



Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

Draft Minutes

Committee on Information Technology Meeting

Thursday, March 21, 2024

10:00 am – 12:00 pm

City Hall 305, WebEx Online Event

Members

Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Chair

Mike Makstman, Interim City Chief Information Officer, Executive Director, Department of Technology

Nathan Sinclair, Acting Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Sophia Kittler, Director, Mayor's Office of Innovation

Aaron Peskin, President, Board of Supervisors

Angela Calvillo, Clerk, Board of Supervisors

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Carol Isen, Director, Department of Human Resources

Dr. Grant Colfax, Director, Department of Public Health

Dennis Herrera, General Manager, Public Utilities Commission

Michael Lambert, City Librarian, Public Library

Mary Ellen Carroll, Director, Department of Emergency Management

Ivar Satero, Director, San Francisco International Airport

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director, Municipal Transportation Agency

Trent Rhorer, Executive Director, Human Services Agency

Sheryll Davis, Executive Director, Human Rights Commission

1. Call to Order by Chair

Katie Petrucione called the meeting to order at 10:01 AM, provided instruction on how to give public comment, and conducted the roll call.

2. Roll Call

Members Present

Katie Petrucione for Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Chair

Michael Lat for Mike Makstman, Interim City Chief Information Officer, Executive Director, Department of Technology

Nathan Sinclair, Acting Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Sophia Kittler, Director, Mayor's Office of Innovation

Calvin Yan for Aaron Peskin, President, Board of Supervisors

Angela Calvillo, Clerk, Board of Supervisors

Jack Wood for Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Mike Cotter for Carol Isen, Director, Department of Human Resources
Eric Raffin for Dr. Grant Colfax, Director, Department of Public Health
Ramsey Williams for Dennis Herrera, General Manager, Public Utilities Commission
Michael Lambert, City Librarian, Public Library
Ray Ricardo for Ivar Satero, Director, San Francisco International Airport (Joined at 10:10 AM)
Lisa Walton for Jeffrey Tumlin, Director, Municipal Transportation Agency
Natalie Toledo for Trent Rhorer, Executive Director, Human Services Agency
Amelia Martinez-Bankhead for Sheryl Davis, Executive Director, Human Rights Commission

COIT Staff

Danny Thomas Vang
Julia Chrusciel
Damon Daniels

3. General Public Comment

Chris Ward Kline suggested that members read a FBI Report distributed to departments via email.

4. Approval of the Meeting Minutes from February 15, 2024 (Action Item)

There was no public comment.

Sophia Kittler initiated a motion to approve the minutes, Lisa Walton seconded. The motion was approved by Katie Petrucione, Michael Lat, Nathan Sinclair, Sophia Kittler, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Jack Wood, Mike Cotter, Eric Raffin, Ramsey Williams, Michael Lambert, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, and Natalie Toledo. Amelia Martinez-Bankhead abstained from the vote.

5. Surveillance Technology Policy - Juvenile Probation Department - Web Content Filtering Technology - Web Filtering Software - (Action Item)

Elisa Baeza and Bobby Wong presented on behalf of the Juvenile Probation Department on their Web Filtering Technology.

Committee members asked the following questions:

- Is the filtering technology uniformly applied to all residents, or is there a difference based on age group?
- Are users notified in advance that surveillance technology is on the computer?
- Are individuals associated with a surveillance file? If not, how will the web content data correlate back to said individual if there is no unique identifier?
- Can the department elaborate on the utility of retaining web content data for a year, and what would be the downside of not retaining the data at all?

Committee members made the following suggestion:

- Revise language to eliminate double negatives on Page 5 of the Surveillance Technology Policy

There was no public comment.

Michael Lambert initiated a motion to move the policy forward with the suggested edit, Sophia Kittler seconded.

The motion was approved by Katie Petrucione, Michael Lat, Nathan Sinclair, Sophia Kittler, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Jack Wood, Mike Cotter, Eric Raffin, Ramsey Williams, Michael Lambert, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, Natalie Toledo, and Amelia Martinez-Bankhead.

6. Surveillance Technology Policy - Municipal Transportation Agency - Camera, Non-Security - Automated Speed Enforcement Camera - (Action Item)

Sohail Warsi and Robert Miller presented on behalf of the Municipal Transportation Agency on their Automated Speed Enforcement Camera.

Committee members asked the following questions:

- Who makes the determination on which neighborhoods the cameras are placed?
- What are the plans to notify drivers of the areas where cameras will be placed?
- At what speed will the camera be triggered?
- Is there a reason why cloud storage has been omitted, and is there an advantage to having it as only local storage?

Chris Ward Kline is in support of the cameras, and expressed concerns about the intersection at Van Ness Ave and McAllister Street.

Sophia Kittler initiated a motion to move the policy forward, Calvin Yan seconded. The motion was approved by Katie Petrucione, Michael Lat, Nathan Sinclair, Sophia Kittler, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Jack Wood, Mike Cotter, Eric Raffin, Ramsey Williams, Michael Lambert, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, Natalie Toledo, and Amelia Martinez-Bankhead.

7. Chair Update

Katie Petrucione announced the first of a series of quarterly updates on the city process to explore and adopt artificial intelligence tools. She gave an overview of the five workstreams: Technology Use, Baseline and Research, Training and Staff Engagement, Ethical Use and Governance Framework, Stakeholder and Public Engagement. Mike Makstman will present on Copilot at the April COIT Meeting.

8. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:47 AM.