

WORKFORCE INVESTMENT SAN FRANCISCO

Local Workforce Investment Board for the City and County of San Francisco

Draft Minutes of The

December 13, 2023

Meeting of the Workforce Investment San Francisco (WISF)

War Memorial Veterans Building, Green Room, 2nd Floor

San Francisco, CA 94102

**WISF
Members
Present**

Sam Rodriguez, Vice-Chair, Rodriguez Strategic Partners, LLC
Vikrum Aiyer, ACLU
Doug Whitney, for Ed Battista, Sutter Health
Bruce Callander, HUB International
Michon Coleman, Hospital Council of Northern & Central California
Charley Lavery, Operating Engineers Local 3
Alex Wong, Kaiser Permanente
Dean Hwu, for President Lynn Mahoney, SFSU
Meaghan Mitchell, San Francisco Standard (remote)

Madison Tam for Matt Dorsey, San Francisco Board of Supervisors
Shamann Walton, San Francisco Board of Supervisors
David Martin, City College of San Francisco (remote)
Jorge Tapia, CA EDD

**WISF
Members
Absent**

Jeanine Cotter, Chair, Luminalt Solar
Tony Delorio, Local Union No. 665
John Doherty, International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers Local 6
Cynthia Gomez, UNITE HERE Local 2 John Doherty, IBEW Local 6
Lori Dunn-Guion, Swinerton
Angela Tamayo, SEIU-UHW
Safiya Miller, Microsoft Corp
Theresa Woo, CA Dept. of Rehabilitation

Nikki Tosiello, Salesforce
Shanell Williams, City College Board of Trustees
Iowayna Peña, San Francisco Giants
Kim Tavaglione, SF Labor Council
Laurie Thomas, Golden Gate Restaurant Association
Ramon Hernandez, Laborers Local 261

**Ohlone Land
Acknowledgement,
Announcements &
Housekeeping
(Discussion
Item)**

Sam Rodriguez, Vice-Chair of WISF, introduced himself and called the meeting to order at 9:07 a.m.

Secretary Iris Rollins (OEWD) opened the meeting by reciting the Ohlone Land Acknowledgement.

**Roll Call
(Discussion
Item)**

Secretary Rollins conducted roll call and announced that a quorum was not present.

Chair's

Vice-Chair Rodriguez thanked WISF members and the general public for attending the hybrid

Welcome
(Discussion Item)

WISF meeting at the War Memorial Green Room and remotely on Zoom. He then invited Supervisor Shamann Walton to share any updates. Supervisor Walton noted that the state was facing a budget deficit of approximately \$68 billion, and that the Governor was not looking for any new spending in 2024 but had made a commitment to baseline spending on health and human service programs.

Adoption of the Agenda
(Action Item)

As a quorum was not present, no action was taken on this item.

Approval of Minutes from September 12, 2023 Meeting
(Action Item)

As a quorum was not present, no action was taken on this item.

Executive Director's Report
(Discussion Item)

Vice-Chair Rodriguez introduced Laurel Arvanitidis, Director of Business Development at OEWD, to provide the Executive Director's Report on behalf of OEWD Executive Director Sarah Dennis Phillips. Director Arvanitidis presented an update on the Roadmap to San Francisco's Future, beginning with explaining why there is significant focus on the Downtown area. She noted that the Downtown area is the engine of San Francisco's economy producing nearly 80% of the City's Gross Domestic Product came from companies in this area. The Downtown and office core was home to 70% of San Francisco jobs prior to the pandemic and accounts for nearly half of the City's sales tax revenue and 95% of business tax revenue. It also offers unique advantages given the transportation network available.

There has been mixed recovery in the Downtown area:

- Office attendance: 42% of pre-pandemic
- Office vacancy rate: 30.4% as of Q3 2023
- Muni ridership: 60% of pre-pandemic
- BART ridership: 37% of pre-pandemic Downtown (43% overall)
- Tenant demand for office space: 5.5 million sq. ft.
- SFO international travel: 97% of pre-pandemic
- SFO domestic travel: 85% of pre-pandemic
- Hotel occupancy: 80% of pre-pandemic

Director Arvanitidis then reviewed the nine strategies of the Roadmap to San Francisco's Future, including:

1. Ensure Downtown is clean, safe, and inviting
2. Attract and retain a diverse range of industries and employers
3. Facilitate new uses and flexibility in buildings
4. Make it easier to start and grow a business
5. Grow and prepare our workforce
6. Transform Downtown into a leading arts, culture, and nightlife destination
7. Enhance public spaces to showcase Downtown
8. Invest in transportation connections
9. Tell our story

Vice-Chair Rodriguez applauded San Francisco for applying effective recovery strategies that are being applied in other cities throughout the world.

Member Aiyer noted that many of the investments seem focused on small businesses and asked if the City is also trying to invite and vet new sectors. Director Arvanitidis replied that artificial intelligence (AI) and climate tech are two industries that the City is trying to attract.

Dean Hwu, designated alternate for Member Mahoney, stated SFSU has challenges with attracting students from abroad. Director Arvanitidis acknowledged that this is the same challenge as attracting foreign business investments.

Member Wong asked about a tax credit being offered to new businesses in the downtown area and whether it applies to existing businesses that wish to open a new location. Director Arvanitidis responded that this is focused on first office leases in San Francisco. It could be an existing business that does not have office space yet, but not for existing businesses to relocate or open a second location in the City. It is limited to office space businesses and not retail establishments.

Member Callander stated that the City has made special concessions for certain businesses in the past such as those in the mid-Market area and asked whether there be other concessions to attract businesses? Director Arvanitidis responded that the priority will be to fill open office spaces rather than a specific industry.

**Workforce
Director's
Report**
*(Discussion
Item)*

Vice-Chair Rodriguez then invited Acting Director Ken Nim to provide the Workforce Director's Report.

Director Nim presented the Workforce Director's Report and highlighted economic indicators. Director Nim shared labor market information provided by the California Employment Development Department for San Francisco County from September 2023, which showed a 3.4% unemployment rate. He then highlighted changes in employment for various industries in comparison to data from December 2019.

Director Nim then shared several community highlights involving OEWD staff and providers, including:

- The CHEF and REACH programs offered by Episcopal Community Services
- Site visits to Inner City Youth and the San Francisco Conservation Corps
- OEWD staff Adrian Owens, Tai Seals-Jackson, and Carmen Towler attending the 52nd Annual Legislative Conference hosted by the Congressional Black Caucus Foundation. The trip was organized by the San Francisco Human Rights Commission and included several dozen staff working through the Dream Keeper initiative.
- A convening of program partners and staff working on the Dream Keeper initiative at the African American Arts & Cultural Center
- Recognition of the regional partnership between OEWD and NOVAworks, representing San Mateo County
- The Community Economic Resilience Fund, a \$5 million planning grant, led by All Home as

the Regional Convener and the Bay Area Good Jobs Partnership for Equity, represented by OEWD, as the Fiscal Agent. The partnership, which includes Labor and community organizations throughout the nine-county region, has recently applied for an additional \$14 million in funding from the California Employment Development Department to further the regional economic planning and workforce initiatives.

- At the last Workforce Alignment Committee meeting in October, the Committee adopted a common definition of Workforce Development and reviewed the results of the 2021-22 Workforce Services Inventory which captures the workforce investment.
- OEWD has submitted a Breaking Barriers grant to continue our investment in our worker cooperatives.
- National Apprenticeship Week took place in November 2023. CityBuild Academy celebrated its 39th graduation event.

Vice-Chair Rodriguez asked if there are aspects of CityBuild that could benefit from AI. Director Nim noted that in the CAPSA program, which focuses on construction professional services, they have piloted training on how to use basic AI tools.

**OEWD
Workforce
Program
Outcomes**
*(Discussion
Item)*

Vice-Chair Rodriguez welcomed Deputy Director Janan Howell and Director of Workforce Strategy Chad Houston to co-present the OEWD Workforce Program Outcomes presentation.

Deputy Director Howell began the presentation by explaining that the data being presented includes investments of local, state, and federal funding. She acknowledged the work of the Data and Performance, Workforce Programs, and CityBuild teams in compiling the data.

Director Howell stated that OEWD's programming includes Adult, Young Adult, Sector, Dream Keeper, and Pilot Programs. Placement rates vary across workforce strategies with sector programming having higher placement rates.

Other highlights shared by Director Howell include:

- Black and African American clients have the highest rate of participation
- Clients ages 25-54 represent half of the participants served. The smallest group served are those under age 18.
- Sector programs represent about 20% of enrollments. Training in these programs is longer in duration and more intensive. The completion rate is 81% and placement rate of 70%.
- Both CityBuild and TechSF initiatives offer pre-apprenticeship opportunities.

Dean Hwu asked about how the placement rate is calculated. Director Howell stated that the placement rate is based on the percentage of those who complete training.

Director Houston began his presentation by reviewing clients served by neighborhood and supervisorial districts. Bayview-Hunters Point has the greatest percentage of workforce participants followed by the Tenderloin district.

The largest number of clients are served through Job Centers with the highest number served through Neighborhood Job Centers located throughout the City.

Director Houston then presented data on Client Placements by Industry and Occupation. Healthcare as an industry grew throughout the pandemic and continues to grow currently.

Director Houston shared data on relief programs offered through Essential Services Hubs through Bay Area Community Resources in partnership with the Latino Task Force, with 9,723 participants served. In addition, 967 participants were served through the Family Relief Fund.

Member Lavery asked how many job centers there are in the City and how many participants are served at each. Director Howell and OEWD Adult Programs Manager Mor Xiong noted that there are 18 with a mix of comprehensive, neighborhood, and specialized centers which focus on specific populations. Data on utilization by job center can be provided at a future meeting.

Vice-Chair Rodriguez noted that it is great that OEWD now has the full picture of data being presented.

Member Tapia noted that there is a high number of enrollments in the Emerging Industries portfolio and asked what this represents. Director Howell replied that Advanced Manufacturing, Transportation, and Appliance Repair are a few of the sector strategies in the Emerging Industries portfolio. OEWD is trying to provide expanded training opportunities beyond the four core sectors of construction, healthcare, hospitality and information/technology.

Member Callander asked if OEWD has the flexibility to grow funding for initiatives that are showing success. Deputy Director Howell noted that OEWD procurements are every four years, and we make a commitment to fund programs for four years based on continued performance. The department seeks additional funds to supplement our core programming.

Vice-Chair Rodriguez asked about the impact of displacement of job seekers in programs. Director Houston stated that OEWD continues to serve those who have been economically displaced and now live outside of the city.

Member Tapia noted that WIOA funding can be used for clients who live outside of San Francisco.

Director Houston stated that the issue of displacement is an excellent topic to bring to the Workforce Alignment Committee.

**Public
Comment on
Non-Agenda
Items**
*(Discussion
Item)*

Vice-Chair Rodriguez opened the meeting for public comment on non-agenda items. Secretary Rollins provided instruction for public comment and shared that those in a virtual space could provide public comment in the chat.

Terri Feeley echoed the Chair's excitement about the data shared. The wage data was most likely average wage. She would be interested in hearing about median wages in the future. Ms. Feeley also asked if there is parallel data available on retention. She noted that some of the placements like those with the San Francisco Conservation Corps are transitional placements

and asked about what retention data is available after exiting a program. OEWD Policy and Planning Manager Glenn Eagleson noted that data available through AB 593 legislation will show retention for clients up to one year after they complete our programs.

Seeing no other comments, Vice-Chair Rodriguez moved to the next agenda item.

Adjournment Vice-Chair Rodriguez thanked members for attending today and adjourned the meeting at
(*Action Item*) 10:45 a.m.

DRAFT