviews from employees who depart from SFUSD. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R5.2 [for F5]	By December 30, 2023, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to incorporate the appropriate training, protocols, and software tooling to record the reasons credentialed teachers leave SFUSD—for example, exit interviews—and prepare an annual summary report analyzing these factors.	Board of Education [September 13, 2023]		The Board has directed the Superintendent to incorporate the appropriate training, protocols, and software tooling to record the reasons credentialed teachers leave SFUSD—for example, exit interviews—and prepare an annual summary report analyzing these factors by the end of the 2023-2024 school year.	**	
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R6 [for F6]	By December 30, 2023, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to direct all SFUSD employees to cooperate with Civil Grand Jury investigations.	Superintendent of Schools [August 14, 2023]		My office will inform staff to follow all laws, which includes those compelling cooperation with the Civil Grand Jury. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.	Will Be Implemented in the Future	My office will inform staff to follow all laws, which includes those compelling cooperation with the Civil Grand Jury. I will also abide by any instruction given by the Board of Education.
2022-23	Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers [June 15, 2023]	R6 [for F6]	By December 30, 2023, the San Francisco Board of Education should direct the Superintendent of schools to direct all SFUSD employees to cooperate with Civil Grand Jury investigations.	Board of Education [September 13, 2023]		The Board has instructed the Superintendent to direct all SFUSD employees to cooperate with Civil Grand Jury investigations by the end of the 2023-2024 school year.	**	

(1) **** Response not required: Recommendation has been fully implemented or abandoned.