



San Francisco Community College District  
**CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO**

50 FRIDA KAHLO WAY • SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94112 • PHONE: (415) 239-3000

---

August 30, 2021

Ellie Schafer, Foreperson  
San Francisco Civil Grand Jury

City College of San Francisco (CCSF) is pleased to submit this response to the findings and recommendations from the San Francisco Civil Grand Jury June 2021 report, *Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage*. The College appreciates the Civil Grand Jury's effort to identify barriers and recommended improvements to making City College a more effective partner in San Francisco's workforce development efforts. The information presented in the Civil Grand Jury's report is generally consistent with the College's efforts to work with the San Francisco Board of Supervisors to establish the Workforce Education Recovery Fund (WERF).

The CCSF Board of Trustees received and filed the College's draft response to the Civil Grand Jury during its August 26, 2021, public monthly meeting. The enclosed final response reflects minor changes requested by the Board of Trustees during that public meeting.

Our ability to maintain our programs, including the vital training our City's residents need to get back to work in the wake of COVID-19, is in serious jeopardy. Along with chronic underfunding, the current pandemic, restructuring at the college catalyzed by an ongoing enrollment decline, and the State "Student-Centered Funding Formula" have led to the annual loss of over 600 City College class offerings since 2017.

In this new recession we can expect San Francisco residents to look to City College for support in re-entering the workforce. Students depend on CCSF to boost their job prospects, which supports the economic recovery of San Francisco as a whole. **In order to support residents with quality workforce education programs, CCSF needs additional resources.**

The College will continue to strengthen its partnership with the San Francisco Office of Economic and Workforce Development and the workforce system's community-based organizations to improve coordination and increase enrollment in Workforce Education—from cutting-edge Biotechnology and Cybersecurity degree and certificate programs, to Nursing and EMT programs, to Community Health and Mental Health Worker certificates, to Culinary and Hospitality training, Automotive and Custodial training, and many others.

We look forward to working with the City and County of San Francisco to secure additional resources for the Workforce Education and Recovery Fund that will enable us to help additional residents achieve their career development goals.

Sincerely,

*Dianna R. Gonzales*

Dianna R. Gonzales (Aug 30, 2021 16:49 PDT)

Dianna R. Gonzales, J.D.

Interim Chancellor

**BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

SHANELL WILLIAMS, PRESIDENT • TOM TEMPRANO, VICE PRESIDENT • ALIYA CHISTI

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA • JOHN RIZZO • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALLI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DIANNA GONZALES, INTERIM CHANCELLOR

## Response to Findings

**F1.** City College did not have a formal role on the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee while it was active and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, and this inhibits effective programmatic coordination between OEWD and City College

**Response to F1: Partially agree.** City College agrees it did not have a formal role on the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, but City College does participate on other OEWD boards and committees. City College has a seat on the Workforce Investment San Francisco (WISF) Board, and CCSF Board President Williams is the current WISF board member. The CCSF Chancellor and the Dean of Workforce Development also participated in the San Francisco COVID-19 Economic Recovery Task Force and its workforce committee that was led by OEWD. City College also has a formal role in the Workforce Investment and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Partners Committee that meets quarterly. The College has a signed MOU with OEWD that is a record of the partners’ commitment to working together to create a unified service delivery system that best meets the needs of our shared customers such as recipients of public assistance, other low-income individuals, individuals who are basic skills deficient, and individuals with disabilities and other barriers to employment. City College administrators, staff, and faculty participate in various meetings convened by OEWD that pertain to programs such as CityBuild, TechSF, and the HealthCare Academy to promote enrollment in CCSF Career Education programs and student services. These ongoing program coordination activities between OEWD and City College ensure our shared customers have access to employment services, supportive services, training, and education programming that will help these individuals eventually get a good job.

**F2.** City College of San Francisco’s Office of Workforce Development does not have a formal role on the institution’s Curriculum Committee, and this limits the Curriculum Committee’s knowledge of the specific needs of students participating in the workforce development programs.

**Response to F2: Disagree.** This finding requires clarification. The Office of Workforce Development at City College of San Francisco (CCSF) works closely with Student Affairs to support Career Education student success. Within Academic Affairs, the Workforce Office supports CTE faculty in their respective schools and disciplines, and the faculty develop and deliver innovative and relevant short- and long-term technical education programs leading to employment and university transfer opportunities. While the CCSF Office of Workforce Development does not have a formal role on the institution’s Curriculum Committee, the faculty and school deans who serve on the Curriculum Committee have direct knowledge of the specific needs of students participating in their respective workforce development programs. The Academic Senate appoints a CTE liaison who participates on both the Curriculum Committee and the CTE Steering Committee. Faculty who develop CTE certificate programs are required to conduct an analysis of workforce supply and demand by engaging the Center of Excellence for Labor Market Research, which is housed in the CCSF Office of Workforce Development. The Dean of Workforce Development, as the CCSF representative on the Bay

Area Community College Consortium’s regional curriculum approval process, also plays a role in recommending new CTE certificate programs.

**F3.** OEWD’s lack of a concerted effort to enroll groups in Eligible Training Provider List programs at City College hurts its ability to maximize limited funds.

**Response to F3: Disagree.** This finding requires clarification. OEWD does not directly enroll groups into programs. OEWD funds community-based organizations that either enroll participants in their own training programs or refer participants to programs at City College. However, with increased coordination between OEWD and the College, developing a more efficient delivery model is possible, thereby maximizing limited funds.

**F4.** Limited availability of technical courses during City College’s summer semester is a contributing factor to OEWD participants pursuing their studies at alternative educational institutions, thereby incurring additional costs.

**Response to F4: Agree.** City College agrees that more short-term technical courses would benefit OEWD participants, though not necessarily during summer. The offering of courses, including the time frame in which courses can be completed, is within the faculty purview. The College has engaged in discussions about creating more short-term classes, particularly in light of Strong Workforce Program priorities, to support the COVID economic recovery and will continue those conversations. In the 2021-22 school year the Strong Workforce Program is supporting four short-term training programs in Child Development, Custodial, Emergency Medical Technician, and Phlebotomy.

**F5.** Demand for some City College courses and the lack of priority registration for OEWD participants results in their being denied enrollment for courses needed for their training programs.

**Response to F5: Disagree.** City College has not received any information on the number of OEWD participants who are being denied enrollment for courses needed for their training programs. Priority registration is regulated by the California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 58108 as a condition of claiming state apportionment for enrollment in the class. Additionally, priority registration must be approved by the College’s Academic Senate, and other existing priority groups could be adversely impacted unless OEWD participants were added to the list on the list. There would be costs involved in defining and identifying OEWD clients.

**F6.** Inaccuracies on the Eligible Training Provider List unnecessarily deter OEWD job seekers from taking needed courses.

**Response to F6: Agree.** City College will check for any inaccuracies on the ETPL. OEWD job seekers who inquire about programs on the ETPL are advised to contact CCSF Academic Counselors and CTE Department Chairs to plan a program of study that meets their needs.

**F7.** The lack of synchronization and outreach among OEWD, City College, and community-based organizations in promoting Eligible Training Provider List certificate programs at City College results in the underutilization of these programs.

**Response to F7: Disagree.** Clarification is needed for this finding. City College consistently does outreach with OEWD and community-based organizations to promote certificate programs at City College. CCSF conducts a CBO Summit every year and a Career Education Showcase every semester, which are promoted to OEWD and community-based organizations. The CCSF Outreach Office maintains a list of CBOs to do routine outreach emails about CTE programs. OEWD sends out a weekly e-newsletter that frequently promotes CCSF CTE programs. CCSF regularly participates in CBO meetings convened by OEWD to promote CCSF CTE programs. CCSF utilizes the Academic and Career Communities as a framework for navigating its degree and certificate programs. Please note that on p. 11 of the report, the following paragraph is not accurate:

“With funding from the state, City College recently implemented a program called Career Communities that includes elements of a learning community. In this program, employment specialists arrange career workshops, teach job search skills, and provide job leads to students within each designated employment sector. Course enrollment at City College does not in itself garner access to the Career Communities program, but enrollment in a certificate program does. This is yet another reason to encourage OEWD participants to enroll in certificate programs and a benefit of enhancing the partnership between OEWD and City College.”

To clarify, the College has clustered its certificate and degree programs into “Academic and Career Communities” to help students better navigate the program offerings. In concert with that effort, the College is piloting “Student Success Teams” (official name under consideration) that provide students with access to networks and resources within their designated Academic and Career Community. The College’s Employment Specialists (classified staff assigned to assist with job placement and other career services within the Strong Workforce Program) will play a role in these Student Success Teams to raise awareness of career possibilities and to connect students to employment opportunities (including internships, etc.). The Student Success Teams also include representatives from a variety of support services.

**F8.** City College is underutilizing Contract Education and Instruction programs that provide short-term training programs designed specifically for individual business needs.

**Response to F8: Agree.** The College is working toward expanding Contraction Education opportunities and plans to continue that work.

## Response to Recommendations

**R1.** The Board of Supervisors should reinstate the Committee on City Workforce Alignment to Chapter 30 of the Administrative Code and add City College as a member. The reinstatement should be completed no later than February 2022.

**Response to R1: Agree.** City College looks forward to joining the Committee on City Workforce Alignment should it be reinstated by the Board of Supervisors.

**R2.** City College's Dean for Workforce Development should begin submitting quarterly reports that outline and seek input on specific Career Technical Education program needs to the Curriculum Committee beginning in January 2022.

**Response to R2: Partially Agree.** City College's Dean of Workforce Development will attend Curriculum Committee meetings and ask the committee what additional information will be helpful to report.

**R3.** OEWD should convene a joint working group to review current Career Technical Education course offerings at City College and make recommendations to develop content that aligns with the needs of the OEWD participants by December 2021. The joint working group should include City College's Dean for Workforce Development, the City's Director of Sector and Workforce Development, and the Eligible Training Provider List Coordinator for Workforce Development Comprehensive Job Centers.

**Response to R3: Partially Agree.** We do not think it is necessary for OEWD to convene an additional working group for this purpose. CCSF can work with OEWD to develop content that aligns with the needs of OEWD participants, within the context of our current meeting framework. This work is ongoing beyond December 2021 to respond to emerging needs.

**R4.** City College should enhance its number of short-term certificate training programs by February 2022, and these courses should be developed in collaboration with businesses or community-based organizations receiving OEWD funding. This should include an increase in the number of CTE course offerings during City College's summer semester to at least six.

**Response to R4: Disagree.** While the College is engaging in conversations about creating more short-term training opportunities, it may not be feasible to meet the requirement of offering at least six of these short-term programs during summer. Contract Education may be a more feasible approach, due to its flexibility, and timing and scope would depend on the needs of community partners.

**R5.** City College should allow priority registration for OEWD participants enrolling in certificate program courses on the Eligible Training Provider List. Priority registration should begin with the Fall 2022 semester.

**Response to R5: Disagree.** This would be subject to approval by the College's Academic Senate, and any updates to registration priorities must comply with the California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 58108. While the College could explore this, we are unable to commit to fulfilling this recommendation.

**R6.** City College should convene a workgroup to identify and correct inaccuracies in the course descriptions, schedules, and costs included on the Eligible Training Provider List by January 2022.

**Response to R6: Agree.** CCSF staff are already working on verifying and updating information on the Eligible Training Provider List and will complete this work by January 2022.

**R7.** OEWD should work with stakeholders who coordinate the Eligible Training Provider List to develop an outreach program that encourages clientele to pursue City College certificate programs. The outreach plan should be approved by the Director of Workforce Development and implemented by April 2022.

**Response to R7: Disagree** OEWD should not create an outreach program to enroll students in a system, CCSF that is not a part of its WIOA funding outcomes or requirements. CCSF is committed to serving San Franciscans through participation in our programs and partners with OEWD and its funded providers on placement in employment opportunities. As appropriate, OEWD-funded providers refer participants to CCSF to upskill for careers if they demonstrate interest in specific CCSF coursework.

**R8.** Contract Education and Instructional Services at City College should establish formal outreach guidelines for collaborating with local businesses to develop customized training programs. The outreach guidelines should be submitted for review to City College's Vice Chancellor for Academic and Institutional Affairs by February 2022. The outreach guidelines should be implemented by March 2022.

**Response to R8: Agree.** The College plans to develop an overview of the ways in which local businesses and CBOs can partner in offering training to their employees/clients (includes Contract Education, Continuing Education, Instructional Service Agreements, Apprenticeship Programs, etc.). The College already collaborates with many local employers, including the City and County of San Francisco, to develop customized training programs. The College recommends expanding our partnership with the City to provide preference points to Civil Service job applicants who completed a degree or certificate at City College.






# Civil Grand Jury Final Response from San Francisco Community College District

Final Audit Report

2021-08-30

Created:	2021-08-30
By:	Grace Esteban (gracesteban@gmail.com)
Status:	Signed
Transaction ID:	CBJCHBCAABAA-1DeuC2-VW8SEBC_pawZk659cXV5SIVP

## "Civil Grand Jury Final Response from San Francisco Community College District" History

-  Document created by Grace Esteban (gracesteban@gmail.com)  
2021-08-30 - 11:32:15 PM GMT - IP address: 73.15.4.172
-  Document emailed to Dianna R. Gonzales (chancellor@ccsf.edu) for signature  
2021-08-30 - 11:32:45 PM GMT
-  Email viewed by Dianna R. Gonzales (chancellor@ccsf.edu)  
2021-08-30 - 11:49:24 PM GMT - IP address: 104.47.73.126
-  Document e-signed by Dianna R. Gonzales (chancellor@ccsf.edu)  
Signature Date: 2021-08-30 - 11:49:44 PM GMT - Time Source: server- IP address: 147.144.3.239
-  Agreement completed.  
2021-08-30 - 11:49:44 PM GMT