



Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

Draft Minutes

Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting City and County of San Francisco

Friday, October 28, 2022

9:00 am – 11:00 am

WebEx Online Event

Members

Mike Makstman – Chair, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services

Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office

Jillian Johnson – Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology

Michelle Littlefield – Chief Data Officer, Data SF and Digital Services

Taraneh Moayed – Assistant Director, Office of Contract Administration

1. Call to Order by Chair

Mike Makstman called the meeting to order at 9:05 am.

2. Roll Call

Jillian Johnson

Guy Clarke

Mark de la Rosa

Michelle Littlefield

Mike Makstman

COIT Staff

Julia Chrusciel

Guests

Bella Fudym

3. Approval of the Consent Agenda (Action Item)

3.1 Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings under California Government Code Section 54953(e)

3.2 Approval of Minutes from August 26, 2022

Jillian Johnson moved to approve the resolution and the approval of meeting minutes and Guy Clarke seconded the motion. Michelle Littlefield, Jillian Johnson, Mike Makstman, Guy Clarke, and Mark de la Rosa voted to approve and Mikela Clemmons abstained from the vote. The motion passed. The resolution and the minutes of August 26, 2022 were approved without changes.

4. Department Updates & Announcements

Jillian Johnson updated the PSAB members and other meeting attendees on the following: Public Member Nnena Ukuku left the Committee on Information of Technology and as such will no longer sit on PSAB. PSAB members thanked her for her service. Mikela Clemmons joined PSAB as a new member as of this meeting; they are the technical director of Digital Services. Jillian also updated the board on legislative action taken on the San Francisco Police Department's (SFPD) non-entity camera policy. The policy was amended and passed by the Board of Supervisors, explicitly prohibiting SFPD from:

- Creating a camera registry
- Accessing live feed of 1st amendment activities unless there are exigent circumstance or for the placement of police personnel, and
- Obtaining footage for the purposes of enforcing prohibitions on reproductive healthcare.

They also required SFPD submit quarterly reports to the Police Commission and Board of Supervisors on requests to access live footage of non-city entity cameras.

5. Review and Approval of Surveillance Technology Policy: Location Management Systems (Action Item)

Bella Fudym presented on GPS Electronic Monitoring on behalf of the Adult Probation Department.

The PSAB members made the following recommendations:

- Reference the department policy the data protection in terms of numbers, so that members of the public understand what is being done with the data – add as appendix what this code means
- Update data disposal information by making it more detailed and specific regarding the data disposal process as was discussed; the vendor deletes and the department disposes of the data upon probation completion
- Under questions and concerns – please note in a couple of sentences regarding how the department investigates disputed or potentially inaccurate data from the device.

Mike Makstman suggested that this should move to COIT with PSAB comments. Jillian Johnson moved and Mark de la Rosa seconded. The policy was unanimously recommended to COIT pending the minor changes made by the PSAB members.

6. Review and Approval of Surveillance Technology Policy: Biometric (Action Item)

Bella Fudym presented on Electronic Monitoring for Alcohol Use on behalf of the Adult Probation Department.

The PSAB members made the following recommendations:

- Reference the department policy the data protection in terms of numbers, so that members of the public understand what is being done with the data – add as appendix what this code means
- Update data disposal information by making it more detailed and specific regarding the data disposal process as was discussed; the vendor deletes and the department disposes of the data upon probation completion
- Under questions and concerns – please note in a couple of sentences regarding how the department investigates disputed or potentially inaccurate data from the device.

Mike Makstman asked if there was a motion. Jillian Johnson moved and Michelle Littlefield seconded. The board members unanimously voted to recommend to COIT with minor edits.

7. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

8. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 9:57 am.