Minutes
COIT Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting
City and County of San Francisco

Thursday, June 8, 2023
1:30 PM – 03:30 PM
Webex Online Event

Members
Mike Makstman – Chair, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology
Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services
Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office
Jillian Johnson – Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology
Michelle Littlefield – Chief Data Officer, Data SF and Digital Services
Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

1. Call to Order by Chair

Mike Makstman called the meeting to order at 1:35 PM, provided instruction on how to give public comment, and conducted the roll call.

2. Roll call

Mike Makstman – Chair, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology
Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services
Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office
Jillian Johnson – Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology
Michelle Littlefield – Chief Data Officer, Data SF and Digital Services
Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

COIT Staff
Julia Chrusciel
Danny Thomas Vang

3. General Public Comment

There was no public comment.

4. Approval of Meeting Minutes from March 23, 2023 (Action Item)

There was no public comment.

Jillian Johnson made a motion to approve, Michelle Littlefield seconded.
The minutes were approved by Mike Makstman, Guy Clarke, Mikela Clemmons, Mark de la Rosa, Jillian Johnson, and Michelle Littlefield. Molly Peterson abstained from the vote.

5. Department Updates & Announcements

Jillian Johnson gave an update on Supervisor Rafael Mandelman's request for COIT to work with the Police Department on the use of drones for sideshow activities. Michelle Littlefield announced that the Citywide Data Inventory has been launched.

There was no public comment.

6. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Social Media Monitoring Technology (Action Item)

Jillian Johnson and Julia Chrusciel presented a multidepartmental policy for the use of Social Media Monitoring Technology.

Questions posed by members of the subcommittee include:
- What is the fiscal cost of managing a social media program, as there is a wide variety of estimates across departments? How is the term "fiscal cost" defined?
- What are the savings from the use of the technology? Is it time, staff capacity, etc.?
- Is how we are looking at fiscal cost for this policy different than how we looked at cameras, or other tools that were previously passed through the subcommittee?
- What is the purview of PSAB? Does it extend to a cost-benefit analysis of a piece of technology?
- Is there an opportunity to conduct a user group study on how departments use the tool?
- Is there an opportunity to consolidate costs via a group purchase?
- Is there an opportunity for collaboration between departments on trainings affiliated with this policy?

The following was recommended:
- Standardize the questions and responses surrounding cost estimates across departments, including items such as hours per week throughout the job codes
- Make a clear delineation between "using" the tool and "maintaining" the tool, focus on the time of maintenance
- Clarify the data security section to make clear the concern is not data being made public given this is already public data, but rather how the tool is accessed and used
- Loosen the language surrounding trainings, so that the mechanism of training matches the size of the associated risk
- Create a summary table of total cost of all departments in different categories

The following items have been tabled for a future discussion:

- Explore definitions of how to measure "fiscal cost" and "fiscal monitoring", potential engagement with the Controller's Office and the City Attorney
- Discuss whether there is a need for guidance on the use of technology that is "free", and if there is broader implications for security
- Survey departments on whether they have conducted trainings on the ethical use of technology, rather than the use of the technology itself

There was no public comment.

Mikela Clemmons made a motion to move this item forward with the amended language, Guy Clarke seconded.

The motion was approved by Mike Makstman, Guy Clarke, Mikela Clemmons, Mark de la Rosa, Jillian Johnson, Michelle Littlefield, and Molly Peterson.

7. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 3:08 PM.