



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
May 6, 2024**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2664 817 6390. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2664 817 6390  
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**President**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**Vice President**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**VITUS LEUNG**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meetings use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2664 817 6390.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salveson	Present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)**

Ellen Lee Zhou, spoke of the more than 900 employees wrongfully terminated for not being vaccinated; recall the people terminated in 2022 and 2023 back to work.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of April 15, 2024 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer announced that items #12 and #13 will be heard together because item #13 is related to the PSC on item #12.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Carol Isen will be leaving at 2:30p.m. and Anna Biasbas will take her place on the dais. Mike Cotter, Chief Financial Officer, spoke on the technology improvements to the new PSC database system, on target to go-live on 7/1/2024; initial development completed, able to migrate historical information from the old database system to the new one, user acceptance testing is underway in the new system. Thank you to the Civil Service Commission, Office of Contract Administration, and the Government Operations Team for their partnership. Rollout of the new system and communications plan is forthcoming.

**Public Comment:** Ellen Lee Zhou

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT (Item No. 6)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, gave update on the rule proposal regarding Leaves and merit system trainings; thanked Mike Cotter and staff in partnership with the Department of Technology as well as Kate Kimberlin, Deputy City Attorney for their hard work on the new PSC database project.

**0088-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
40995-23/24	Airport	\$250,000,000	Project Management Support Services (PMSS) and Design-Build services for the Boarding Area G Gate Enhancements Project (Project) at San Francisco International Airport (Airport or SFO). The Project will replace the passenger boarding bridges at each gate in Boarding Area G, replace the pre-conditioned air system, install automated aircraft guidance systems, upgrade the fire hydrant infrastructure, and repair damaged pavement. Services to be provided include project controls, scheduling, document control, design management, contracts management, architectural, engineering, and environmental services, and construction of the Program. Of the \$250M total Project cost, PMSS portion of the work is estimated to be \$6M, and design portion of work are estimated to be \$8M.	Regular	05/31/2029
42122-23/24	Airport	\$6,000,000	Contractor will be responsible for the ongoing maintenance and software support of the Intergraph Computer Aided Dispatch System (CAD) for public safety dispatching used by multiple divisions at the San Francisco International Airport (Airport). Software support will include upgrades to new software versions of the proprietary CAD system, providing additional licenses, incorporating new interfaces with other Airport systems, mapping services, and other services necessary to maintain system functionality.	Regular	06/30/2029
43039-23/24	City Administrator	\$500,000	The City’s Contract Monitoring Division (CMD) oversees the 14B Local Business Enterprise (LBE) program, which promotes equity in the City’s procurement processes and aims to lower barriers to accessing contracting opportunities for the City’s certified local businesses. In order to better serve the LBE community and to increase program effectiveness, CMD will partner with one or more contractors to conduct a utilization study to understand the current state of LBEs’ participation on City contracts, an availability study to understand potential LBE participation, and an evaluation of the 14B program to understand how the program can be improved. The selected contractor(s) will provide research, evaluation, and technical assistance to the City, including but not limited to: • Designing and implementing study methodologies • Cleaning, aggregating, and analyzing key program data and conducting statistical analysis • Conducting community and stakeholder engagement and user research • Synthesizing study results and providing improvement recommendations to City leaders.	Regular	12/31/2027
40897-23/24	Department of Emergency Management	\$1,503,423	Provide stakeholder engagement, facilitation and training services for community-based organizations and service providers for crisis response and emergency preparedness programs.	Regular	06/04/2027
49801-23/24	Human Resources	\$1,200,000	Provide expert test development consultation for the Q050 Police Sergeant, Q060 Police Lieutenant, Q080 Police Captain, H020 Fire Lieutenant, H030 Fire Captain, H040 Battalion Chief, and H050 Assistant Chief, selection process and defense of selection process (if necessary), provide testimony, preparation, and consultation against legal challenges.	Regular	04/30/2029

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
47230-23/24	Human Services	\$3,178,516	Provides comprehensive, high-quality, culturally-responsible State-mandated training to Child Welfare workers, using Federal dollars, to increase Child Welfare workers knowledge and skills in the practice of public child welfare. These trainings increase the knowledge and skills of Child Welfare workers, thereby improving outcomes for children and families. Trainings cover complex case management and have both clinical and legal implications, providing Child Welfare workers updates on State laws, regulations and standards.	Regular	06/30/2029
44510-23/24	Juvenile Probation	\$300,000	The department wishes to contract with organizations that specialize in transitional housing programs and supportive services for young people, ages 18-25, re-entering the community from a secure commitment term in San Francisco's Juvenile Justice Center. Supportive services provided by transitional housing programs shall include: a. Case management, b. Mental Health services or linkage to mental health services, c. Linkage to vocational services such as vocational support, job readiness skills, etc., d. Ability to promote family reunification, e. Independent living skills, f. Financial education, including money management, how to pay bills, etc., g. Basic needs support, h. Regular check-ins and ability to support young person to meet court mandates and orders, --including stay away orders from people and locations, no weapons clauses, no substance use clauses, etc., i. Confidentiality for young person to ensure safety and successful return to community, and j. Ability to support reentry and transition goals.	Regular	11/30/2028
43395-23/24	Public Health	\$4,000,000	The selected contractor(s) will provide substance use residential services at American Society of Addiction Medicine (ASAM) Level 3.1, clinically managed low-intensity residential services, for youth up to the age of 18 years old experiencing high level of substance use and meeting the ASAM criteria for residential services.	Regular	06/30/2029
41323-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$4,000,000	This PSC is to provide specialized, short-term staff to provide construction management services for an approximately \$20M Power Enterprise construction project to construct underground electrical duct bank and vaults, Emergency Fire-fighting Water System (EFWS) pipeline, San Francisco Water Department (SFWD) pipeline, installation of electrical cable and switches, inter-connection to high-voltage switchgear, and roadway and sidewalk work. The construction management services required under this PSC would include, but are not limited to, construction contract administration, construction inspection, construction contracts management, and project controls.	Regular	06/30/2027
45763-2324	Public Works	\$7,000,000	The consultant and their joint venture partners will provide the following services: Mechanical design, electrical design, plumbing design, structural design, civil (underground utility), security & technology, sustainability, energy modeling, daylighting, LEED (Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design) coordination and documentation, audio-visual and lowvoltage design, fire protection, acoustic design, vertical transportation, building management systems integration, façade maintenance, wind consulting, signage and environmental graphic design, and waterproofing.	Regular	09/01/2031  <i>Any approval will be conditioned on a status report to the Commission in year 4 of the PSC.</i>

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
41297-23/24	City Administrator	\$500,000	Contractor will sell City-owned surplus assets (with the exception of City-owned fleet vehicles that will be publicly auctioned pursuant to a separate personal services contract), including seized, found, unclaimed, stolen, recovered, and retired property, to the general public. Public auctions will be conducted online through the contractor's online auction application. The auction services will generate revenue for the City. The cost to the City for the services will be paid from the net proceeds of each sale for the services performed by the contractor. Contractor was selected pursuant to Solicitation Number 012821 conducted by a service cooperative established by Minn. Stat Sec. 123A.21 to provide a Cooperative Purchasing Program to participating entities, of which City is one. Solicitation Number 012821 was publicly posted on December 8, 2020, and the contractor was ranked 1.	Regular	07/01/2026
43590-22/23	Board of Supervisors	Current Approved Amount \$540,000 Increase Amount Requested \$460,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,000,000	The Office of the Clerk of the Board (COB) seeks a vendor to enhance or replace the current aging and costly LMS with a state-of-the-art solution to effectively address mandated requirements, streamline legislative workflow, and meet stakeholder expectations. The COB will adopt a legislative system that will streamline the process of 1) drafting, submitting, and accessing status of legislation, 2) developing and managing public meeting agendas and minutes, 3) ensuring the integrity and retention of legislative records, 4) providing a legislative drafting tool for city departments, and 5) providing a public portal accessible to the public for tracking legislation. The LMS would not only support the core business of the Board of Supervisors, but all City Departments and agencies that submit and recommend legislation and/or amendments. The technology solution will be developed, implemented, and supported through a software development and support agreement with the Contractor and internal COB IT staff.	Modification	8/31/2028

**Speakers:** Elizabeth Leone, Human Services Agency spoke on 47230-23/24

- Action:**
- 1) Approved PSC #47230-23/24 from the Human Services Agency subject to clarification from the department on how many families are to be served. (Vote of 5 to 0)
  - 2) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract: Notify the office of the Controller and the office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**Public Comment:** Ellen Lee Zhou

**0090-24-1 San Francisco Health Service System’s Hiring Progress in the Member Services Division. (Item No. 8)**

**Speakers:** Rey Guillen, Health Service System  
Michael Visconti, Health Service System

**Action:** Accepted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0; Commissioner Minor stepped out about 2:40 and returned at 2:53 p.m.)

**Public Comment:** Ellen Zhou  
Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021

**0089-24-8 Follow-Up Report on PSC Number 43506- 21/22 from the Department of Public Health. (Item No. 9)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**Public Comment:** Ellen Lee Zhou

**0176-22-6 Appeal by Irene Seddon of Human Resources Director’s determination that investigative findings did not establish Appellant’s complaint of harassment and retaliation. (Item No. 10)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Postponed to the meeting of May 20, 2024, at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0086-24-8 Follow-Up Report on PSC Number 49798- 23/24 from the Human Service Agency. (Item No. 11)**

**December 18, 2023:** Approved PSC #49798-23/24 from the Human Services Agency with the condition that the department meets with SEIU Local 1021. If department and SEIU Local 1021 are unable to meet the contract will come back before the Commission on January 30, 2024.

**Speakers:** Daniel Varela, Human Services Agency  
Elizabeth Leone, Human Services Agency  
Juliet Halverson, Human Services Agency  
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources  
Mirna Palma, Human Services Agency  
Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021  
Brenda Williams, Human Services Agency  
Kate Kimberlin, City Attorney’s Office

**Action:** Adopted the report. Approve PSC #49798-23/24 from the Human Services Agency; the Commission requested a follow-up report to the meeting of October 21, 2024, on the possibility to bring services in-house and potential special conditions. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**Public Comment:** Ellen Lee Zhou  
Brenda Barros

**0087-24-8 Review of PSC Number 40625-23/24 From the Municipal Transportation Agency. (Item No. 12)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
40625-23/24	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$20,000,000	<p>The scope of this project is to purchase roughly \$14.5M of custom manufactured brake parts required for the Light Rail Vehicles (LRV4) proprietary brake system then also perform roughly \$6M of professional overhaul services for a planned overhaul program in accordance with recommended maintenance interval established by the manufacturer.</p> <p>This overhaul will be for the hydraulic brake systems on 68 Phase 1 Siemens LRV4 light rail vehicles for the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency. This overhaul conforms to the scheduled maintenance recommended by the Brakes Manufacturer. Maintenance intervals on the brakes system are every 6 years. This will be the first major system overhaul on LRV4 vehicles, the oldest of which are coming out of their 5-year base warranty period. Performing this overhaul is in keeping with SFMTA’s commitment to remain up-to-date on scheduled maintenance to maximize life and minimize lifecycle costs for the LRV4 fleet.</p> <p>The overhaul program includes brakes subsystems including the Hydraulic Power Unit (HPU), Accumulator, and Brake Discs. Motor Truck (MT) calipers and Center Truck (CT) calipers in this overhaul program will be included in the necessary standard overhaul activities as well as upgrading parts (to improve reliability and address known warranty issues) to optimize the performance of these products.</p> <p>\$14.5M of this project will be used for the purchase of proprietary custom-manufactured parts. The parts are to be sold as a packaged overhaul kit as part of this contract. In delivering the overhaul, the Contractor shall provide all parts, materials, tools, labor, inspections, facilities, and equipment required to complete this work, which includes removal and replacement (R&amp;R) of the brake system, shipment of the system to the site of original manufacture in Duncan, South Carolina, disassembly of the existing brakes systems, disposal of used parts, cleaning, inspecting for wear and damage, overhaul and remanufacture to original specifications, quality inspection, shipping back to San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA), and putting the brake systems back on the LRV4 fleet.</p> <p>All rehabilitation work will be performed off-site, as the work requires a clean room with specialized production equipment. The Contractor shall provide a Field Services team to execute on-train services.</p> <p>Because the contractor is also the original manufacturer, and because the manufacturer is supplying all parts, and because the manufacturer is performing the overhaul rebuild, the Contractor will provide a three-year warranty on all rebuilt components.</p>	Regular	9/30/2026

**April 1, 2024:** Postpone PSC #40625-23/24 from the Municipal Transportation Agency to the meeting of May 6, 2024, at the request of the department.

**Speakers:** David Garcia, Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Joe Speaks, Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Donte Vickers, Local 1414  
 Michael Allen, Local 1414 (7332 at MTA)

**Action:** Adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract Number 40625-23/24 with the condition to report back by October 21, 2024, on discussions regarding training MTA employees; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0085-24-8 Appeal by Machinists Local 1414 on PSC Number 40625-23/24 from the Municipal Transportation Agency. (Item No. 13)**

**Speakers:** David Garcia, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Joe Speaks, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Donte Vickers, Local 1414  
Michael Allen, Local 1414 (7332 at MTA)

**Action:** Adopted the report and denied the appeal. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract Number 40625-23/24 with the condition to report back by October 21, 2024, on discussions regarding training MTA employees; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0027-24-4 Appeal of Rejection of Application by Abraham Mohamed for 9520 Transportation Safety Specialist (CBT-9520-T00087). (Item No. 14)**

**Speakers:** Bill Miles II, Municipal Transportation Agency

**Action:** Adopted the report and denied the appeal by Mohamed. Appellant failed to appear. (Vote of 5 to 0; Commissioner Salveson acknowledge reading all the materials.)

**Public Comment:** Lolet Encabo

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 15)**

Commissioner Kate Favetti requested a report from the Municipal Transportation Agency on the apprenticeship program.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 16)**

4:19 p.m.