Draft Minutes
COIT Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting
City and County of San Francisco

Friday, January 27, 2023
9:00 am – 11:00 am
Webex Online Event

Members
Mike Makstman – Chair, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology
Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services
Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office
Jillian Johnson – Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology
Michelle Littlefield – Chief Data Officer, Data SF and Digital Services
Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

1. Call to Order by Chair

Mike Makstman called the meeting to order at 9:03 AM, provided instruction on how to give public comment, and conducted the roll call.

2. Roll call

Mike Makstman – Chair, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology
Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services
Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office
Jillian Johnson – Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology
Michelle Littlefield – Chief Data Officer, Data SF and Digital Services
Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

COIT Staff
Danny Thomas Vang

3. General Public Comment

There was no public comment.

4. Approval of the Consent Agenda (Action Item)
    4.1   Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings under California Government Code Section 54953(e)
    4.2   Approval of Meeting Minutes from December 9, 2022

There was no public comment.

Jillian Johnson made a motion to approve the consent agenda, Guy Clarke seconded.
All members approved the motion, except Molly Peterson who abstained from the vote.

5. Department Updates & Announcements

Jillian Johnson introduced Molly Peterson as a new member of the board, announced that teleconference meetings will end starting in March 2023, and reported that the full board asked the Police Department to make updates on their memo about their previous incidents requesting facial recognition data from external entities.

There was no public comment.

6. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: RFID – Toll Readers (Action Item)

Guy Clarke and Eugene Chang presented their policy for the ongoing use of:
- Airport: Electronic Toll Readers

Mikela Clemmons, Jillian Johnson, and Mike Makstman suggested the following:
- Include language in the notification section of the policy about how there is financial transaction signage in the fast-track lanes
- Include language about internal sharing provisions and external law enforcement
- Clarify how customers have to opt in (as an additional step) before their tag is scanned by readers
- Note that the department has a contract with the Bay Area Toll Authority governing the collection of the data

No public comment was given.

Jillian Johnson made a motion to move this item forward with the suggested changes, Michelle Littlefield seconded.
All members approved the motion, except Guy Clarke who abstained from the vote.

7. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Security Cameras (Action Item)

Ariana Luchsinger, Rohan Lane, and Virginia Donohue presented their policy for the ongoing use of:
- Animal Care & Control: Security Cameras with CCTV software

Jillian Johnson, Guy Clarke, and Mikela Clemmons recommended the following:
- Use existing language about four use cases that have been authorized in previous security camera policies to standardize across departments
- Clarify that the entire department can see live footage on an "incidental basis" because the monitors are in an area accessible by employees; however, the recordings are only accessible to the listed positions
- Insert language about where there is signage informing members of the public about the security cameras (two lobbies)
- Think of potential ways to add signage on the exterior of the building, without damaging the integrity of the architecture

No public comment was given.

Jillian Johnson made a motion to move this item forward with the suggested changes, Guy Clarke seconded.
All members approved the motion, except Molly Peterson who abstained from the vote.

8. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Cameras, Non-Security (Action Item)

Sohail Warsi, Sean Cunningham, and Ray Shine presented their policy for the ongoing use of:
- Municipal Transportation Agency: Driver-Safety Video Analytics

Guy Clarke, Mikela Clemmons, Molly Peterson, and Jillian Johnson asked for clarification on the following questions. Follow-up information will be collected by the department.
- Does the vendor use our standard encryption and security practices?
- Does the vendor have the ability to actively view live footage without a trigger? If not, do we have contract language stating that the vendor cannot do so with future software updates?
- How much footage (percentage/hours/minutes) is uploaded to the cloud and accessible by the vendor?
- Do we have language about the retention policy and practices of the vendor surrounding the uploaded footage? What are our provisions for the protection of this data?
- How long is the buffer for the local recording before footage is overridden, and how is this information stored (SD/memory)?
- Can you provide additional details on other jurisdictions and their practices?

There was no public comment.
The chair continued the item to the February PSAB Meeting.

9. **Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Data Forensics Technology (Action Item)**

The following department will be presenting its policy for the ongoing use of:
- Police Department: Data Extraction Tool for Computers and Cell Phones

The chair continued to item to the February PSAB Meeting due to a scheduling conflict with the Police Department.

10. **Adjournment**
The meeting adjourned at 10:55 AM.