****

Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

**Minutes**Committee on Information Technology Meeting

**Thursday, April 20, 2023**

10:00 am – 12:00 pm

City Hall, Room 305 and WebEx Online Event

**Members**

Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Chair

Linda Gerull, Chief Information Officer, Department of Technology

Michael Makstman, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Sophia Kittler, Director, Mayor’s Office of Innovation

Aaron Peskin, President, Board of Supervisors

Angela Calvillo, Clerk, Board of Supervisors

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Carol Isen, Director, Department of Human Resources

Dr. Grant Colfax, Director, Department of Public Health

Dennis Herrera, General Manager, Public Utilities Commission

Michael Lambert, City Librarian, Public Library

Mary Ellen Carroll, Director, Department of Emergency Management

Ivar Satero, Director, San Francisco International Airport

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director, Municipal Transportation Agency

Trent Rhorer, Executive Director, Human Services Agency

Sheryl Davis, Executive Director, Human Rights Commission

Charles Belle, Public Member

1. **Call to Order by Chair**

Jillian Johnson called the meeting to order at 10:03 AM, provided instruction on making public comment, and conducted the roll call. Jillian Johnson filled in for Carmen Chu as Chair for agenda items 1, 2, and 4.

1. **Roll Call**

Members Present

Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Chair (joined at 10:13am)

Jillian Johnson for City Administrator Carmen Chu (until 10:13am)

Michael Makstman for Linda Gerull, Chief Information Officer, Department of Technology

Damon Daniels for Sophia Kittler, Mayor’s Office of Innovation

Aaron Peskin President, Board of Supervisors (left at 10:30am)

Calvin Yan for Aaron Peskin, President, Board of Supervisors (joined at 10:30am)

Angela Calvillo, Clerk, Board of Supervisors

Todd Rydstrom for Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Kate Howard for Carol Isen, Director, Department of Human Resources

Eric Raffin for Dr. Grant Colfax, Director, Department of Public Health

Jennifer S. Hopkins for Dennis Herrera, General Manager, Public Utilities Commission

Michael Lambert, City Librarian, Public Library

Michelle Geddes for Mary Ellen Carroll, Director, Department of Emergency Management

Ray Ricardo for Ivar Satero, Director, San Francisco International Airport

Lisa Walton for Jeffrey Tumlin, Director, Municipal Transportation Agency

Natalie Toledo for Trent Rhorer, Executive Director, Human Services Agency

COIT Staff

Jillian Johnson

Julia Chrusciel

Danny Thomas Vang

Neil Dandavati

Guests

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Presenters | Attendees |
| Robert MillerSohail WarsiSean CunninghamKarla O’Toole-GabourConnor LoevenValeri Shilov | David PilpelKatie PetrucioneLinda Gerull | Mike CotterCyd HarrellEdward de Asis |

1. **Approval of the Meeting Minutes from February 16, 2023 (Action Item)**

Chair Johnson became aware that though the meeting access information was accurately listed on a pdf of the COIT agenda posted on the website, the direct link on the webpage itself was broken. As such, she called item 4 before calling item 3 to update the website and give public commenters more time to access the meeting before calling for general public comment.

Michael Lambert initiated a motion to approve the minutes with the suggested edit. Eric Raffin seconded. The motion was approved unanimously by Carmen Chu, Michael Makstman, Damon Daniels, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Todd Rydstrom, Kate Howard, Eric Raffin, Jennifer S. Hopkins, Michael Lambert, Michelle Geddes, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, and Natalie Toledo.

Chair Carmen Chu joined at 10:13am.

1. **General Public Comment**

The Chair took public comment.

Public commenter David Pilpel noted a typographical error in the minutes for the February 16 meeting.

1. **Review Surveillance Technology Policy for Municipal Transportation Agency's Camera: Driver Safety Video Analytics (Action Item)**

Robert Miller, Sohail Warsi, and Sean Cunningham presented the Municipal Transportation Agency’s Driver Safety Video Analytics Surveillance Technology Policy and Surveillance Impact Report for review.

There was no public comment.

Kate Howard initiated a motion to approve. Calvin Yan seconded.

The motion was passed unanimously by Carmen Chu, Michael Makstman, Damon Daniels, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Todd Rydstrom, Kate Howard, Eric Raffin, Jennifer S. Hopkins, Michael Lambert, Michelle Geddes, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, and Natalie Toledo.

1. **Review Surveillance Technology Policy for Department of Elections' Social Media Monitoring Technology (Action Item)**

Karla O'Toole-Gabour, Connor Loeven, and Valeri Shilov presented the Department of Elections’ Social Medica Monitoring Surveillance Technology Policy for review.

Ray Ricardo asked what the process is whereby someone could access the data captured by the system. Angela Calvillo asked if a particular platform had been selected. Eric Raffin asked for clarification on the meaning of setting up automated activity to maintain the department’s social media presence during off hours. Carmen Chu commented that the technology in discussion allows for automated posting of content to multiple social media platforms. Todd Rydstrom asked whether the specific use of the technology being discussed represented an entirely new category in the City’s index of records that would need to be tracked and reported. Calvin Yan asked whether any metadata would be collected, that may be subject to Sunshine requests.

Public Commenter David Pilpel noted that he is satisfied that the Department of Elections has established appropriate safeguards for the technology being discussed, and that he would support approving it. He agreed that it is important to consider if this is a new category of uses, particularly because there are a number of departments that will soon introduce social media monitoring technology. He added that it is important to consider whether this technology creates a new category of records that needs to be managed through a retention policy, and whether retained data becomes a City record to which outside entities could request access.

Michael Maktsman initiated a motion to approve the policy. Angela Calvillo seconded. The motion was passed unanimously by Carmen Chu, Michael Makstman, Damon Daniels, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Todd Rydstrom, Kate Howard, Eric Raffin, Jennifer S. Hopkins, Michael Lambert, Michelle Geddes, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, and Natalie Toledo.

President Aaron Peskin left at 10:30am and Calvin Yan assumed his seat.

1. **Approve FY 2023-24 & FY 2024-25 Budget Recommendations (Action Item)**

COIT Director Jillian Johnson presented on behalf of the COIT Budget & Performance Subcommittee.

Angela Calvillo asked whether, given that the Board of Supervisors made a COIT funding request this cycle, she is allowed to vote on this item. Michelle Geddes asked for clarification on the two Department of Emergency Management (DEM) funding requests that may receive funding, depending on the total COIT funding approved by the Mayor’s office. She emphasized the strong citywide need for these two requests to be approved. She noted that, while the projects impact the safety and security of City employees, they more broadly impact the ability of the entire City government to function in the event of a security breach.

Kate Howard thanked COIT Director Jillian Johnson and her team for their work in reviewing applications for COIT funding. City Administrator Carmen Chu thanked Jillian, her team, and the Budget and Performance Subcommittee for their work on reviewing applications.

Public Commenter David Pilpel expressed his support for the funding recommendations presented by the COIT Director. He noted that in some cases, he felt that the recommended funding could shift somewhat between the two budget years. He suggested a report to the Board of Supervisors summarizing which projects were deferred and not funded only due to budget constraints, but which made a strong case.

Carmen Chu expressed the hope that final figures from the Mayor’s office would fall somewhere between the low and high funding scenarios reflected in the recommendations.

Kate Howard initiated a motion to approve the low and high scenario funding recommendations presented. She encouraged the Mayor’s office to fully fund the high scenario to help fund projects proposed by the Department of Emergency Management. The motion was seconded by Calvin Yan. The motion was passed unanimously by Carmen Chu, Michael Makstman, Damon Daniels, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Todd Rydstrom, Kate Howard, Eric Raffin, Jennifer S. Hopkins, Michael Lambert, Michelle Geddes, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, and Natalie Toledo.

1. **Discuss Digital Accessibility Inclusion Standard Compliance and Next Steps for Implementation (Discussion Item)**

Jillian Johnson provided an update to the Committee on progress City Departments have made in complying with the Digital Accessibility and Inclusion Standard.

Carmen Chu acknowledged that attaining compliance on the standard is a big lift for departments and asked what feedback committee members have and how the process is going for them. Ray Ricardo noted that the Airport is engaged and the work is getting done, but that it is a large amount of work and at times a struggle. He noted that SFO will need additional resources to ensure development of a solid and well-designed plan for compliance.

Carmen Chu asked whether it would be helpful for the Committee to share resources available at other departments, to help meet the challenge. Ray Ricardo expressed that it would be helpful for departments to know the resources that are available. Mike Makstman noted that he has begun to see several City departments buying software tools to help meet the standard. He encouraged departments to speak with Cyd Harrell of Digital Services to ensure collaboration and leverage Citywide learnings, before investing in specific tools.

Carmen Chu noted that we have seen several private sector lawsuits in which businesses are being sued for inaccessible websites. She emphasized that COIT members should let her know what help and resources are needed to achieve compliance.

Michael Lambert noted that, in terms of work that has been done to increase accessibility, the library introduced a new, fully accessible site several years back, which was built using the Drupal standard. Jillian Johnson noted that she had done a walk through with the library’s accessibility vendor, to observe audits of the website. Angela Calvillo noted that BOS, despite having an aged website, has always worked to adhere to digital accessibility standards. She recently met with Cyd Harrell to discuss the current standards and expectations for BOS’s new legislative management system, and that BOS will be conducting an audit for both internal and external-facing systems and assessing what needs to be done.

Public Commenter David Pilpel stated that full compliance with the standard a year from now seems like the right priority and noted that the accessibility of the City’s public-facing website is important, specifically keeping content up to date and accessible. He advocated for more consistent content (including budget and org charts) and design across City websites and suggested adding Risk Management and MOD to the internal working group that focuses on digital accessibility.

1. **Chair Update**

There was no update from the chair and no public comment.

1. **CIO Update**

There was no CIO update and no public comment.

1. **Adjournment**

Carmen Chu adjourned the meeting at 11:05 a.m.