



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
July 1, 2024**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id # 2660 173 8732. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2660 173 8732  
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**KATE FAVETTI  
President**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON  
Vice President**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**VITUS LEUNG**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**SANDRA ENG  
Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meetings use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code # 2660 173 8732.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Kate Favetti	Present
Vice President Elizabeth Salvesson	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor	Excused Absence

President Kate Favetti presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)**

None.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of June 17, 2024 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

None.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Carol Isen, Human Resources Director spoke about the recent agreement made with SEIU Local 1021 and IFPTE Local 21 on the Pilot Personal Services Contract appeal process and introduced Ardis Graham and Claire McCaleb. Claire McCaleb presented the Pilot PSC Review Process project. Director Isen congratulated President Favetti on her willingness to regain the gavel, she also expressed gratitude of the accomplishments under President Minor's leadership, including the adoption of the Exempt to Permanent Rule adoption 111.17 where over 600 exempt employees were appointed to Permanent status. This process, which was extremely popular came up repeatedly during negotiations, requesting this Commission to look at opportunities to be able to do similar initiatives going forward, PSCs procedures were updated, which were presented to the Commission; significant changes were made to the Rules across all four volumes.

**0121-24-1 Presentation to Civil Service Commission Regarding Pilot PSC Review Process. (Item No. 5)**

**Speakers:** Ardis Graham, Department of Human Resources  
 Claire McCaleb, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. (No action taken)

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT (Item No. 6)**

Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director, there was no report, but informed Commissioners about Sandra Eng being out sick. Also reported about the PSC database going live on that day and thanked everyone involved in getting the database up and running.

**0120-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
43388-23/24	City Administrator	\$5,000,000	The Fleet Management Division of the General Services Agency requires comprehensive services for emergency and non-emergency hazardous waste management. These services include collecting various used motor oils and industrial wastes and transporting and delivering them for proper recycling, reuse, or disposal at permitted facilities. Services also include responding to hazardous waste emergency spills on an intermittent and as-needed basis.	Regular	06/30/2029
42324-23/24	Human Services	\$3,653,069	The contractor will run the Parenting for Permanency College (PPC) program and provide training and supportive services to resource families. The main objective of these services is to equip resource parents with the knowledge, skills and supports to provide for the emotional, physical, financial, and well-being needs of the children and young adults who are in their care. The trainings will be delivered in collaboration with SFHSA RFA leadership, utilizing best industry practices, and in accordance with the written directives of San Francisco City & County and governing bodies. The four major trainings provided under this contract are: 1) Pre-Service Training, 2) Advanced Training, 3) Train the Trainer, and 4) Substance Abuse/HIV Training. Some of the supportive services include, but not limited to, a mentoring program, coaching sessions, Holiday events in December, and Foster Parent Appreciation events. The term resource family applies to all caregivers who provide out-of-home care for foster children and includes foster parents, adoptive parents, relatives or non-related extended family members.	Regular	06/30/2028
44649-23/24	Human Services	\$2,358,470	Property management and short-term residential counseling services to occupants of a temporary family housing building on Holloway Avenue in San Francisco.	Regular	06/30/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
45359-23/24	Human Services	\$371,800	The Contractor shall conduct fair hearings for the County Adult Assistance Program (CAAP) and clients served who receive public assistance and who are facing a reduction in their grant amount or a discontinuance of their grant and are requesting a fair hearing. The Contractor shall cover a minimum of four hearing days per month, as directed by the Director of Investigations or his or her designee, based on work flow and number of hearings scheduled by fair hearing staff. The Contractor shall also cover vacation and other leaves by the lead hearing officer, not to exceed an average of 175 hours per quarter. The Contractor shall keep itself fully informed of all applicable laws that govern fair hearings, including State law, sections of the San Francisco Administrative Code (SFAC), case law, and administrative rules and regulations that govern hearings and shall at all times comply the applicable laws. The Contractor shall also conduct hearings, participate in settlement discussions, and write decisions within applicable time frames. In addition, the Contractor will be required to review good cause requests and consult with program staff as needed, as directed by the lead hearing officer.	Regular	06/30/2028
47859-23/24	Treasurer/Tax Collector	\$9,000,000	Custom development of a separate, standalone business tax application that seamlessly integrates with the existing infrastructure and ecosystem.	Regular	07/01/2028
43546-20/21	Human Services	Current Approved Amount \$520,000 Increase Amount Requested \$405,671 New Total Amount Requested \$925,671	The Contractor shall provide the following parallel services during the term of this contract: A) SafeMeasures; B) Structured Decision Making; C) Ad Hoc Analytics; and D) On-Site training and coaching to FCS staff, supervisors and managers. A. SafeMeasures: The California Department of Social Services provides the Contractor with bi-weekly extracts from the statewide child welfare database. The Contractor conducts an analysis to display the data in tables that are related to the Division 31 Requirements that regulate child welfare operations. The Contractor organizes the data into a user-friendly, point-and-click format that allows managers, supervisors, and child welfare workers to view data by program, by office site, by unit, and by individual. The Contractor is one of two entities who has access to the state's database. SafeMeasures is a tool that supports measurement of both processes and outcomes. B. Structured Decision-Making: The FCS program utilizes an actuarial-based safety assessment tool, Structured Decision-Making (SDM) to improve its understanding of child risk and to improve case decision-making. The Contractor manages the data generated by these assessments and produces an annual management report, which compiles information from child welfare assessments. SDM is a logic tool based on probabilities, statistics, and research on outcomes. C. Ad Hoc Analytics: Using data extracts from SafeMeasures and the Structured Decision-Making tools, the Contractor will provide, on a monthly basis or as requested, ongoing reports related to various outcome measures as identified in the Family and Children Services (FCS) System Improvement Plan, including disproportionality, differential response, standardized assessments, and permanency. The Contractor will also provide comprehensive quarterly reports that include information related to foster care placement patterns, with particular focus on racial disproportion, distance of placement from home, adolescents in placement and length of time in care, children in institutional care, and placement moves. D. On-Site training and coaching to FCS staff, supervisors and managers: The Contractor will provide Safety Organized Practice (SOP) to Domestic Violence (DV) training and coaching for Protective Services Workers, coaches and Protective Service Supervisors. The Contractor will also provide management training for leadership development and implementation of the tools. The training will be conducted in connection with the SDM tool, to teach staff how to apply the material in the evidence-based decision making tool regarding domestic violence and moving it through SOP.	Modification	06/30/2027

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
44772-20/21	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$9,650,000 Increase Amount Requested \$1,750,000 New Total Amount Requested \$11,400,000	Selected contractors will provide specialized, as-needed services for the Sustainable Streets Division (SSD) in the areas of: 1.) Environmental analysis and documentation services (CEQA and NEPA); 2.) Transportation analysis and engineering services; 3.) Transportation data collection and analytics; and 4.) Sustainability data analysis for transportation projects. Work includes analysis of environmental strategy, procedures and level of required review, and preparing/ publishing findings when required by the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA); before and after studies for project implementation, including various modal movement counts; analysis and identification of travel markets, ridership patterns, modal demographics and mode choice, and expertise in applying geospatial analysis techniques to data sets; and drafting design standards and providing design recommendations.	Modification	06/30/2027
46036-21/22	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$360,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$27,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$387,000,000	Provide separate professional parking garage operational services for 21 parking facilities organized into two groups as follows: Group A – 9 Facilities (Ellis O’Farrell Garage, Fifth & Mission Garage, Kezar Lot, Mission Bartlett Garage, Moscone Center Garage, 7th & Harrison Lot, Zuckerberg SF General Hospital Garage, 16th & Hoff Garage, Union Square Garage); Group B – 12 Facilities (Japan Center Garage, Civic Center Garage, Golden Gateway Garage, Lombard Garage, North Beach Garage, Performing Arts Garage, Pierce Garage, Polk Bush Garage, Portsmouth Square Garage, St. Mary’s Square Garage, Sutter Stockton Garage, Vallejo Garage). Services include providing qualified and experienced parking personnel for parking operations, customer service, janitorial, maintenance, and security. The Operator shall provide oversight of all aspects of administrative functions including, but not limited to, collection, reconciliation, and deposit of all parking and non-parking revenue; repair and maintenance of facilities and revenue control equipment; compliance with insurance and bond requirements; providing valet or valet-assist parking services, as needed, during special events. The term is for just under five years, thereafter on a month-to-month basis, not to exceed 48 months. The amount of \$200 million represents the total operating expenses projected at all 21 garages over the nearly five-year period starting on February 1, 2023, and ending on January 15, 2028. <b>Scope Change:</b> Addition of one new parking facility (Music Concourse Garage) to the Group B garage-management contract.	Modification	01/15/2028
47099-20/21	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$12,033,750 Increase Amount Requested \$2,268,750 New Total Amount Requested \$14,312,500	Selected contractors will provide specialized, as-needed services to engage the public on transportation projects. This will include services such as, designing strategies and approaches that enable diverse, culturally competent public participation, arranging public events and meetings, facilitating focus groups, and compiling notes and records for follow-up and documentation; while conforming to The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency’s (SFMTA) established standards for conducting public outreach and engagement on its capital projects and programs.	Modification	06/30/2027
41908-23/24	Port	Current Approved Amount \$12,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$11,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$23,000,000	Conceptual engineering and design for 4 different contracts for specific locations along the waterfront.	Modification	09/30/2031  <i>Any approval will be conditioned on a status report to the Commission in year 4 of the PSC.</i>
45683-19/20	Public Works	Current Approved Amount \$4,193,000 Increase Amount Requested \$578,000 New Total Amount Requested \$4,771,000	Provide technical assistance on how to structure a Public Private Partnership (P3) project, which involves the joint development of a public asset (building) and private asset (private development), all performed under one Developer Agreement. This will include advising on the procurement strategy, assisting with terms of the Development Agreement, Exclusive Negotiating Agreements, and the long-term lease. Will integrate all financial and legal aspects of the Development Agreement into the technical and commercial terms of the construction and maintenance support services of the public and private assets.	Modification	06/30/2026

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
32406-18/19	Treasurer/Tax Collector	Current Approved Amount \$500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$500,000	The Office of the Treasurer & Tax Collector requires fiscal sponsor services to facilitate grant fundraising for its Office of Financial Empowerment (OFE) and Financial Justice Project (FJP). The OFE and FJP receive private grants to fulfill their respective missions. OFE’s mission is to leverage the power of City Hall to strengthen the economic security and mobility of low income families. FJP’s mission is to assess and reform how fees and fines impact the City’s most vulnerable residents. The role of the fiscal sponsor, as an independent nonprofit organization, is primarily to receive funds from philanthropic sources on behalf of OFE and FJP and secondarily to disburse funds on behalf of OFE and FJP on a case-by-case basis. Funds received are from philanthropic sources that are unwilling or unable to provide donations directly to the City but are able to make donations to a non-profit fiscal sponsor on behalf of OFE and FJP.	Modification	06/30/2027

**Speakers:** Lynn Khaw, City Administrator spoke on PSC # 43388-23/24  
 Krystal Rogers and Tara Alvarez, Human Services Agency spoke on PSC #44649-23/24  
 Matt Boyle and David Garcia, Municipal Transportation Agency spoke on PSC #47099-20/21

- Action:**
- 1) Continued PSC# 43388-23/24 from the City Administrator to the meeting of July 15, 2024, with a report to address questions on whether the Hazardous Waste Management work can be done by City employees. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  - 2) Approved PSC# 44649-23/24 from the Human Services Agency with the condition to work with Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director and/or Executive Officer to add classifications 2931, 2708 and 7524 and for future projects with the goal of keeping the work in-house. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  - 3) Continued PSC# 47099-20/21 from the Municipal Transportation Agency; the Municipal Transportation Agency was instructed to reach out to the Department of Human Resources to seek ways of bringing the specialized transportation project work in-house and to report back to the Commission at the July 15, 2024, meeting. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  - 4) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the office of the Controller and the office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0200-23-5 Proposed Changes to Civil Service Commission Rules: 102, 202, and 302 Definitions; 109, 209, and 309 Position Classification; 114, 214, and 314 Appointments; 120, 220, and 320 Leaves of Absence; 121, 221, and 321 Layoffs to Modernize and Expedite Hiring. (Item No. 8)**

**October 2, 2023** Continued to the meeting of October 16, 2023, directed DHR to incorporate the changes Vice President Favetti proposed and for the Municipal Transportation Agency to present Volume IV proposed rule changes and incorporate the changes Vice President Favetti. Append Vice President Favetti's changes to the minutes.

**October 16, 2023:** Accepted the report and post proposed amended Rules.

**Speakers:** Ardis Graham, Department of Human Resources  
Claire McCaleb, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. Adopted the proposed Rule amendments to Rules 02 Series; 09 Series; 014 Series; 020 Series; and 021 Series. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0201-23-5 Proposed Amendments to Civil Service Commission Rules: 113, 213, and 313 Certification of Eligibles to Modernize and Expedite Hiring. (Item No. 9)**

**October 2, 2023** Continue to the meeting of October 16, 2023, directed DHR to incorporate the changes Vice President Favetti proposed and for the Municipal Transportation Agency to present Volume IV proposed rule changes and incorporate the changes Vice President Favetti. Append Vice President Favetti's changes to the minutes.

**October 16, 2023:** Accepted the report and post proposed amended Rules.

**Speakers:** Ardis Graham, Department of Human Resources  
Claire McCaleb, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. Adopted the proposed Rule amendments to Rules 013 Series. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0209-23-5 Proposed Changes to Civil Service Commission Rules: 402 Definitions; 409 Position Classification; 414 Appointments; 420 Leaves of Absence; 421 Layoffs to Modernize and Expedite Hiring. (Item No. 10)**

**October 16, 2023:** Accepted the report and post proposed amended Rules.

**Speakers:** Ardis Graham, Department of Human Resources  
Claire McCaleb, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. Adopted the proposed Rule amendments to Rules 402; 409; 414; 420; and 421. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0210-23-5 Proposed Amendments to Civil Service Commission Rules: 413 Certification of Eligibles to Modernize and Expedite Hiring. (Item No. 11)**

**October 16, 2023:** Accepted the report and post proposed amended Rules.

**Speakers:** Ardis Graham, Department of Human Resources  
Claire McCaleb, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. Adopted the proposed Rule amendments to Rules 413. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0013-24-5 Proposed Changes to Civil Service Commission Rules: 213 Certification of Eligibles – Police Department and 313 Certification of Eligibles – Fire Department (Secondary Criteria) to Create Efficiencies and Reduce Time-to-Hire. (Item No. 12)**

**January 30, 2024:** Accepted the report; Post proposed amended Rules.

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report. Adopted the proposed Rule amendments to Rules 213 and 313 – Secondary Criteria. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 13)**

President Kate Favetti had four (4) announcements:

- Requested to look into the Rules that make reference to Limited Tenure (LT) and delete since is obsolete.
- Thanked Luz Morganti for her work on the Board of Supervisor's salary survey and Yvette Gamble for establishing the process.
- Thanked Commissioners Minor and Salveson for their work.
- Thanked CSC staff and Commissioners for the condolences on the passing of President Favetti's mother.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 14)**

3:05 p.m.