Draft Minutes
Committee on Information Technology Meeting

Thursday, April 20, 2023
10:00 am – 12:00 pm
City Hall, Room 305 and WebEx Online Event

Members

Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Chair
Linda Gerull, Chief Information Officer, Department of Technology
Michael Makstman, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology
Sophia Kittler, Director, Mayor's Office of Innovation
Aaron Peskin, President, Board of Supervisors
Angela Calvillo, Clerk, Board of Supervisors
Ben Rosenfield, Controller
Carol Isen, Director, Department of Human Resources
Dr. Grant Colfax, Director, Department of Public Health
Dennis Herrera, General Manager, Public Utilities Commission
Michael Lambert, City Librarian, Public Library
Mary Ellen Carroll, Director, Department of Emergency Management
Ivar Satero, Director, San Francisco International Airport
Jeffrey Tumlin, Director, Municipal Transportation Agency
Trent Rhorer, Executive Director, Human Services Agency
Sheryl Davis, Executive Director, Human Rights Commission
Charles Belle, Public Member

1. Call to Order by Chair

Jillian Johnson called the meeting to order at 10:03 AM, provided instruction on making public comment, and conducted the roll call. Jillian Johnson filled in for Carmen Chu as Chair for agenda items 1, 2, and 4.

2. Roll Call

<u>Members Present</u>

Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Chair (joined at 10:13am)
Jillian Johnson for City Administrator Carmen Chu (until 10:13am)
Michael Makstman for Linda Gerull, Chief Information Officer, Department of Technology
Damon Daniels for Sophia Kittler, Mayor's Office of Innovation
Aaron Peskin President, Board of Supervisors (left at 10:30am)

Calvin Yan for Aaron Peskin, President, Board of Supervisors (joined at 10:30am)
Angela Calvillo, Clerk, Board of Supervisors
Todd Rydstrom for Ben Rosenfield, Controller
Kate Howard for Carol Isen, Director, Department of Human Resources
Eric Raffin for Dr. Grant Colfax, Director, Department of Public Health
Jennifer S. Hopkins for Dennis Herrera, General Manager, Public Utilities Commission
Michael Lambert, City Librarian, Public Library
Michelle Geddes for Mary Ellen Carroll, Director, Department of Emergency Management
Ray Ricardo for Ivar Satero, Director, San Francisco International Airport
Lisa Walton for Jeffrey Tumlin, Director, Municipal Transportation Agency
Natalie Toledo for Trent Rhorer, Executive Director, Human Services Agency

COIT Staff
Jillian Johnson
Julia Chrusciel
Danny Thomas Vang
Neil Dandavati

Guests

Presenters	Attendees	
Robert Miller Sohail Warsi Sean Cunningham Karla O'Toole-Gabour Connor Loeven Valeri Shilov	David Pilpel Katie Petrucione Linda Gerull	Mike Cotter Cyd Harrell Edward de Asis

4. Approval of the Meeting Minutes from February 16, 2023 (Action Item)

Chair Johnson became aware that though the meeting access information was accurately listed on a pdf of the COIT agenda posted on the website, the direct link on the webpage itself was broken. As such, she called item 4 before calling item 3 to update the website and give public commenters more time to access the meeting before calling for general public comment.

Michael Lambert initiated a motion to approve the minutes with the suggested edit. Eric Raffin seconded. The motion was approved unanimously by Carmen Chu, Michael Makstman, Damon Daniels, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Todd Rydstrom, Kate Howard, Eric Raffin, Jennifer S. Hopkins, Michael Lambert, Michelle Geddes, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, and Natalie Toledo.

Chair Carmen Chu joined at 10:13am.

3. General Public Comment

The Chair took public comment.

Public commenter David Pilpel noted a typographical error in the minutes for the February 16 meeting.

5. **Review Surveillance Technology Policy for Municipal Transportation Agency's Camera: Driver Safety Video Analytics (Action Item)**
   Robert Miller, Sohail Warsi, and Sean Cunningham presented the Municipal Transportation Agency's Driver Safety Video Analytics Surveillance Technology Policy and Surveillance Impact Report for review.

   There was no public comment.

   Kate Howard initiated a motion to approve. Calvin Yan seconded.
   The motion was passed unanimously by Carmen Chu, Michael Makstman, Damon Daniels, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Todd Rydstrom, Kate Howard, Eric Raffin, Jennifer S. Hopkins, Michael Lambert, Michelle Geddes, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, and Natalie Toledo.

6. **Review Surveillance Technology Policy for Department of Elections' Social Media Monitoring Technology (Action Item)**

   Karla O'Toole-Gabour, Connor Loeven, and Valeri Shilov presented the Department of Elections' Social Medica Monitoring Surveillance Technology Policy for review.

   Ray Ricardo asked what the process is whereby someone could access the data captured by the system. Angela Calvillo asked if a particular platform had been selected. Eric Raffin asked for clarification on the meaning of setting up automated activity to maintain the department's social media presence during off hours. Carmen Chu commented that the technology in discussion allows for automated posting of content to multiple social media platforms. Todd Rydstrom asked whether the specific use of the technology being discussed represented an entirely new category in the City's index of records that would need to be tracked and reported. Calvin Yan asked whether any metadata would be collected, that may be subject to Sunshine requests.

   Public Commenter David Pilpel noted that he is satisfied that the Department of Elections has established appropriate safeguards for the technology being discussed, and that he would support approving it. He agreed that it is important to consider if this is a new category of uses, particularly because there are a number of departments that will soon introduce social media monitoring technology. He added that it is important to consider whether this technology creates a new category of records that needs to be managed through a retention policy, and whether retained data becomes a City record to which outside entities could request access.

   Michael Maktsman initiated a motion to approve the policy. Angela Calvillo seconded. The motion was passed unanimously by Carmen Chu, Michael Makstman, Damon Daniels, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Todd Rydstrom, Kate Howard, Eric Raffin, Jennifer S. Hopkins, Michael Lambert, Michelle Geddes, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, and Natalie Toledo.

   President Aaron Peskin left at 10:30am and Calvin Yan assumed his seat.

7. Approve FY 2023-24 & FY 2024-25 Budget Recommendations (Action Item)

COIT Director Jillian Johnson presented on behalf of the COIT Budget & Performance Subcommittee.

Angela Calvillo asked whether, given that the Board of Supervisors made a COIT funding request this cycle, she is allowed to vote on this item. Michelle Geddes asked for clarification on the two Department of Emergency Management (DEM) funding requests that may receive funding, depending on the total COIT funding approved by the Mayor's office. She emphasized the strong citywide need for these two requests to be approved. She noted that, while the projects impact the safety and security of City employees, they more broadly impact the ability of the entire City government to function in the event of a security breach.

Kate Howard thanked COIT Director Jillian Johnson and her team for their work in reviewing applications for COIT funding. City Administrator Carmen Chu thanked Jillian, her team, and the Budget and Performance Subcommittee for their work on reviewing applications.

Public Commenter David Pilpel expressed his support for the funding recommendations presented by the COIT Director. He noted that in some cases, he felt that the recommended funding could shift somewhat between the two budget years. He suggested a report to the Board of Supervisors summarizing which projects were deferred and not funded only due to budget constraints, but which made a strong case.

Carmen Chu expressed the hope that final figures from the Mayor's office would fall somewhere between the low and high funding scenarios reflected in the recommendations.

Kate Howard initiated a motion to approve the low and high scenario funding recommendations presented. She encouraged the Mayor's office to fully fund the high scenario to help fund projects proposed by the Department of Emergency Management. The motion was seconded by Calvin Yan. The motion was passed unanimously by Carmen Chu, Michael Makstman, Damon Daniels, Calvin Yan, Angela Calvillo, Todd Rydstrom, Kate Howard, Eric Raffin, Jennifer S. Hopkins, Michael Lambert, Michelle Geddes, Ray Ricardo, Lisa Walton, and Natalie Toledo.

8. Discuss Digital Accessibility Inclusion Standard Compliance and Next Steps for Implementation (Discussion Item)

Jillian Johnson provided an update to the Committee on progress City Departments have made in complying with the Digital Accessibility and Inclusion Standard.

Carmen Chu acknowledged that attaining compliance on the standard is a big lift for departments and asked what feedback committee members have and how the process is going for them. Ray Ricardo noted that the Airport is engaged and the work is getting done, but that it is a large amount of work and at times a struggle. He noted that SFO

will need additional resources to ensure development of a solid and well-designed plan for compliance.

Carmen Chu asked whether it would be helpful for the Committee to share resources available at other departments, to help meet the challenge. Ray Ricardo expressed that it would be helpful for departments to know the resources that are available. Mike Makstman noted that he has begun to see several City departments buying software tools to help meet the standard. He encouraged departments to speak with Cyd Harrell of Digital Services to ensure collaboration and leverage Citywide learnings, before investing in specific tools.

Carmen Chu noted that we have seen several private sector lawsuits in which businesses are being sued for inaccessible websites. She emphasized that COIT members should let her know what help and resources are needed to achieve compliance.

Michael Lambert noted that, in terms of work that has been done to increase accessibility, the library introduced a new, fully accessible site several years back, which was built using the Drupal standard. Jillian Johnson noted that she had done a walk through with the library's accessibility vendor, to observe audits of the website. Angela Calvillo noted that BOS, despite having an aged website, has always worked to adhere to digital accessibility standards. She recently met with Cyd Harrell to discuss the current standards and expectations for BOS's new legislative management system, and that BOS will be conducting an audit for both internal and external-facing systems and assessing what needs to be done.

Public Commenter David Pilpel stated that full compliance with the standard a year from now seems like the right priority and noted that the accessibility of the City's public-facing website is important, specifically keeping content up to date and accessible. He advocated for more consistent content (including budget and org charts) and design across City websites and suggested adding Risk Management and MOD to the internal working group that focuses on digital accessibility.

9. Chair Update

There was no update from the chair and no public comment.

10. CIO Update

There was no CIO update and no public comment.

11. Adjournment

Carmen Chu adjourned the meeting at 11:05 a.m.