



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO


CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REPORT TRANSMITTAL (FORM 22)

Refer to Civil Service Commission Procedure for Staff - Submission of
Written Reports for Instructions on Completing and Processing this Form

1. Civil Service Commission Register Number: n/a
2. For Civil Service Commission Meeting of: August 19, 2024
3. Check One: Ratification Agenda
 Consent Agenda
 Regular Agenda
 Human Resources Director's Report
4. Subject: Report on Position-Based Testing
5. Recommendation: Adopt the Report.
6. Report prepared by: John Kraus
7. Notifications: **(Attach a list of the person(s) to be notified in the format described in**

IV. Commission Report Format -A).

8. Reviewed and approved for Civil Service Commission Agenda:

Human Resources Director: 
Date: 08.06.24
9. Submit the original time-stamped copy of this form and person(s) to be notified
(see Item 7 above) along with the required copies of the report to:

**Executive Officer
Civil Service Commission
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720
San Francisco, CA 94102**

10. Receipt-stamp this form in the ACSC RECEIPT STAMP box to the right using the time-stamp in the CSC Office.

Attachment

CSC RECEIPT STAMP

Notifications

Carol Isen, Human Resources Director
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Carol.isen@sfgov.org

Kate Howard
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Kate.howard@sfgov.org

Anna Biasbas
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Anna.biasbas@sfgov.org

Mawuli Tugbenyoh
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Mawuli.tugbenyoh@sfgov.org

Dave Johnson
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103-5413
Dave.johnson@sfgov.org

John Kraus
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
John.C.Kraus@sfgov.org

Jennifer Wynn Landgren
Department of Human Resources
1 S Van Ness Ave., 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Jennifer.Landgren@sfgov.org



DATE: August 8, 2024

TO: Honorable Civil Service Commission

THROUGH: Carol Isen
Human Resources Director

FROM: John Kraus
Exams Manager, Miscellaneous

Anna Biasbas
Director, Employment Services

SUBJECT: **Report on the Position-Based Testing Program**

Executive Summary

This annual report is to update the Civil Service Commission (CSC) on the Position-Based Testing (PBT) Program from July 1, 2023, through June 30, 2024.

Background

The CSC adopted Rule 111A on PBTs on February 6, 2006. Hiring departments or agencies are permitted to conduct recruitments under the PBT Program in consultation with the Department of Human Resources (DHR). The program was intended to streamline the hiring of permanent employees by offering departments a more straightforward approach compared to the alternative of a Class-Based Testing exam process. The stated goal of the PBT Program is to adopt eligible lists resulting from merit-based exam processes within 60 days of the posting of a Job Ad.

Analysis

Table 1 on page two shows that 339 (61%) of the 558 exams administered during fiscal year 2023-24 were PBTs. The number of PBTs decreased 4.5% compared to the previous year – 339 versus 355. DHR believes that the conversion of popular PBT-classes with specialty areas (e.g., 184X Management Assistant series, 124x Human Resources Analyst series, and 182X Administrative Analyst series) to Continuous Class-Based Tests (CCT) reduced the overall number of PBTs administered. There were 30 PBTs in those classes during fiscal year 2022-23.

The table also shows that the median length of time to conduct PBT recruitments increased from 84 days to 157 days which greatly exceeds the 60-day goal. Data indicated that the longest recruitment efforts were for difficult-to-fill positions in IT and management classes (09XX). Those classes constitute 50% (172 of 339) of the PBTs administered during fiscal year 2023-24.

Table 1

	PBT			CBT			Total Tests
	# of tests	% of all tests	Avg. # days	# of tests	% of all tests	Avg. # days	
FY 2006-2007	120	52%	99	109	48%	113	229
FY 2007-2008	180	61%	82	117	39%	111	297
FY 2008-2009	106	67%	67	52	33%	81	158
FY 2009-2010	142	56%	63	110	44%	80	252
FY 2010-2011	333	69%	42	152	31%	54	485
FY 2011-2012	268	70%	48	113	30%	90	381
FY 2012-2013	243	68%	58	113	32%	73	356
FY 2013-2014	305	65%	62	167	35%	81	472
FY 2014-2015	392	61%	58	251	39%	77	643
FY 2015-2016	418	60%	54	280	40%	88	698
FY 2016-2017	416	62%	57	254	38%	97	670
FY 2017-2018	380	60%	56	251	40%	74	631
FY 2018-2019	354	57%	61	265	43%	90	619
FY 2019-2020	316	61%	68	205	39%	96	521
FY 2020-2021	238	49%	86	244	51%	132	482
FY 2021-2022	297	61%	94	186	39%	91	483
FY 2022-2023	355	61%	84	224	39%	89	579
FY 2023-2024	339	61%	157	219	39%	116	558

Average # days in this table corresponds to the median time frame between the job ad closing and list adoption.

Protests/Appeals

Ten protests/appeals involving PBTs were received during fiscal year 2023-24. Four of the protest/appeals were administratively resolved by DHR and/or at the departmental level. Five appeals were denied by the Civil Service Commission. One appeal of rejection of application was withdrawn. The ten protests/appeals over 339 PBTs yields a rate of less than 3%.

Probationary Releases

The CSC requested on March 3, 2015, that DHR’s reports on PBTs include information about the number of employees released from probation as an indication of the “reliability” of the PBT program in predicting on-the-job success.

Eighty-four employees were released from probation from the City and County of San Francisco during fiscal year 2023-24. (This does not include releases from CCD, CRT, MTA or USD.) Twelve of these 84 releases (14%) were hired from PBT lists. All 12 of these releases were non-disciplinary. Moreover, these 12 releases represent less than 2% of the 721 hires made from PBT eligible lists during fiscal year 2023-24. Table 2 on page three shows the classes from which the 12 PBT-related probationary releases occurred.

Table 2

Class	# Released
0931 Manager III	1
1032 IS Trainer - Journey	1
1092 IT Operations Support Administrator II	1
1093 IT Operations Support Administrator III	1
1429 Nurses Staffing Assistant	1
1460 Legal Secretary II	1
1824 Principal Administrative Analyst	1
2533 Emergency Medical Services Agency Specialist	1
2620 Food Service Manager Administrator	1
3372 Animal Control Officer	1
9395 Property Manager, Port	1
9770 Community Development Assistant	1
TOTAL:	12

Conclusion

Eighteen years of data is ample evidence to conclude that the PBT Program has been generally successful in producing eligible lists faster for some classifications than Class-Based Testing without compromising the quality of the exam process. As indicated above, hard-to-fill recruitments significantly affected the median time to conduct PBT recruitments. DHR will conduct comprehensive training on exams including PBTs for departments citywide this Fall in anticipation that enhanced knowledge may foster more efficient and faster test administration processes.

Appeals of PBTs occur in 4% of all cases and a retention rate of 98% [2% released from probation] strongly supports the reliability of the program. DHR anticipates that the ongoing hiring modernization effort to shift PBT recruitments to CCT format will further reduce the number of PBTs.

Recommendation: Adopt the report.