
HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

City and County of San Francisco

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

Draft Meeting Minutes

April 27, 2023 5:00 PM

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Karen Clopton, Chairperson
Ann Champion Shaw, Vice-Chairperson
Jayson Johnson, Commissioner
Mark Kelleher, Commissioner
Jason Pellegrini, Commissioner
Leah Pimentel, Commissioner
Irene Yee Riley, Commissioner
Michael Sweet, Commissioner
Joseph Sweiss, Commissioner

Sheryl Evans Davis, EdD
Executive Director

For more information, contact the Commission Secretary at 415-252-2500
Agenda and other information are available on the HRC website: www.sfgov.org/sfhumanrights

Meeting was called to order at 5:12pm.

Ramaytush Ohlone Land Acknowledgement – **Commissioner Riley.**

1. 2:13 CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL OF COMMISSIONERS

Present: Karen Clopton, Ann Champion Shaw, Mark Kelleher, Jayson Johnson, Jason Pellegrini, Leah Pimentel, Irene Yee Riley

Absent: Michael Sweet, Joseph Sweiss

Meeting was called to order with 7 Commissioners present (Commissioner Pimentel arrived at 5:20)

2. 3:06 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT (*Discussion Item*)

Members of the public may address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission’s jurisdiction and are not on today’s agenda.

There was no public comment on this item.

3. 4:01 ADOPTION OF THE MARCH 23, 2023 MEETING MINUTES (*Discussion and Possible Action Item*)

Review and anticipated adoption of minutes from the Commission’s March 23, 2023 meeting.

Public Comment

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment on this item.

COMMISSIONER COMMENT/ACTION

Two minor grammatical amendments were noted: spelling of Commissioner Sweiss’ name on Pg 5, Section 6 under Commissioner Johnson’s comments, and changing Brittne Ford to Brittne Chicuata on Pg5, Section 6 under Chair Clopton’s comments. The minutes were amended.

Motion to adopt March 23, 2023 Meeting minutes as amended: 1st Commissioner Pimentel, 2nd Vice Chair Shaw. Motion carried by unanimous consent.

4. 5:55 OFFICE OF SHARP UPDATE (*Discussion Item*)

In honor of Sexual Assault Awareness Month, the Division will give updates on work and programming around city housing for survivors, safety for youth in schools, and healing for Gender Based Violence (GBV) survivors

Presentation: KellyLou Dunsmore, Director of SHARP, Human Rights Commission

Public Comment

This was item 5 on the agenda, and it was moved up as the speaker was not yet present.

Director Dunsmore presented on the work of the Office of SHARP (Sexual Harassment Assault Response and Prevention), the Gender based violence prevention Division of the Human Rights Commission. She spoke to their mission and addressed a recent event they held, “Triggered Life” that reflected on the impact of sexual trauma on youth. She commented on the great need for mental health professionals in the area of young childhood trauma and the need to interrupt generational family violence. She addressed the City’s resources for housing for persons escaping domestic and family violence, and the 26 recommendations the City’s Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing is reviewing for future implementation of the proposed Community Needs.

SHARP is hosting youth interns over the summer. Four interns are working to promote messaging and communications over social networks. Their work is aimed at reaching school age teens as this is a challenging audience to reach out to. She addressed 32 recommendations SF Unified School District is looking at regarding sexual assault in schools. Lastly, she spoke to SHARP’s monthly Gender Based Violence Prevention (GBVP) meeting that brings together community-based organizations dedicated to addressing issues involving prevention, response, and survivor support of gender-based violence.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment on this item.

COMMISSIONER COMMENT

Vice Chair Shaw: Noted her gratitude for the Triggered Life event she attended. Impressed by attendees present. Asked about recovery and healing and the importance of (costly) professional treatment; she asked if SHARP aids survivors with resources to receive professional care. Director Dunsmore stated they are creating a Resource Guide for survivors. There is a challenge for survivors to find professionals with expertise in this area and SHARP is working with community partners to build a network for survivors to pull from.

Commissioner Pimentel: Asked about the GBVP meeting; how is attendance and what kind of partnerships have come out of that meeting. Director Dunsmore stated the meeting has been running for about 2 ½ years and it has roughly 10-30 people each month; 70 people (organizations) are on the invitation list. Partnerships are coming out of the meeting; she cited the growth of interest around issues at the city high schools.

Commissioner Pellegrini: Asked if budget cuts will impact SHARP’s RFQ’s? Director Dunsmore commented that she was told they would not experience cuts.

Chair Clopton: Noted shortage of shortage of Black psychologists and offered to connect SHARP with Association of Black Psychologists.

Commissioner Johnson: Attended and thanked Director Dunsmore for the Triggered Life event. Noted interest by attendees for more events such as this.

5. **34:21 AAPI HERITAGE MONTH** (*Discussion Item*)

Presentation on AAPI Heritage Month events

Presentation: Claudine Cheng, President, AAPI Heritage Foundation

Public Comment

This was item 4 on the agenda; it was moved to provide time for speaker to arrive

Noted this is the 45th year since Federal legislation and the 9th year for AAPI Heritage month here in San Francisco; it was begun by then Mayor Gavin Newsome. She noted the goal is promote awareness of AAPI culture and history, and to gather communities together and have them get to know each other; to build solidarity. The month is robust and filled with activities and partners including the SF Public Library, the Asian Art Museum Center for Asian American Media are putting together events across the City. Conversations with the HRC around having a rooftop Open House at the Commonwealth Club on May 16. Our kickoff celebration will be Wednesday May 3rd with the AAPI Heritage Awards and Celebration.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment on this item.

COMMISSIONER COMMENT

Commissioner Riley: Received invitation for the May 3rd Awards event and she commented that it was shared with the Commission Secretary who sent it out to the Commissioners; she asked people to sign up early as registration is required.

6. **44:05 SF MTA REPORT ON TRANSIT EQUITY AND SAFETY** (*Discussion Item*)

Presentation by the MTA Equity Team on status of Transit Equity, Access and Service Improvements to Southeast and Southern Neighborhoods, and Rider Safety with focus on girls and women.

Presentation:

Julie Kirschbaum, Transit Director, SFMTA

Kimberly Burrus, Chief Security Officer, SFMTA

Josephine Ayankoya, Racial Equity Officer, Office of Racial Equity & Belonging, SFMTA

Public Comment

Director Kirschbaum began the presentation with discussion on Muni Safety and Equity. She noted gender based harassment, especially toward Black and brown women and girls is an issue on transit systems. Providing safe transportation is their goal. She discussed initiatives that help to address this issue such as “Muni Safe” under the Safety Equity Initiative. They have generated a first phase of their safety plan that created a baseline for rider safety from which to generate metrics and measure success from.

Josephine Ayankoya spoke to care in creating statistics to ensure that the narrative does not criminalize Black and Latino men and boys. Their goal is to engage a wide span of people, adults and youth, from a

broad range of ethnicities. They are working with community specialists to engage people across the city. They are working to learn what they can do to interrupt incidents such as these. Kimberly Burrus spoke to the dissolution of fare inspections during COVID and how SFMTA has shifted from enforcement to compliance. They are deploying fare inspectors equitably across the system and focusing on high volume lines. Data is now being collected to identify ethnicity of persons cited; this will be used to ensure the citation process is equitable.

Director Kirschbaum returned and spoke to investment in routes people use most. SFMTA is focusing on quality of service, not quantity. Regularity and reliability are a focus of theirs. She spoke about the opening of the Van Ness corridor (BRT), increased service on the 49 Route, and the launch of a new customer information system. Downtown travel has changed, and our service focus has shifted from a commuter focused system to a more holistic service plan. Transit repair is being done differently with focused down/repair times rather than spot repairs that proved inefficient and more costly. Lastly, she raised awareness of a funding gap due to flat revenues from parking fees and a state grant that will be spent by July 2024. This gap (\$130mil) if not filled will have an impact on services.

A member of the SFMTA Board, Stephanie Kahina, spoke last regarding her personal experience being raised in the City and her work on the Board. She spoke to challenges of getting Clipper Cards into underserved neighborhoods; the Clipper system/business is not set up for the small business owner and SFMTA is working to find ways to aid getting these cards to people who travel lines that do not take them to a Clipper machine.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment on this item.

COMMISSIONER COMMENT

Vice Chair Shaw: Asked Chief Burrus about the number of incidents on SFMTA; she noted the Chief had said only 26 incidents were reported (system wide). Are they youth, adults? How do you gather statistics? Chief Burrus stated the new infrastructure upgrades (processes and procedures) are allowing for data collection. I do not have data to share now.

Commissioner Johnson: Asked about the “prevention roadmap”; What is being done to address behaviors before they become an issue? SFMTA responded by stating they are focused on what is happening now; they are identifying “frequent fliers” (repeat offenders) and they working with Police to identify them. Asking public to use 311 or SFMTA reporting lines to report incidents.

Commissioner Pimentel: Asked about community engagement and outreach; are there specific nonprofits SFMTA is working with? Chief Burrus noted they are working on their core partnerships. They will convene with Black led, Indigenous led, LatinX led and more to ensure a cross cultural voice is heard. This outreach plan is in the works.

Commissioner Riley: Asked about seniors safety and what is being done to address this; many of the monolingual seniors will not report incidents. Chief Burrus noted reporting is essential to their ability to

address safety issues. Their operators are trained on how to deal with incidents on their lines and SFMTA is working closely with SFPD to address these incidents. SFMTA camera systems are capturing these incidents; still, reporting is essential so investigations can be done effectively.

Chair Clopton: spoke to witnessing a youth being assaulted on a bus. He left the bus bloodied and did not want to stay on the bus for the police to arrive; he just wanted to leave. Chair felt traumatized by the incident, and she is sure many others did too. She also asked about the free ride program for youth 17 and under; does it continue? Chief Burrus noted free Muni for youth still exists and fair compliance is being enforced, however citations can be addressed in other ways than financially. She spoke to MTech program that focuses on youth on school lines. They help deescalate incidents on buses/lines.

Commissioner Riley: Received invitation for the May 3rd Awards event and she commented that it was shared with the Commission Secretary who sent it out to the Commissioners; she asked people to sign up early as registration is required.

Commissioner Johnson: Asked if there was any correlation between bus delays and incidents on the lines. He also asked about updated design; is this being developed with visually impaired in mind. Director Kirschbaum noted there was no data that could corroborate that idea. She noted that even very frequent lines have incidents. Jason Lee, Program Manager for Customer Information stated SFMTA worked to have signage with ADA compliant font, brighter illumination, and push button audible information. They also employed use of Chinese and Spanish characters. They are developing eye level signage (kiosks) so people will not have to look up for information.

Chair Clopton: Asked about Clipper Access. Dana Hammond, Sr Revenue Manager for MTA noted they are in a worse situation now than before COVID and that is due to the closure of Walgreens. Clipper hardware is 20 years old and not developed with the small business owner in mind. New systems are in the works. Some free card and day fare programs are in place to help with the issue. MTA has a mobile sales van. Chair asked about the Sutter St #2 line and Director Kirschbaum noted the line was back in service.

7. **1:55:37 ANNUAL REVIEW OF HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION BYLAWS** (*Discussion and Possible Action Item*)

Presentation: Chair Karen Clopton, San Francisco Human Rights Commission

Public Comment

Secretary McKnight stated this agenda item was publicly (Special Meeting Notice) noticed 14 days prior to the meeting.

Commissioner Pellegrini met with Commissioner Sweet and discussed bylaws, specifically section Article 8 section 3, and then met with Deputy City Attorney Sarah Fabian (in attendance). He recommended the bylaws remain as written and a working group be formed to create a process to accomplish the intent of this section; a simplified process that does not add time to the contract process. The working group would bring the proposed process before the commission when ready. Commissioner Riley volunteered to join the working group and the DCA Fabian will provide assistance to the working group.

Director Davis noted that the addition of Commission approval of contracts/solicitations is not a

mandate; it is not in the charter. HRC is currently a year behind with more than 25 contracts needing to be approved. She hoped that any process added by the Commission does not add another layer to this work. People's business and livelihoods are at risk.

DCA Fabian reminded the Commission that her email addressing specific questions about commission approval of contracts is protected and privileged attorney-client communication. However, she can discuss general principles regarding contract authority.

Chair Clopton: noted Commissioner Pellegrini and the working group will work for a way to assist, simplify, and expedite the contract and solicitation process. There is no current proposal to amend the bylaws at this time. The current bylaw has been in place for 20years. Chair Clopton directed DCA Fabian to look into whether the bylaws would affect prior or pending contracts.

Commissioner Pellegrini noted that the current bylaws are not being followed as written and the purpose of annual review is to ensure the Commission is following the bylaws as written.

Chair Clopton noted the working group will notify the Commission Secretary and Chair when they are ready to present the process and bylaws amendment when ready.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment on this item.

8. 2:16:47 COMMISSIONER ACTIVITIES IN THE COMMUNITY (*Discussion Item*)

Commissioners update the public on activities they have participated in and any upcoming events.

Public Comment

Commissioner Riley attended awards dinner for Mary Jiang who was named Women of the Year by State Senator Scott Weiner. Also attended API Press Conference at City Hall.

Chair Clopton attended Earth Day. Addressed issue of environmental racism; cited waste water plant and Navy pollution in low income neighborhoods and specifically Black neighborhoods. "The impact of environmental injustice, as well as the myriad of social determinants of health that affect Black San Franciscans has significantly shorten the lifespan of this racial group as compared with other San Franciscans."

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment on this item.

9. 2:22:31 ADJOURNMENT Meeting adjourned at 7:33 pm.

Motion to Adjourn: 1st Commissioner Riley, 2nd Vice Chair Aquino

Transcription of the meeting minutes are available upon request to the Commission Secretary, john.mcknight@sfgov.org.