



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
August 19, 2024**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id # 2660 545 3381. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2660 545 3381  
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**KATE FAVETTI  
President**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON  
Vice President**

**F.X. CROWLEY  
VITUS LEUNG**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**SANDRA ENG  
Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meetings use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code # 2660 545 3381.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Kate Favetti	Present
Vice President Elizabeth Salveson	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Excused absence
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor	Present

President Kate Favetti presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)**

Matt Ramirez read by Lavena Holmes, Civil Service Commission:

Dear Civil Service Commission of San Francisco,

I am writing to request the opportunity to offer public comment at an upcoming meeting regarding the hiring practices within the San Francisco government. My concerns echo those outlined in the article by St. John Barned-Smith, which highlights significant inefficiencies and inequities in the current hiring processes.

One of the key issues I would like to address is the requirement for civil service exams, particularly for individuals who have completed or are in the process of completing a Bachelor's or Associate's degree. These exams are not only taxing on applicants' time—an already scarce resource for job seekers—but they also slow down the hiring pipeline. This unnecessary hurdle seems particularly redundant for candidates who have already demonstrated their qualifications through higher education.

Additionally, I have observed a concerning pattern where recruiters do not thoroughly review applications and instead engage in prolonged back-and-forth communication with applicants. This inefficiency not only delays the hiring process but also discourages qualified candidates from pursuing opportunities within the city government.

I have several specific requests that I would like to propose to the Commission:

1. **Waive Civil Service Exams Entirely OR for Degree Holders:** I propose that individuals who have completed or are in the process of completing a Bachelor's or Associate's degree should be exempt from taking civil service exams. This would help expedite the hiring process and allow the city to tap into a pool of well-qualified candidates more efficiently.
2. **Improve Recruiter Qualifications and Efficiency:** I recommend hiring more qualified recruiters who can effectively identify top talent and streamline the hiring process. An audit of current recruiters' workloads and efficiency within the city should also be conducted to ensure that they are equipped to handle their responsibilities effectively. They need help!

3. **Audit and Streamline Hiring Practices:** I urge the Commission to conduct a thorough audit of the current hiring practices, with a focus on identifying and eliminating any inefficiencies that contribute to the prolonged time-to-hire for city positions. I encourage the commission to take one of these tests and imagine sacrificing 4 hours of a workday--a shift--to do one. I believe these changes are essential to creating a more efficient, equitable, and competitive hiring process within the San Francisco government. I appreciate the Commission's attention to these matters and look forward to the opportunity to share my thoughts in greater detail. Thank you for considering my request.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of August 5, 2024 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

None.

Items severed from the Ratification Agenda: PSC #4149 from the Department of Emergency Management and PSC #4143 from the Municipal Transportation Agency.

Items severed from the Consent Agenda: Item #9 Report of Future Employment Restrictions; Item #10 Report on PBT; and Item #15 Annual Report on Certification of Eligibles.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources, reported about the seven (7) reports scheduled on today's agenda; there is an eight (8) report "Promotive Only Exams" which there is nothing to report this period.

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT**

**0166-24-1 Merit System Audit Report FY 2023 – 2024. (Item No. 6)**

**Speakers:** Luz Morganti, Civil Service Commission

**Action:** Accepted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0168-24-1 Civil Service Commission FY 2023 – 2024 Year End Report. (Item No. 7)**

**Speakers:** Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission

**Action:** Accepted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0158-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts.  
(Item No. 8)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004138 v 0.01	Department of Emergency Management	\$800,000	DEM needs support to install, integrate, configure and test the new network and server equipment with the new CAD software/system. The PSC will provide 3rd party oversight, consulting, equipment expertise to help review configurations, advise on networking and cyber security protocols and deployment.	New	28 months
DHRPSC 0004149 v 0.01	Department of Emergency Management	\$9,000,000	In 2023, DEM, in partnership with Urban Alchemy, the organization selected through a competitive bid process, launched a pilot year of what is called the Homeless Engagement Assistance Response Team (HEART). The pilot year was extremely successful with UA/HEART responding to almost triple the volume of calls anticipated by DEM. HEART has quickly become fully integrated into SF's Department of Emergency Communication's work flow and the SF Coordinated Street Response Program (the network of all street response teams). Unique from other street response services, HEART provides "rapid response" to third party calls from the public related to concerns with the needs of people experiencing homelessness. The public submits requests through the non-emergency number and 311, requests for HEART to engage with small encampments, and people experiencing homelessness. HEART assesses for ADA compliance, assesses needs, brokers services, transports and closely coordinates with other street teams. Prior to HEART there was no, non-law-enforcement team dedicated to these calls from the public and calls could sit for long periods of time as law enforcement responded to an array of other calls involving crimes and violence. To continue to meet the services demands of the city, DEM seeks to expand the funding authority of this contract and (contingent on RFP limits) and the duration timeline as detailed above.	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0004143 v 0.01	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$30,000,000	The Train Control Upgrade Project (TCUP) is a capital project that will procure a new Communications Based Train Control (CBTC) system to replace the aging train control signal system currently installed in the Market Street Subway and expand CBTC to the surface. It will provide operations and service planning staff with the tools necessary to deliver reliable, speedy, high-frequency rail transit to, from, and within downtown San Francisco. When installed, the new CBTC system will cover the entire Muni Metro railway. The CBTC system needs to be designed and engineered to meet SFMTA's requirements and ensure safety, reliability, availability, and maintainability. After preliminary design, train control components will be installed along the Muni Metro trackway and fitted to the LRV4 light rail vehicles in a geographically phased approach. Each phase will feature detailed design and construction, with project completion expected in FY35. This contract will select a professional services consultant to provide technical assistance to the SFMTA for the duration of the project, and this contract will be extended through FY35 to support warranty. Technical consulting services are needed to support the procurement, design, engineering, contract administration, integration, construction management, deployment, and acceptance of a new CBTC system, through each planned phase. These services must be provided by a qualified professional services consultant with experience supporting public transit agencies in the procurement and delivery of specialized CBTC systems to public transit agencies.	New	120 months
DHRPSC 0004135 v 0.01	Port	\$1,000,000	This contract includes the project management and specialized engineering services for the construction of a specialized crane barge.	New	28 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004137 v 0.01	Public Utilities Commission	\$10,000,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) intends to award a \$150 million (\$10 million design, \$140 million construction) Design-Build (DB) Agreement to support the SFPUC's Biogas Project. The Project shall assist in the execution and delivery of SFPUC's new Biogas Utilization Project at the Southeast Treatment Plant. The scope of work consists of designing, and constructing the biogas utilization facilities at the SEP, including but not limited to, the gas cleaning and separation, product gas compressors, de-ox system (if needed to meet quality) and the thermal oxidizer (abatement device to treat the tail gas that is generated in the upgrading system before its release to the atmosphere). The facilities will be designed and constructed to take raw biogas from SEP new digesters, cleaning and upgrading it to natural gas quality, compressing and injecting the product gas into an existing PG&E natural gas pipeline (in compliance with gas rules 21 and 29, established by the CPUC). The work includes meeting or exceeding the Bay Area Quality Management District (BAAQMD) air permit requirements, and the Inflation Reduction Act (IRA) requirements, including the compliance schedule. All these elements of the work are of responsibility of one entity, the Design-Builder, and are critical for the long-term success of the project.	New	49 months
DHRPSC 0004141 v 0.01	Recreation and Park	\$1,600,000	This project is for specialty design and engineering for renovation and seismically upgrading the existing two-story Kezar Pavilion, which includes a gymnasium and an adjoining annex building that houses Park staff. The newly renovated building will be three stories, and include a recreation center with multi-purpose rooms, a new annex building and a new outdoor plaza space.	New	120 months
DHRPSC 0004136 v 0.01	Technology	\$5,000,000	Cloud Support Services is an offering that includes a comprehensive set of technical services to assist the city with any issues arising from the use of cloud computing platforms. These services encompass prioritized 24x7 problem resolution for issues encountered in the City's daily use of these products. The support team will provide root-cause analysis, technical support, and escalation management (if needed) for all reported incidents and will oversee cases until they are completely resolved. These services are provided remotely and include both phone and web-based technical support in the form of advice and guidance, as well as troubleshooting specific problems, error messages, or functionality issues. The Cloud Support Services also include service delivery management, where inquiries from City departments regarding product access, functionality, and available security upgrades will be addressed. This service will aid the city in optimizing the full capabilities of the cloud platform. The procurement of these services will be on an as-needed basis and will be available under both a Citywide Enterprise Agreement and department-specific term contracts. The support services will provide the City with technical account managers and engineers who will assist City staff in implementing cloud solutions and will work to maximize the efficiency and deployment of the cloud platform. These services require expertise and knowledge of proprietary cloud products that City staff do not possess. City employees do not have enterprise-level deployment rights, access from an architectural level, or access to source code, which are necessary to perform these functions. Additionally, there will be provisions similar to a managed program, offering the City guidance and resources for optimizing cloud usage, including cost management and architectural best practices. This program aims to ensure that the City can effectively leverage the full range of services available on the cloud platform.	New	48 months

**0158-24-8 Continued**

**Speakers:** Lauren Bell and Thomas Chen, Department of Emergency Management spoke on PSC #DHRPSC0004138 v 0.01  
David Garcia and Dan Howard, Municipal Transportation Agency spoke on PSC #DHRPSC0004143 v 0.01

**Action:**

1. Approve PSC #DHRPSC0004138 v 0.01 with the condition that the department's agreed to work with Executive Officer Eng to update this PSC from a new PSC to a modification (original PSC #46164-21/22). Modify the scope of work, add classifications that are represented, increase the amount from \$3M to \$9M, and increase the duration from 36 months to an additional 60 months. (Vote of 4 to 0)
2. Approved PSC #DHRPSC0004143 v 0.01. (Vote of 4 to 0)
3. Adopted the report. Approved the requests for the remaining proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0165-24-1 Report of Future Employment Restrictions and Probationary Releases for the period of January 1, 2024 to June 30, 2024. (Item No. 9)**

**Speakers:** Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0161-24-1 Report on Position-Based Testing. (Item No. 10)**

**Speakers:** John Kraus, Department of Human Resources  
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0160-24-1 Report on Provisional Appointments. (Item No. 11)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0163-24-1 Report of Proportion of Appointments Exempt Under Charter Sections 10.104-1, 2, and 4 through 12. (Item No. 12)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0162-24-1 Report of Expired Exempt Appointments under Charter Sections 10.104-16 through 10.104-18 for the period of January 1, 2024 to June 30, 2024. (Item No. 13)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0164-24-1 Report of Exempt Appointments and Position Requests under Charter Sections 10.104- 16 through 10.104-18 for the period of January 1, 2024 to June 30, 2024. (Item No. 14)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0159-24-1 Annual Report on Certification of Eligibles – Entry and Promotion – Uniformed Ranks of Fire, Police, and Sheriff. (Item No. 15)**

**Speakers:** Jen Lo, Department of Human Resources  
Dan Kaplan, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0167-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Personal Services Contract Number DHRPSC0004105 v 0.01 from the Airport. (Item No. 16)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004105 v 0.01	Airport	\$750,000	Contractor shall provide veterinary care services for working canines of the San Francisco Police Department Airport Bureau K-9 Unit at San Francisco International Airport (Airport). Services include examinations, disease prevention programs, diet and weight management services, medications, and treatment as necessary to various conditions and illnesses. 24/7 emergency and specialty care include oncology treatment, cardiology, ophthalmology, and neurology services may also be required.	New	60 months

**August 5, 2024:** Continued to the meeting of August 19, 2024.

**Speakers:** Sung Kim, Airport

**Action:** Adopted the report. Approve the request for proposed Personal Services Contract Number DHRPSC0004105 v 0.01; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 3 to 0; Commissioner Minor stepped away during this item)

**0075-24-3 Appeal by Daymian Turner of the denial of Battery Pay as with the Municipal Transportation Agency. (Item No. 17)**

**Speakers:** Iffy Omokaro, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Daymian Turner, Appellant

**Action:** Upheld the department’s decision and denied Daymian Turner’s request for battery pay in compliance with City policy. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0002-24-6 Appeal by Tatyana Orozco of Human Resources Director’s finding that investigation did not substantiate Orozco’s allegations of harassment, discrimination, and retaliation. (Item No. 18)**

**Speakers:** Lana Yang, Department of Human Resources  
Tatyana Orozco, Appellant  
Dan Hoffer, Department of Public Health

**Action:** Adopted the report, upheld the decision of the Human Resources Director and denied the appeal by Tatyana Orozco. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS’ ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 19)**

None.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 20)**

6:05 p.m.