

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SAN FRANCISCO POLICE DEPARTMENT

-----  
In Re: )  
DGO 9.01 "Traffic Enforcement" )  
Working Group Meeting )  
-----

AUDIO TRANSCRIPTION OF  
WORKING GROUP MEETING  
TUESDAY, AUGUST 2, 2022  
FILE NO. DGO 9.01 WG RECORDING 8.2.22

BEHMKE REPORTING AND VIDEO SERVICES, INC.  
BY: CONNIE J. PARCHMAN, RPR, CRR, CSR NO. 12918  
455 MARKET STREET, SUITE 970  
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94105  
(415) 597-5600

1 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL:  
2 Brian Cox - Public Defender  
3 Julie Traun - BAR Association  
4 Rome Jones - Community Member  
5 Wes Saver - GLIDE Organization  
6 Janelle Caywood - DPA  
7 Avi Frey - ACLU  
8 Nick Buckley - Sergeant with Pride  
9 Jermain Jones - DPA  
10 Brian Kneuker - Officer Asian Police Officer's  
11 Association  
12 Tracy McCray - President of the POA  
13 Haven Latimore - Officer  
14 Eleni Balakrishnan - Reporter for Mission Local  
15 Maria Alvarado - Latin Police Officer's Association  
16 Donald Luu - Chinese Chamber of Commerce  
17 Kevin Benedicto - Commissioner  
18 Cindy Elias - Commissioner  
19 Max Carter-Oberstone - Commissioner  
20 Diana Oliva-Aroche - SFPD  
21 Adam Plantinga - Sergeant  
22 Sondra Reynolds - Commission Office  
23 Denise Flaherty - Deputy Chief  
24 William Scott - Chief of Police  
25 David Lazar - Assistant Chief

1 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL (CONTINUED):

2 Paul Yep - Commander

3 Asja Steeves - SFPD

4 Doctor James Taylor - Community Member

5 Crispin Jones - Officer SFPD

6 Michael Koniaris - Lieutenant SFPD

7 Nicole Jones - Commander SFPD

8 Phelicia Jones - Wealth and Disparities in the Black  
9 Community Organization

10 Angela Jenkins - Community Member

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 (Begin Transcription 00:00:01 - 02:02:14)

2  
3 ---oOo---

4 SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: Good morning everybody,  
5 the chair has called the meeting to order.

6 If I could just remind everybody that we are  
7 recording this. The recorder is in the middle. Because  
8 everybody has masks on, if you could please project and  
9 not try to talk over each other as well.

10 And we are going to Line Item Number 1,  
11 introductions.

12 THE CHAIR: Great. Well, welcome, everyone, to  
13 the first working group session for DGO 9.01. It's great  
14 to see so many people who I, at this point, only met over  
15 the phone or Zoom. It's great to see you in the flesh.

16 And for all of those who I haven't had the  
17 chance to work with, I know I speak for everyone, I  
18 really look forward to collaborating together on this  
19 important undertaking.

20 I glanced at the invite list and those who are  
21 (inaudible) last night I think it's safe to say that this  
22 group is filled with people from very diverse  
23 backgrounds, with very different areas of expertise.

24 But I know that we all believe in making  
25 San Francisco a safer place to live. And a safer place

1 to work. And in having policies that ensure that all  
2 San Franciscans are treated equally, regardless of race,  
3 and other demographic traits.

4 Over the course of these working group  
5 meetings, I know we'll all learn a tremendous amount from  
6 each other. And I have full confidence that every single  
7 person in this working group and every single  
8 organization represented here will make significant  
9 contributions that will help to shape the ultimate  
10 recommendations that go to the Commission on this policy.

11 So the first thing I want to do is just say  
12 thank you to everyone here for taking time out of your  
13 day to engage this important work and assist the  
14 Commission and to bring all of your experience to bear on  
15 this important project.

16 I think the goal for today is relatively  
17 limited. We want to make sure that we do introductions  
18 so that everybody in the room knows who everybody else in  
19 the room is.

20 We're also going to go over kind of basic  
21 logistics about how the working group will function going  
22 forward.

23 And then we'll have some time at the end for  
24 some brief substantive engagement.

25 The last thing I want to say before turning it

1 over to others to introduce themselves, is that it was  
2 very important to me, I know it was very important to  
3 others as well from the start, that this DGO be as  
4 publicly transparent as possible. That's why we had a  
5 draft of the DGO at the earliest moment available to the  
6 public.

7 That's why this working group is also open to  
8 the public.

9 And that's why these working groups are just  
10 one of three principal avenues to allow the public to  
11 engage in this process.

12 So, I'll get to scheduling after bit later.  
13 But we are going to have one more working group meeting  
14 this month. And then we're going to pause working groups  
15 for the month of September because the Human Rights  
16 Commission has graciously agreed to spearhead our  
17 community outreach efforts. They have scheduled and  
18 planned and will carry out many events throughout the  
19 month of September where they will go out into the  
20 communities where people live and hear directly from them  
21 how they feel about this policy and solicit their views  
22 and input.

23 We will then resume working groups in October  
24 so that this group can have the benefit of all of the  
25 feedback that we got from the community and to ensure

1 that this policy reflects the concerns and needs of the  
2 populations that it will affect.

3 Lastly, I'll just say the third avenue for  
4 public participation has been opening this up for public  
5 comment since the draft was introduced. We received  
6 dozens and dozens of letters from interested members of  
7 the public who provided really helpful and I think  
8 insightful feedback on the DGO's specific comments.  
9 Sometimes specific items that I think were really well  
10 taken by everyone.

11 And all of that feedback will also be compiled  
12 and will also be utilized by the Commission in terms of  
13 making its ultimate decision about how to proceed with  
14 this policy.

15 So, with that, I will turn it over to some  
16 folks also to do some brief introductions.

17 I would ask if people would just keep it brief  
18 because we do have a pretty substantial agenda today.

19 So I will start with the vice-president, elect.  
20 If you would introduce yourself.

21 CINDY ELIAS: Thank you. Welcome everyone. My  
22 name is Cindy Elias and I've been on the Police  
23 Commission since 2015. I'm really happy all of you are  
24 here.

25 As my colleague said, this is one of many areas

1 that we hope to reach and get input from. Both visa all  
2 of you in the room, but also the community as large. So  
3 we're really excited to get this ball in motion and get  
4 this thing going.

5 THE CHAIR: Commissioner Benedicto.

6 KEVIN BENEDICTO: Good morning, everyone. My  
7 name is Kevin Benedicto, and I'm also a member of the  
8 San Francisco Police Commission.

9 I'll echo Commissioner Carter-Oberstone's  
10 welcome and thank you to all of you. And to say that  
11 I've sat in room and worked on the DGOs since 2015  
12 (inaudible).

13 I see some familiar faces around the room. I  
14 can definitely echo what Commissioner Carter-Oberstone  
15 said about the transparency of this process is among the  
16 most that we've had for DGOs.

17 And I'm really looking forward to working with  
18 this group to craft the best policy for the department  
19 and the civilians.

20 THE CHAIR: Chief?

21 CHIEF SCOTT: Thank you. Can I get a couple  
22 extra minutes to give some context as to what the  
23 department has done to bring us to this moment.

24 Thank you, everybody. Thanks for being here.

25 So, first of all, I want to thank commissioners



1 and everybody who has gotten us to this point.

2 We've got a lot of work to do. I'm not going  
3 to be long-winded, but I do want to give some context to  
4 the San Francisco Police Department's commitment to this  
5 work and what we have done to get here.

6 These conversations didn't just start, as you  
7 all know. Many of you have engaged in this conversation  
8 for many, many years and have been pushing the envelope  
9 and pushing the view on what can we do to change the  
10 narrative of the disparity issue in this city?

11 This is not just a 2022 or 2015 or 2019  
12 (inaudible). These issues have been happening for long,  
13 long time.

14 And one of the things that we have done in the  
15 department to help prepare for of this conversation is  
16 really put some context on this issue.

17 And what I mean by that is really getting a  
18 thorough understanding of the historical struggles that  
19 have gotten us here.

20 And I want to spend some time -- just a little  
21 bit of time. I know we are have all day to do this, but  
22 about a year ago this department started a conversation,  
23 or series of conversations, on racial reconciliation,  
24 leading -- to lead up to this moment.

25 And really what that was about for us is

1 putting it all on the table. These are very difficult  
2 conversations to have because race is one of these  
3 subjects that we have never been collectively able to  
4 talk about and in an honest way.

5 How can we address an issue that has race  
6 through the center of it if we can't even talk about the  
7 issues that got us here? I think we're not going to be  
8 successful if we don't do that. And internally, that has  
9 been a challenge for us.

10 So what we've done is we've created a structure  
11 to really have these conversations. And we (inaudible)  
12 the policy conversations in these discussions over the  
13 past almost year.

14 I can do this. I just want to show some of the  
15 work that has led up to this. And it really has --  
16 took -- a lot of the officers here have been part of  
17 these conversations and that's why they're here today.

18 So -- okay. Okay. So we're going to do that  
19 at the end, I'm told, which is fine with me.

20 I hope that you all are able to stick around to  
21 kind of see. Because I think it does put into context  
22 what the commitment is. We know this is going to be  
23 difficult and some -- some might even say controversial  
24 to attack these issues and we are committed to doing  
25 that.

1           We may not always agree on how we move forward.  
2           But we're going to move forward and that is our  
3           commitment.

4           So with that, we will -- (inaudible).

5           THE CHAIR: Thank you, Chief Scott.

6           I would have introduced next Alice Kassinger  
7           from the controller's office who's going to help  
8           facilitate and moderate our discussions. Unfortunately  
9           there was confusion. She's not able to make it today,  
10          but she will be here for future meetings.

11          Deputy City Attorney Alicia Cabrera, id you  
12          want to say a few words about the public meeting laws?

13          ALICIA CABRERA: Absolutely. Thank you. I'm  
14          Alicia Cabrera, Deputy City Attorney. I've been with the  
15          office over 15 years. General counsel to the Police  
16          Department and Police Commission.

17          I want to make sure everybody in the room  
18          understands, especially if you're part of this working  
19          group, what your obligations are. This is essentially a  
20          working group that was created by the Commission as an  
21          official act.

22          What that means is that all the things that you  
23          see at the Police Commission will happen here as well.  
24          You have the tape recording. You have minutes. We're  
25          also going to have public records. Open meetings.

1           What that means is the working group should not  
2 have discussions outside of the working group place in  
3 which you guys are meeting.

4           So everything that happens is public. It's a  
5 public meeting, (inaudible) to be able to participate.  
6 You need to have an agenda and the public gets to give  
7 their public comments.

8           Along with public records, that means that any  
9 work that you do on behalf of this working group is  
10 subject to public records. It's subject to inspection.

11           We will ask for it if we receive a public  
12 records request and it is your obligation to provide it  
13 to Commission staff and we will disseminate it subject to  
14 redactions.

15           Are there any questions about --

16           Yes?

17           PHELICIA JONES: Okay. So, my -- my  
18 organization is going to be part of this group. Whether  
19 I'm going to be at the meetings all the time, I don't  
20 know about that.

21           But, however, if I want to go back to my  
22 community and talk about this issue, you're saying that  
23 it has to be a public record?

24           ALICIA CABRERA: So any communications you have  
25 about the work here and this working group is subject to

1 public records. So any communications about that.

2 Now, if you go back to your community  
3 organization and you provide that information, I'm not  
4 saying that you cannot do that. I'm not saying that  
5 needs to be in a public forum.

6 What I'm saying is those communications will  
7 also be subject to public record.

8 PHELICIA JONES: Well, I don't know about that.  
9 If you're going to have a community group and especially  
10 with Cheryl Davis as the director who is moving to start  
11 community sessions, so all of that is going to be a  
12 public record?

13 ALICIA CABRERA: That's what a public what a --

14 PHELICIA JONES: I okay --

15 ALICIA CABRERA: No, my job is to give advice  
16 on public records. So this is exactly what my job is.

17 And so, as if you're part of the working group  
18 and I will defer to the Commission whether or not that is  
19 the case, then it will be subject to public records and  
20 we will ask for it.

21 PHELICIA JONES: Okay. So that's not my  
22 question.

23 My question is, when Cheryl Davis begins the  
24 community working sessions -- which I don't understand  
25 why you're having this before you have the working

1 sessions -- you're saying to me, and everyone in here,  
2 those working sessions are public record?

3 ALICIA CABRERA: Commissioner, I'm not entirely  
4 clear (inaudible.)

5 THE CHAIR: I think -- you can correct me if  
6 I'm wrong -- I think the answer is no. The town halls  
7 and listening sessions that the Human Rights Commission  
8 will do separately that aren't part of these meetings,  
9 where they're just holding events, I would imagine would  
10 not be subject.

11 But --

12 ALICIA CABRERA: Can you just tell me one  
13 thing, if they're open to the events, isn't the public  
14 going to be there? Isn't there going to be a public --

15 So yes, that will be open to the public and  
16 anyone is invited to attend; is that correct?

17 THE CHAIR: That's correct.

18 ALICIA CABRERA: So that would be open meeting,  
19 so that would be anybody is invited to attend, people can  
20 come and they can --

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And is there an issue  
22 with establishing a quorum and --

23 ALICIA CABRERA: No, no. Not with the  
24 listening -- (inaudible.)

25 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you, so much,

1 Ms. Cabrera.

2 I think we're now going endeavor to have  
3 everyone in this room introduce themselves, which is  
4 going to be no (inaudible) but I have faith in us.

5 So maybe we can start with Commander Yep and go  
6 around the table, including the folks sitting behind the  
7 table. And then we'll snake through the audience before  
8 coming back along this table side of the table.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Maybe we let the  
10 assistant chief go first?

11 ASSISTANT CHIEF LAZAR: Okay. Good morning,  
12 everyone. This is Assistant Chief David Lazar. I  
13 oversee operations. That means field operations, all of  
14 patrol, investigations, special operations, and the  
15 airport.

16 I really want to thank the community for being  
17 here today and for the officers that we selected to be  
18 part of this important process.

19 DEPUTY CHIEF FLAHERTY: Good morning. I'm  
20 Deputy Chief Denise Flaherty. I'm the acting assistant  
21 chief, chief of staff.

22 ANGELA CHAN: Good morning. I'm Angela Chan.  
23 I'm chief of policy at the San Francisco public  
24 defender's office. And I'm pleased to serve on the  
25 Police Commission. So I'm excited to see this working

1 group get started.

2 And I've also been involved in a number of  
3 different public general (inaudible) working groups.

4 COMMANDER YEP: So I'm commander Paul Yep. Hi,  
5 everyone. I'm currently in the risk management office.  
6 I've been with the police department 26 years. And I  
7 thank you for being here and very much look forward to  
8 working on these problems.

9 Thank you.

10 TRACY MC CRAY: Hello, everyone. Tracy McCray.  
11 I'm the president of San Francisco Police Officers  
12 Association. Very thankful to have this (inaudible)  
13 because once this policy gets going, I would rather see  
14 all the kinks kind of worked out before it hits us with  
15 meet and confer.

16 As you all know, I'm a native of San Francisco.  
17 I have a family that lives in the 94124 area. I grew up  
18 in the Western Addition. I think I could be one of the  
19 few people in this room who have said they've been  
20 stopped by the police in a traffic stop prior to becoming  
21 a police officer and when I was a police officer.

22 So, yes, this is going to be a very interesting  
23 working group. I appreciate all the dialogue from not  
24 only my fellow officers that I have sitting here, but the  
25 community members.



1           So yes, we can get a policy that our officers  
2 understand, very little gray area so we know what we can  
3 and cannot do.

4           So, of course, all meetings start off a bang.  
5 So let's just get it going and let's just get a policy,  
6 because the sooner we can get this going, the better it  
7 will be for our officers.

8           AVI FREY: My name is Avi Frey. I'm an  
9 attorney with the ACLU of Northern California where I'm  
10 the Deputy Director of the criminal program.

11           ACLU is very excited to be here and reach this  
12 point and excited to hear the POA talk about removing the  
13 gray area and I think discretion is one of the issues  
14 here that we're concerned about.

15           Thank you.

16           WESLEY SAVER: My name is Wesley Saver, I use  
17 he/him pronouns. I'm the Senior Policy Manager from the  
18 GLIDE Center for Social Justice and I am here  
19 representing the Coalition to End Biased Stops which  
20 consists of 60 community-based organizations in support  
21 of this process.

22           I want to thank the chief. I want to thank the  
23 Department of Police Accountability, the Commission, POA,  
24 (inaudible) for making this commitment to be here today  
25 and all the community members that have showed up. And

1 also especially the advocacy of Wealth and Disparities in  
2 the Black Community who have been pushing for this for  
3 quite some time.

4 Thank you.

5 DOCTOR JAMES TAYLOR: My name is James Taylor,  
6 I'm a professor of politics at USF. I'm on the  
7 San Francisco reparations committee.

8 I've done a bit of (inaudible) with Chief Scott  
9 and Assistant Chief Lazar (inaudible) task force,  
10 including the town hall conversations around the city  
11 about tasers, when there was a conversation in the city.

12 And more recently, before Theresa (inaudible)  
13 left, she had me serve as a referee for the bias  
14 contingent plan. So that (inaudible) one of the projects  
15 I changed the total name of it. Changed it to minimizing  
16 bias, and that got back to them as bias free.

17 So that's my work.

18 ANGELA JENKINS: My name is Angela Jenkins and  
19 I've attended about three different working groups since  
20 2017 (inaudible). And I am hoping to be as bold as  
21 Phelicia and insist that we have information and  
22 representation from the Black community.

23 Thank you.

24 BRIAN COX: I'm Brian Cox, Deputy Public  
25 Defender at the San Francisco Public Defender's office

1 and excited to be here and continue this work.

2 I also want to thank Chief Scott for his words.  
3 I think it's important to focus on the history of  
4 policing and how we got here.

5 (Inaudible.) Where we are right now is a  
6 function of (inaudible). In 2022, I think it's a  
7 function of (inaudible) so we have to recognize that  
8 (inaudible) and throughly to address it.

9 So I'm excited for that work and I'm excited to  
10 knock heads (inaudible) policy.

11 CRISPIN JONES: My name is Crispin Jones. I've  
12 been with the police department for 14 years. I've been  
13 a police officer for 24 years. The last seven of which  
14 have been in the traffic company.

15 I'm a motorcycle police officer. I'm also the  
16 lead instructor at the police academy on traffic  
17 enforcement and D.U.I. enforcement.

18 I currently -- or previously wrote a version of  
19 DGO 9.01 that went to concurrence and I'm here to give my  
20 input on how we go forward with this process.

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible) I work at  
22 professional standards unit (inaudible) warrants and I'm  
23 taking the minutes. Thank you for being here.

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm Sergeant  
25 (inaudible). I'm happy to be here. And work (inaudible)

1 unit.

2 And I'm also a native of San Francisco and I'm  
3 happy that we're going to work together to get something  
4 done here.

5 ERIC HOLTZ: Hey, good afternoon, my name is  
6 Eric Holtz, from the community officer (inaudible) unit  
7 of professional standards (inaudible) that has the  
8 written directives under the umbrella.

9 So I really look forward to some really robust  
10 conversations and the implementation of a policy that's  
11 going to be appreciated, not only by the community, but  
12 by our police officers (inaudible).

13 So thank you everybody for being here.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Zach Tom (phonetic),  
15 Public Defender's office.

16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Lidia (phonetic)  
17 (inaudible), Public Defender's Office.

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible), from the  
19 Public Defender's Office.

20 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible), special  
21 projects.

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible) of the  
23 Public Defender's Office.

24 JERMAIN JONES: Jermain Jones, DPA.

25 HAVEN LATIMORE: Haven Latimore, Central

1 Station, patrol.

2 LIEUTENANT MICHAEL KONIARIS: Lieutenant Mike  
3 Koniaris, Northern Police Station, patrol.

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Officer (inaudible),  
5 Northern Station, patrol.

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Officer Steven Larango  
7 (phonetic), Northern Station, patrol.

8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Gabe Rivera (phonetic),  
9 acting lieutenant (inaudible) for the professional  
10 standards unit.

11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible) Special  
12 assistant to (inaudible.)

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Captain McEachern of the  
14 Mission Police Station. I've been a police officer in  
15 San Francisco for 32 years.

16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible).

17 DAVID AARONSON: David Aaronson (phonetic),  
18 Wealth and Disparaties in the Black Community.

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Lieutenant (inaudible)  
20 Office of Operations.

21 MARIA ALVARADO: Officer Maria Alvarado, I work  
22 at Ingleside. I'm also the LPOA vice president. Native  
23 San Franciscan.

24 DIANA OLIVA-AROCHE: Good morning, everyone, my  
25 name is Diana Oliva-Aroche. I'm the Director of Policy

1 and Public Affairs (inaudible) San Francisco Police  
2 Department.

3 I'll be working closely with group here. And  
4 I'm excited to see (inaudible) changes when it comes to  
5 stops.

6 DONALD LUU: Hi, my name is Donald Luu. I'm  
7 the President of the Chinatown Chamber of Commerce and  
8 also a board member of the Chinese Hospital.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible), Mission  
10 Station, patrol.

11 PHELICIA JONES: My name is Phelicia Jones.  
12 I'm founder of Wealth and Disparities in Black Community.

13 I'm an unapologetic strong, Black woman. I  
14 pull no punches. I say what I need to say, how I need to  
15 say it. I don't condone anti-Blackness.

16 And when we talk about traffic stops, it has to  
17 be centered around Black people, Black San Franciscans,  
18 because we are 34 percent of all stops. We have  
19 30 percent of all reasonable suspicion when it comes to  
20 stops. And we're five times that of whites to be  
21 stopped.

22 And so -- and what happens is that that leads  
23 to arrest, which is -- we're 16 times that of whites to  
24 be arrested.

25 So I sit here representing Black

1 San Franciscans in the community.

2 And for those of you who can -- want to try to  
3 tell me what to say and how to say it to my community,  
4 who's been disenfranchised, marginalized, for over 56  
5 years in San Francisco, I'm telling you, that's not going  
6 to work with me.

7 Thank you.

8 JANELLE CAYWOOD: Good morning. I'm Janelle  
9 Caywood. I'm the Director of Policy for the Department  
10 of Police Accountability.

11 We're happy to get this ball rolling as well.  
12 My colleague Jermaine Johnson (phonetic) and I have been  
13 working on pretext stops since the beginning of 2021. So  
14 we're thrilled to be here. Thank you.

15 SERGEANT BRIAN KNEUKER: Good morning, all.  
16 Sergeant Brian Kneucker of the San Francisco Police  
17 Department. Vice president of the San Francisco Asia  
18 Peace Officers Association. Also a native and currently  
19 still living in San Francisco.

20 SERGEANT NICHOLAS BUCKLEY: Sergeant Nicholas  
21 Buckley I work out of Bay View as a patrol Sergeant. And  
22 I'm the president of (inaudible.)

23 COMMANDER NICOLE JONES: Nicole Jones,  
24 Commander of SFPD Administrative Bureau.

25 THE COURT: I'm Catherine McGuire, Executive

1 Director of the Strategic Management Bureau.

2 I've been with the department -- in and around  
3 the department for 17 years. Worked with every chief  
4 since Heather Fong. And I've done a number of different  
5 community -- a number of community engagement activities  
6 and engagement with community on a variety of topics.

7 And my bureau includes finance, technology, and  
8 standards.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Hello my name is Bob  
10 Krinsky (phonetic). I am a 30-year resident of the city  
11 here in San Francisco.

12 I'm really here simply as an engaged citizen.  
13 My life has touched the department in a couple of ways  
14 over the years. I came up with an idea to adopt a police  
15 car to get defibrillators in all the cars years back  
16 because that was an important thing to me personally.

17 I also professionally do healthcare strategy  
18 consulting.

19 I've supported a meeting that was looking at  
20 community engagement and trying to facilitate more of a  
21 three-year vision for the department with the community.

22 And lastly I participated in a taser  
23 discussion.

24 So, I'll just say what I think and participate  
25 right along with the room.



1           JULIE TRAUN: Hi, my name is Julie Traun. I've  
2 got at least ten years of residency in San Francisco  
3 (inaudible) youth.

4           Mission District I guess is my station.

5           I'm here from the Bar Association of  
6 San Francisco. I've done a lot of work on a lot of  
7 community working groups. I started with use of force in  
8 this room in 2016. I ended up with a lot of hours in  
9 this room with Mike Nevin (phonetic) and (inaudible) from  
10 the POA negotiating the last version of that.

11           It turned out to be, you know, kind of a model  
12 for the rest of the state. So I'm proud of a lot of the  
13 work that we've done.

14           I also worked on community policing with --  
15 let's see -- AC, I can't -- you guys are changing so  
16 fast.

17           (Laughter; inaudible comments.)

18           JULIE TRAUN: And we did amazing work on bias  
19 in this room as well. And yet we are still looking at  
20 racial disparities that are completely unacceptable.

21           So I'm happy to be here and to help and to  
22 leverage the strength of the Bar Association in any way  
23 that we can.

24           Also I'm the Director of the Court Program, so  
25 we represent three percent of all the indigent clients

1 coming into court when the Public Defender has a conflict  
2 of interest. Forty percent are in youth and juvenile  
3 delinquency court.

4 Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, everyone. And I should  
6 also say, this meeting could not be possible without all  
7 of the hard work and diligence of our Commission staff.

8 Sergeant Youngblood and Reynolds, do you want  
9 to introduce yourselves?

10 SERGEANT STACY YOUNGBLOOD: My name is Sergeant  
11 Stacy Youngblood. I am the Police Commission Secretary.

12 SONDRA REYNOLDS: Good morning, my name is  
13 Sergeant Sondra Reynolds and I'm part of the Police  
14 Commission staff.

15 (Inaudible discussion.)

16 THE CHAIR: Also just want to thank Theresa  
17 Tomlin (phonetic) for all of her hard work on this as  
18 well.

19 I think that Alice Kassinger from the  
20 Controller's Office has joined us.

21 Do you want to introduce yourself and say a few  
22 brief words about the Controller's office being here?

23 ALICE KASSINGER: Absolutely. I'm soft spoken  
24 so I will stand up. But it's nice to meet you all.

25 I'm representing the Controller's Office here

1 today city (inaudible) for those of you who aren't  
2 familiar with us, you may be familiar with our sister  
3 group, (inaudible).

4 We have many years of experience promoting  
5 efficiency and effectiveness in the government. And so  
6 that's taken the role of facilitating a lot of working  
7 groups inside and outside of the public safety realm.

8 So I'm really looking forward to learning more  
9 about how and if we can help you guys and bring our  
10 expertise in that area facilitation and agendizing  
11 (inaudible) around the table.

12 Thank you guys.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you everyone.

14 Sergeant, can we take public comment?

15 SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: If anybody would like to  
16 make a public comment regarding line item one, we have --  
17 due to the constraints, we are going to provide one  
18 minute for public comment for those who are not on the  
19 working group.

20 If you would like to make public comment,  
21 please raise your hand.

22 Ms. Jones?

23 PHELICIA JONES: Yes, so public comment is that  
24 I just want to say that I'm very disappointed in the  
25 makeup of the room, even though it has a lot of

1 experience --

2 SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: Ms. Jones, I'm sorry to  
3 interrupt you, but you are part of the working group;  
4 correct?

5 PHELICIA JONES: And so what does that mean? I  
6 can't make public comment?

7 SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: You'll, it is the public  
8 that makes comments, the public comments.

9 PHELICIA JONES: So you are talking for those  
10 people who are not part of the working group?

11 SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: Correct.

12 PHELICIA JONES: So David, you can make a  
13 comment.

14 DAVID AARONSON: Hello, my name is David  
15 Aaronson. I'm a resident of District One. I've lived in  
16 San Francisco since 1993.

17 I'm also a core team member of Wealth and  
18 Disparities in the Black Community with Phelicia Jones.

19 I'm here primarily to support the mission of  
20 our organization, which is to ensure that biased policing  
21 is eradicated from San Francisco.

22 And I would like to just echo the statements  
23 that Phelicia made earlier that the focus of these  
24 discussions should be around the elimination of bias in  
25 stops.

1           As Phelicia noted, Blacks are five times more  
2 likely to be subject to traffic stops as people in the  
3 white community even though they make up less than  
4 five percent of the population.

5           Thank you.

6           SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: Thank you. Anybody else  
7 have public comment?

8           All right. Line item two, naming dates and  
9 times of the working group.

10          THE CHAIR: Some of this will be brief. As I  
11 said at the outset, we're going to have two working  
12 groups in the month of August. The next working group  
13 session will be August 25th, same time, same place. So  
14 that's a Friday. 11:30. In this room.

15          And we're going to release the balance of the  
16 working group dates either at the next meeting in August  
17 or before the next meeting in August. So please be on  
18 the look out for all of those future dates.

19          But for now you can mark your calendar for  
20 August 25th. At 11:30 in this room.

21          Can we take public comment?

22          SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: Anybody in the public who  
23 would like to make comment on line item two, please raise  
24 your hand.

25          DAVID AARONSON: David Aaronson again, Wealth

1 and Disparity in the Black Community.

2           Could you state when exactly the community will  
3 be engaged in these discussions and how outreach will be  
4 made to ensure that community numbers are aware of this?  
5 Informed that are accessible to them?

6           That's my comment. We would like to know the  
7 answer to that.

8           THE CHAIR: Sure. As I said at the outset  
9 there's multiple avenues for public participation. This  
10 room we're all sitting in is one of them.

11           And these meetings will continue throughout  
12 this month and the month of October.

13           Separate and apart from this, as I indicated at  
14 the outset, the Human Rights Commission has graciously  
15 agreed to spearhead our community outreach efforts. And  
16 I don't want to -- they will -- they will post all of the  
17 dates of the town halls and listening sessions, as I  
18 understand it. And they will lead substantial outreach  
19 to ensure that those events are well attended.

20           UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Just clarifying point on  
21 the 25th it's a Thursday.

22           It's -- there's -- the other thing is that the  
23 next working group, this isn't -- we have opened it up to  
24 the public, so if there are other individuals that you  
25 think would be beneficial or would like them also here in

1 the room, please send the invitation.

2 It's going to be posted on the Police  
3 Commission website and allow other people to know that  
4 they can attend as well. I think we tried to get the  
5 word out as much as we could prior to today's meeting and  
6 like my colleague said, this is just one of several  
7 avenues that we are trying to elicit feedback from  
8 various individuals.

9 SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: Anybody else have a  
10 comment on line item two?

11 Public comment is closed.

12 THE CHAIR: All right, Sergeant, would you call  
13 the next item?

14 PHELICIA JONES: May I say something?  
15 Or is this not the correct time?

16 THE CHAIR: Yeah, public comment is just for --

17 PHELICIA JONES: I don't want to make public  
18 comment. I want to just make a comment.

19 THE CHAIR: I think in order -- we've got so  
20 many people here, if everyone makes a comment out of  
21 order, we'll never get to everything.

22 PHELICIA JONES: The thing of it is,  
23 Commissioner, HRC is not doing -- working group. The HRC  
24 is doing listening groups in the community, which does  
25 not involve the working group.

1           So I think there should be some clarity around  
2 that.

3           THE CHAIR: That's exactly right. And I'm  
4 sorry that wasn't clear. Those are two separate and  
5 distinct things.

6           So listening sessions and town halls that HRC  
7 will be spearheading are certainly complementary to the  
8 work we're doing, but they are entirely separate and  
9 they're, as I said, many times being directed by HRC, not  
10 by the Commission or the department.

11           Thank you for that clarification.

12           Can we go to the next item, please, Sergeant.

13           SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: Line item 3, the  
14 recommendation group.

15           THE CHAIR: Great. So in terms of logistics  
16 going forward, how will we get this group to collaborate  
17 and communicate with each other?

18           We've obviously got a lot of people here and we  
19 want to make sure that everyone's ideas have equal  
20 standing and get the same level of consideration.

21           So the format that we're going to try to use  
22 here is to have submissions, recommendations, submitted  
23 ahead of each working group setting -- excuse me, ahead  
24 of each working group session.

25           So after this meeting we will email out -- I



1 believe we'll email out and we will also post on the  
2 Commission Website a recommendations grid. And this will  
3 just be -- it's a very simple kind of, you know -- okay.

4 (Inaudible comment by unidentified speaker.)

5 Okay. It's basically a very simple kind of  
6 like Excel style grid where you each individual and each  
7 organization, can fill in their specific recommendations  
8 for the assigned section of the DGO that we will be  
9 discussing at the next meeting.

10 So these can be -- I think -- I think the  
11 preferred thing would be to have redline-style edits: I  
12 think you should delete this and insert this.

13 But we would also welcome other forms of that,  
14 that are more high level.

15 The plan is that -- so I should just say, our  
16 networking group meeting is August 25th. We're going to  
17 basically give everyone here some homework, which is  
18 basically to get your recommendations to us by  
19 August 19th. That's a priority.

20 And then we will put together -- we'll put  
21 everyone's recommendations into one document we will  
22 circulate them. And that way everyone in this room will  
23 have an opportunity to review everyone else's  
24 recommendations before the next working group.

25 And I think the benefit of this will be that,

1 you know, if we all go around this room and say our  
2 initial thoughts, that would be the entire meeting.

3 But this way, this will allow everyone to  
4 consider everyone's thoughts before we get to the meeting  
5 and we can have -- you know, there will be some overlap.

6 We can kind of compile led comments and come up  
7 with more focused questions for the group to address  
8 since we all come in aware of what our respective  
9 thoughts and recommendations are.

10 So that will be the general format.

11 This will all be -- everything I just said will  
12 be repeated in writing. But that is just a heads up to  
13 the group about how we're going to try to structure and  
14 organize this.

15 The last -- the last thing -- again, this will  
16 go out in writing. But for our next meeting, we are  
17 going to focus on the following sections of the DGO.

18 So, Section 1, which is purpose;

19 Section 2, which is definitions;

20 And Section 5, which is stops and searches.

21 That might sound like a lot, but sections 1 and  
22 2 are not as substantive and Section 5 is obviously a --  
23 about stops and searches is a really substantial section.

24 So when folks submit their recommendation grid  
25 on August 19th, these are the sections that will be

1 addressed. And obviously in future working groups we  
2 will address all of the sections.

3 So when folks submit their recommendation for  
4 it on August 19th, these are the sections that will be  
5 addressed. And obviously in future working groups we  
6 will address all of the sections.

7 So we can take public comment.

8 SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: Anyone who would like to  
9 make a public comment regarding line item 3, please raise  
10 your hand.

11 Go ahead.

12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Zack Tom (phonetic),  
13 from Public Defender's Office. I have a clarification  
14 question about the submission that we make should not  
15 address sections 3, 4, then?

16 THE CHAIR: That's exactly right.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

18 DAVID AARONSON: David Aaronson.

19 So is that open to the public as well? Or is  
20 that only to working group members?

21 THE CHAIR: This is going to be for working  
22 group members.

23 THE DEFENDANT: And if the public wanted to  
24 make input, how would they do so? (Inaudible.)

25 THE COURT: Since the DGO draft was introduced

1 in May, we've opened it up to public comment and we've  
2 received dozens of public comments. So that avenue of  
3 input is ongoing now and continues to be open-ended.

4 DAVID AARONSON: Okay. Thank you.

5 (Inaudible comments.)

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So (inaudible)  
7 transparent.

8 So I think there are a lot of questions about  
9 the process. Just, if you don't mind, commissioners,  
10 going through sort of how the working group is going to  
11 work, the recommendations. Can you talk about the  
12 technicalities, but I think it would be just to make sure  
13 that everybody understands.

14 Like what the sequence is and the way that  
15 decision is to be made on the policy.

16 (Inaudible) so sort of like who's part of the  
17 working group and who's not.

18 So if we could talk about the role, aside from  
19 the legal advice that's been given, what's the role of  
20 the working group members?

21 Do they pass votes?

22 Is there going to be sort of a decision-making  
23 (inaudible) decisions --

24 That would be helpful.

25 THE CHAIR: Sure. So, I think those are all

1 great questions, Director. So thank you for that.

2 I think -- so, taking a step back, the -- I  
3 think that -- I don't want to prejudge the -- you know,  
4 the path that this working group necessarily will take.

5 I think it will depend on the recommendations  
6 that we see as they com in.

7 But from a 10,000 foot view, the role of this  
8 working group is essentially an advisory committee.

9 It's -- we're bringing people together who have  
10 impressive subject matter expertise from diverse areas.  
11 And the ultimate goal is to allow the Commission to  
12 benefit from everyone's expertise in this room.

13 So this room is providing an advisory function.

14 At the end of the day, the Commission will have  
15 to vote -- decide whether to have a vote and decide what  
16 we would be voting on if anything.

17 I think there can be multiple paths that the  
18 work product from this working group can take. It could  
19 be a new revised draft policy. It could be multiple  
20 options as different revised draft policies.

21 So, I think in terms of what the work product  
22 is, at the end of the day, could look a number of  
23 different ways.

24 But ultimately, the -- the role that this body  
25 plays is advisory.

1           JULIE TRAUN: Can I ask you a question?

2           And maybe this is crazy, but -- and most of the  
3 working groups that I've worked on, and I think some of  
4 the ones that have worked best, have involved a large  
5 group collaboration and discussion primarily around the  
6 first paragraph, because that frames everything.

7           When we met to talk about the use of force and  
8 we negotiated with POA, we spent five hours on the first  
9 paragraph and We Only had 15 hours, period.

10          And we spent five hours doing just that. And  
11 once we did that, then we could move forward.

12          And I'm just wondering, and in light of the  
13 amazing work with did he with Assistant Chief Lazar and  
14 the controller's office, where we did sort of a popcorn  
15 kind of -- people weighing in:

16                 What's important to you?

17                 What's important to the community?

18                 What's important for the police to hear that's  
19 going to make sense to them when they're out on the  
20 street?

21                 And how is this going to make a difference?

22                 So I'm wondering if you would just entertain --  
23 I don't know what form that would take, but it -- I, for  
24 one, would love to hear what everybody in this room  
25 thinks should be the mission and the vision of 9.01

1 priority.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Julie, for that.

3 I think that's really well taken. I think  
4 there's couple ways that could be addressed.

5 First, for the next working group, section one  
6 is going to be an assigned section to provide feedback,  
7 which is essentially the first paragraph.

8 And at the end of today, the next line item,  
9 there's going to be an opportunity for folks in the room  
10 to bring comment on why they're here, what they think is  
11 important about the DGO, what they think is -- what they  
12 don't like about it, what they like about it, why the  
13 issue's important to them in open forum for that.

14 So, I think more specifically, the first  
15 paragraph will be addressed next working group. And  
16 today there will be a more open-ended opportunity.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. So I'm a little  
18 confused on the working group and also on -- based upon  
19 what the statement this young lady has said. And that is  
20 everyone in here right now is part of the working group?  
21 Is this -- is that correct? Or no?

22 THE CHAIR: The working group is open to the  
23 public and so if you want to be on working group, you  
24 certainly can.

25 I can't speak for every individual here, but

1 there might be certain people here don't want to be on  
2 the working group.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. Okay. So I got  
4 it. Next time you're here on the 25th, if the public --  
5 the public comes in, community people come in, and say:  
6 I want to be part of this working group, then they would  
7 be added to the working group?

8 THE CHAIR: Absolutely.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. And then  
10 secondly, based upon -- I'm sorry, what's your name,  
11 ma'am? In the yellow?

12 JULIE TRAUN: Julie Truan.

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Julie?

14 JULIE TRAUN: Uh-huh.

15 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Based upon what Julie  
16 said, is that the discussion around one which would be  
17 purpose would only be based upon those who would be  
18 making recommendations by the 19th for the meeting on the  
19 25th.

20 THE COURT: That's right.

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So if only two or three  
22 people in this room made recommendations, then you are  
23 only going to have three recommendations to discuss on  
24 the 25th.

25 THE CHAIR: That is certainly theoretically



1 possible. Looking around --

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm just -- it's a yes  
3 or no answer.

4 THE CHAIR: I think -- I would be very shocked  
5 if there were only two.

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: But I'm just saying --  
7 well, that's what I asked.

8 So is it yes or no?

9 THE CHAIR: The answer is yes.

10 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you.

11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm assuming we're still  
12 on public comment about the recommendation grid. So I  
13 have a question about the recommendation grid.

14 THE CHAIR: Please.

15 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: If recommendations are  
16 submitted by the 19th, will this body provide the  
17 department an opportunity to operationalize the responses  
18 before the next meeting?

19 Or will the responses be discussed at the  
20 meeting?

21 THE CHAIR: So, yeah, the responses will be  
22 discussed at the meeting. There would be no  
23 opportunity -- there would be no putting any of the  
24 recommendations into policy, if that's your question.

25 I'm sorry if I'm misunderstanding.

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's not my question.  
2 Maybe the question is more of when you have a  
3 law enforcement -- will you give law enforcement an  
4 opportunity to look at the recommendations and then see  
5 what's possible in reality, if it's practical, in order  
6 to be prepared to present that at the next working group  
7 meeting?

8 THE CHAIR: Oh, I see.

9 So I think to the extent that there are  
10 reactions to recommendations from officers who feel that  
11 there might be issues with implementation, that would be  
12 something that would be discussed at the working group  
13 meeting.

14 PHELICIA JONES: So, clarification. So, when  
15 the public -- when you accept public comment -- now I  
16 believe this -- this was the -- there's no meeting;  
17 correct?

18 THE CHAIR: Correct.

19 PHELICIA JONES: Okay. So then the public  
20 would just have that one meeting to give public comment  
21 to be part of the recommendation grid?

22 Or will their comment be part of the  
23 recommendations grid or are -- is the Commission taking  
24 those -- those comments into consideration?

25 Because the -- it's not clear.

1 THE CHAIR: It's the last thing you said,  
2 Ms. Jones.

3 And so the opening of public comment has been  
4 open since May. And the Commission will take those into  
5 consideration.

6 But that is a separate process from the working  
7 group process.

8 PHELICIA JONES: So whatever the public said  
9 will not be part of the recommendation, but -- however,  
10 the Commission will take under consideration which public  
11 comments to take into the recommendation of the --

12 THE CHAIR: The Commission will take into  
13 account all comments made by the public.

14 The recommendation grid is for individuals  
15 participating in the working group so that we're able to  
16 know ahead of time what other folks in the room have  
17 recommended.

18 So, the -- the recommendation group -- grid is  
19 to facilitate conversation within the working group.

20 There is a separate public comment process for  
21 folks who don't have the time or interest or inclination  
22 to join the working group. Their words can also be heard  
23 in public comment.

24 PHELICIA JONES: So will we be given a copy of  
25 those recommendations from public comment?

1 THE CHAIR: You can get them right now.  
2 They're already on the website.  
3 PHELICIA JONES: Thank you.  
4 THE CHAIR: And they're updated as they come  
5 in.  
6 I would say public comment --  
7 (Inaudible comments.)  
8 THE CHAIR: I think that might have been a  
9 public comment.  
10 I think we have member of the working group who  
11 just arrived. We're -- would you like to introduce  
12 yourself?  
13 ROME JONES: Introduce myself? Hello. I'm  
14 Rome Jones.  
15 (Inaudible murmuring.)  
16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We all said kind of like  
17 (inaudible.)  
18 ROME JONES: You said why we're here?  
19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, A little bit,  
20 yeah. Uh-huh.  
21 ROME JONES: I guess I'm here because I'm  
22 interested in bettering the world.  
23 THE CHAIR: Thank you we appreciate  
24 succinctness and (inaudible). So we appreciate that.  
25 Sergeant, if we haven't already, can we go to

1 public comment at this time?

2 SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD: Is there any further  
3 public comment regarding the recommendation grid?

4 Line item 4, discussion on draft Department  
5 General Order 9.01, traffic enforcement (inaudible).

6 THE CHAIR: All right. So for this item, I  
7 just want to give a very brief overview of the DGO and  
8 also provide an opportunity for individuals in the room  
9 to give any -- any thoughts or comments or reactions to  
10 the DGO as the draft is currently written.

11 You know, really open-ended. So, I'll try to  
12 be brief.

13 I think, you know, the reason for many of us  
14 why this DGO is necessary is because of the stark racial  
15 disparities in this department's stop and search data.

16 I'm not going to go bore everyone with the  
17 numbers, but you know, in 2019, for example, which is the  
18 last year pre-pandemic dealing with normal traffic flows,  
19 Black people were 10.3 times more likely to be stopped--  
20 for an equipment violation, which are generally low  
21 infractions.

22 And overall I think were about four or five  
23 times more likely to be stopped.

24 And -- more likely to be asked for consent to  
25 search and were least likely to have contraband on them

1 despite that.

2 How does this DGO try to address this problem?

3 I think that it -- as I see -- you know, as  
4 I look -- as we look at the data, a few things popped up.

5 So the stops that were driving racial  
6 disparities tended to be low-level traffic and pedestrian  
7 offenses. Things like hanging fuzzy dice from your  
8 rearview mirror. Things that generally didn't pose an  
9 imminent risk to public safety.

10 And those same stops also shared another  
11 characteristic, which is the stops that had the biggest  
12 racial disparities also tended to have the lowest yield  
13 rates, meaning they were the least likely to result in  
14 finding contraband or evidence of a crime.

15 And so what this DGO tries to do is have a way  
16 (inaudible) approach which is by making fewer of these  
17 stops, we can try to reduce racial disparities. But also  
18 we can reduce the number of stops that are providing the  
19 lowest return on investment from a public safety  
20 perspective.

21 Because again, these stops are the least  
22 likely, generally, to turn up evidence of a crime.

23 So, I think this is an area where, you know,  
24 potentially you could accomplish an important reform  
25 while also improving public safety in the community.

1 That (inaudible) at least the problem.

2 So briefly how does this DGO try to go about  
3 that?

4 I think there's two main prongs to it.

5 The first, is it -- it bans, with some  
6 exceptions, making stops for certain of -- for these  
7 low-level infractions that are driving racial  
8 disparities.

9 The second thing it does is that because there  
10 are thousands of -- there are thousands of traffic  
11 infractions in the code, this is not going to solve the  
12 problem all by itself.

13 And so it also limits what officers can do. It  
14 limits officers' discretion. Once they decide to make a  
15 stop, what can an officer do in terms of asking for  
16 consent to search the vehicle. And things of that  
17 nature.

18 I want to say some things that this DGO doesn't  
19 do. Because I've heard a lot of comment about this DGO.  
20 And some of the things -- I think there's a  
21 misunderstanding about what it does and doesn't do.

22 The first thing this DGO does not do is it does  
23 not prohibit enforcement of any traffic for pedestrian  
24 violation.

25 It prohibits stops for a small number.

1           So what does that mean in practice?

2           For the 15 or so violations that are on the  
3 banned list, you can -- officers could still issue, for  
4 example, tickets to a parked car.

5           Red light cameras will still continue to  
6 operate.

7           Officers could, if they wanted to, and I know  
8 there's been discussion about whether this is actually  
9 possible and implementable right now, but under this DGO,  
10 officers could take down a person's license plate and the  
11 agency could send a person a ticket in the mail.

12           So all of those avenues for enforcement are  
13 still available.

14           I have also heard a lot of discussion around  
15 this DGO prohibiting officers from making stops when  
16 there is concrete evidence of a serious crime taking  
17 place. That is just categorically not true.

18           If officers have reasonable suspicion or  
19 probable cause that a crime is taking place, the mere  
20 fact that someone has committed a traffic violation will  
21 not be any impediment to the officer pulling that person  
22 over.

23           So, you know, all serious crimes can continue  
24 to result in stops. And, in fact, we have a -- you know,  
25 a pretty robust exception language in the DGO right now



1 that even when there isn't reasonable suspicion, officers  
2 can make stops for certain serious crimes.

3 So I will stop there. And I just want to open  
4 it up to anyone in this room who would just -- would like  
5 to say --

6 Because of how many folks are here, maybe try  
7 to keep it to one minute.

8 But to say anything, really, that they would  
9 like to say about the DGO.

10 Whether it's why they're here. Why they think  
11 this is important. What they don't like about it. What  
12 they like about it.

13 I will just open it up to the floor.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Thank you. My name is  
15 (inaudible) police station.

16 I hear a lot of numbers being -- 10.3 times you  
17 said. Ms. Jones, 34 percent.

18 Do you guys have the data for '17 or '18 to  
19 '20, how many traffic stops were conducted in the City  
20 and County of San Francisco by San Francisco police  
21 officers?

22 Do you have that number? Traffic stops.

23 THE CHAIR: When you said '17 --

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Like the two-year span,  
25 '18 to '20. Do you have that data? How many traffic

1 tops were done in the City and County of San Francisco by  
2 San Francisco police officers?

3 THE CHAIR: So I tried hard to get as much data  
4 as I can.

5 I don't have -- I don't have, but I'll ask the  
6 Chief. I don't have, I wasn't able to get '17 or '18.

7 So I can tell you 2019 total stops was around  
8 102,000 including pedestrians. About 67,000 of those  
9 were traffic stops, if I recall?

10 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 2019 you said 102,000  
11 stops, that's pedestrians and vehicles bicycles,  
12 scooters, all that mixed in.

13 THE CHAIR: That's my recollection.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What is the number  
15 20-2021.

16 THE CHAIR: They have fallen off a cliff  
17 because of -- because of pandemic.

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: A multitude of factors.

19 THE CHAIR: And staffing, of course.

20 The race disparities remain, though, despite  
21 the lower numbers.

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm not arguing -- I'm  
23 not here to argue. I'm here to discuss. Not to get --  
24 (Multiple speakers.)

25 THE CHAIR: Your comments are very welcome.

1           As a reminder, there are probably a lot of  
2 folks who want to say their piece. I don't think it's  
3 going to be helpful for us to have this back-and-forth  
4 right now, although this --

5           UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. I'm -- that's not  
6 my question. Do you have the data?

7           THE CHAIR: Do you want to share with us?

8           (New speaker.)

9           CHIEF SCOTT: I was just going to weigh in on  
10 this. So I --

11          THE CHAIR: I appreciate that.

12          PHELICIA JONES: I was next, Chief. My hand  
13 was up before yours. I know you rank in here, but -- you  
14 know. My hand was up before yours, Chief.

15          CHIEF SCOTT: I just want to answer some  
16 questions for the public.

17          PHELICIA JONES: Okay. I'll yield.

18          CHIEF SCOTT: This is just 15 seconds.

19          For anybody that's interested in any of the  
20 data, since 2016, we have been required to collect that  
21 data quarterly.

22          It's on the website.

23          It used to be called the 96-day report. It's  
24 still called the 96-day report, but internally we call it  
25 the QADR which is Quarterly --

1 (Inaudible comment.)

2 CHIEF SCOTT: Quarterly Activity Data Report.  
3 QADR.

4 So it's on our website. It's -- it's given to  
5 the force supervisors by (inaudible) quarterly. We go  
6 back to 2016. So a lot of that is what's driving this  
7 conversation.

8 In addition to that, there are other studies  
9 out there that weren't done by the police department  
10 where people have taken that data and extrapolated  
11 whatever they're looking at.

12 So it is out there if anybody is interested.  
13 It's well documented.

14 THE CHAIR: Ms. Jones?

15 PHELICIA JONES: So what's the officers name?

16 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Guitanimo (phonetic).  
17 Guitanimo.

18 PHELICIA JONES: Oh, Guitanimo?

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes, ma'am.

20 PHELICIA JONES: You said ma'am. It's okay.  
21 Are you from the south?

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm from the south,  
23 South Carolina.

24 PHELICIA JONES: Because in Northern California  
25 we don't say "ma'am."

1           So for quarter one, '22, quarter one, 2022, the  
2 number of stops San Francisco Police Department made was  
3 3,769.

4           UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Quarter 2021, you said?

5           PHELICIA JONES: Yeah, quarter one.

6           UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 3,000 stops?

7           PHELICIA JONES: Three thousand, one -- no,  
8 3,769.

9           (New speaker.)

10          UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Did you say 2021 or  
11 2022?

12          PHELICIA JONES: Quarter one, 2022.

13          Okay. Everybody, quarter one, 2022.

14          Okay. And then as far as the -- now, this  
15 is -- our records mainly look at Blacks, Hispanics and  
16 whites.

17          And so from quarter -- since 2016, Blacks were  
18 three times that of whites stopped.

19          And from 2016 up until quarter one, 2022, it  
20 has risen. It has not gone down.

21          So we are now five times that of whites to be  
22 stopped, four times of Hispanics to be stopped, and one  
23 times that of whites to be stopped.

24          So those are the statistics. And as the Chief  
25 said, they're open to the public. It's on your website.

1 CHIEF SCOTT: Thank you.

2 PHELICIA JONES: You're welcome.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So for me, I think, you  
4 know, when you talk about the data and trying to get the  
5 most correct up-to-date data.

6 We talk about San Franciscans; right?

7 And I think Crispin could help me with this.

8 So we're talking about Blacks, whites,  
9 Hispanics, Asians, white.

10 And then for me, I would break it down even  
11 more. How many of those are city residents? How many of  
12 those are not city residents?

13 How many of those traffic stops were in the Bay  
14 View, the Northern, the Tenderloin, Central; right?

15 So if we could break this all down further.  
16 Because it's not just Black San Franciscans, it's Black  
17 people, African-American, whatever you want to say, as a  
18 whole.

19 But to me I'm narrowing it down to in  
20 San Francisco; right?

21 How many Black San Francisco -- San Franciscans  
22 have been stopped?

23 Like I said, I've been pulled over as a police  
24 officer and prior to me joining the department.

25 So I can speak to this.

1           And as a police officer, I've made a number of  
2 traffic stops throughout the entire San Francisco city;  
3 right?

4           And it wasn't based on what the person looked  
5 like, it was based on a driving habit. And also the  
6 Vehicle Code allowed me, as a police officer, to make a  
7 traffic stop for. Right?

8           Now, once the traffic stop is made, where do we  
9 go from there? Was I looking for an armed robbery or  
10 homicide suspect?

11           Or was I conducting traffic enforcement in a  
12 high area that saw people speeding, a lot of traffic  
13 accidents, so on and so forth? Right?

14           So the data is going to be largely in -- and a  
15 lot of it that we might have to (inaudible).

16           But you know, am I hearing we should not stop  
17 people who we think are Black from driving? No. That's  
18 not the answer. That's not going to happen.

19           Just like the young man said about, you know,  
20 looking at eliminating all bias. Not going to be happen  
21 because we're human and we're imperfect.

22           But we can lessen it for sure. Right?

23           And we can identify those traits that are in  
24 each of us where we can somehow stop, slow down, stop and  
25 think and say: Okay, why am I doing this?

1           Fuzzy dice. I don't think I've ever pulled  
2 over anyone for having fuzzy dice on their rearview  
3 mirror.

4           But has that stop been made? Of course it has.  
5 Right? That's why it's in the Vehicle Code.

6           I've pulled over a lot of people for not having  
7 their registration up to date. Some three, five years  
8 old; right?

9           I've made those stops. I've made stops where  
10 people have blown through red lights and stop signs.  
11 Right? I've made those stops. And we continue to make  
12 those stops? Right?

13           We talk about our vision zero. Right? Our  
14 traffic accidents are way up there. Right? Our traffic  
15 deaths. And we can't allow that to happen if we want to  
16 reach vision zero. Right?

17           So it's about you throw out numbers. Right?

18           But for me, what is the context?

19           Because I'm thinking about Black San Francisco  
20 residents. Right? Okay.

21           Then you can throw in other Black people we  
22 stop who may not live here, who may only work here.  
23 Right?

24           So, to me, I would like to see that breakdown  
25 also.



1 PHELICIA JONES: Okay. Well, you know, the  
2 California State RIPA report gives a lot of information  
3 that you're seeking, as far as disparities in the Black  
4 community.

5 This is what we need to focus on is Black San  
6 Franciscans and those who are stopped in San Francisco  
7 being Black.

8 Now, Chief, I don't know, I think it was the  
9 Attorney General's Office a few years ago, I can't  
10 remember what legislation it was that came up where when  
11 you guys make stops, you were supposed to report all that  
12 information.

13 What body -- what legislation was that?

14 CHIEF SCOTT: That's the RIPA report.

15 (Multiple speakers; indecipherable.)

16 PHELICIA JONES: So that information, what  
17 you're asking -- I forget your name, I'm sorry.

18 Tracy?

19 So I think that information should be on the  
20 RIPA report; correct?

21 (Multiple speakers, inaudible)

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 96A also has additional  
23 data that RIPA doesn't ask for and it's more thorough and  
24 it's also on our website.

25 AVI FREY: Thank you. Avi again from the ACLU.

1 I want start by saying I appreciate the focus  
2 and emphasis on the data as we get started because I do  
3 think it's probative.

4 But if we could zoom out for one second, I  
5 don't think anyone in the room disagrees that we are  
6 stopping more Black people, disproportionately. We are  
7 harming more people with that (inaudible) stops  
8 unnecessarily. We are killing more Black people as a  
9 result of these traffic stops.

10 So I think we can leave the data there for  
11 right now and move on to what are we going to do about  
12 that?

13 PHELICIA JONES: Thank you.

14 AVI FREY: So I would like to --

15 Tracy, very well taken. We should be  
16 addressing racism. But the certainty of pieces of racism  
17 we're not going to address by training individuals.  
18 That's why discretion is the problem.

19 These traffic stops that we're here to try to  
20 prohibit, they're not worth the candle.

21 Who cares about fuzzy dice? Who cares about  
22 two license plates?

23 And many more provisions of the traffic code.

24 It's not worth the harm it causes to people,  
25 even when it doesn't escalate into an incident of

1 violence.

2 It is not worth the harm to the Black  
3 community.

4 I agree with you, Phelicia. We need more Black  
5 people in here to tell -- I'm not the person to do it.

6 PHELICIA JONES: That's right.

7 AVI FREY: To tell this group: What does it  
8 feel like even, when there's no harm that results. You  
9 get pulled over and feel like a second class citizen  
10 because you're driving around. Maybe your car is a  
11 little more rusted than somebody else's. But maybe it  
12 isn't.

13 Those harms compound. They impact generations.  
14 That has been happening for generations in San Francisco.

15 And that's why I think this is not about  
16 (inaudible) police or individual officers, it's about  
17 removing the opportunity for that implicit bias at the  
18 very least.

19 PHELICIA JONES: That's right.

20 AVI FREY: So that's why discretion has to be  
21 removed. Any instance -- he said he was strongly in  
22 favor of prohibiting and expanding the list of prohibited  
23 traffic violations -- excuse me, traffic stops.

24 Because anything that is not a matter of public  
25 safety that goes directly to public safety and injects

1 discretion, will be a vehicle for bias, both intentional  
2 and implicit.

3 Thank you.

4 PHELICIA JONES: Thank you for sharing that.

5 WESLEY SAVER: Thank you. I'm Wesley Saver  
6 with GLIDE.

7 Just two quick (inaudible). Thank Avi for his  
8 words.

9 One, it was mentioned that the QADR data runs  
10 back to 2016.

11 Currently the website only has it going back to  
12 Q3, 2020. So it's available (inaudible).

13 And then in respect what Tracy mentioned, the  
14 not prioritizing fuzzy dice hanging from a mirror, we do  
15 have members of the Black community and members of the  
16 Muslim community who have mentioned they have been  
17 targeted for having prayer beads hanging from their  
18 mirrors.

19 So that policy does in some way wind up  
20 targeting.

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm going to him and  
22 then Mr. Cox and then Ms. Jenkins.

23 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Excuse me, I didn't --  
24 who are you representing?

25 WESLEY SAVER: GLIDE.

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm sorry?

2 WESLEY SAVER: GLIDE.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Pride?

4 WESLEY SAVER: GLIDE.

5 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh, GLIDE. Oh, okay.

6 SERGEANT BRIAN KNEUKER: Thank you.

7 Brian Kneuker from the San Francisco Asia  
8 Police Officer's Association.

9 It's been talked about public safety is a key  
10 factor in this policy.

11 But, going through some of the policies alone  
12 of what officers can't stop, specifically under the  
13 banned pedestrian and bicycle stops. Riding bicycles on  
14 sidewalks.

15 I was born and raised in the city. If you go  
16 down Market Street, you go down to Powell, you are going  
17 to most likely -- good chance of being hit by delivery  
18 trucks coming out on a sidewalk.

19 There are so many factors in this policy that  
20 negate public safety.

21 This policy, to me, (inaudible) brought me 2022  
22 Vehicle Code, California Vehicle in here today.

23 You are limiting what officers can do. And  
24 it's a slippery slope because we're going to take this  
25 much of that officers can't enforce to say now this much

1 can't be enforced.

2 We're San Francisco police officers, we're  
3 peace officers for the State of California. Our job is  
4 to enforce not certain laws, but all laws.

5 If there is an issue with the law, shouldn't  
6 that be taken up with the legislative branch and they  
7 should remove that law.

8 BRIAN COX: Yeah, I think there's importance to  
9 be grounded and in the history of why we're here. It is  
10 increasing the city the data is (inaudible). It's been  
11 relatively consistent. I think that's despite all the  
12 requirements and all the attention that's been paid to  
13 this issue and other issues.

14 And I think that's why we need to -- we need a  
15 policy to be aggressive, but that obviously limits the  
16 discretion. Right?

17 Because part of the challenge is I think is, in  
18 my view, the harm caused when we stop someone, the  
19 inter-generational trauma, the feelings of degradation,  
20 feeling someone tries to -- tries to -- to -- figure out  
21 if you're related to a crime, it's substantial. Right?

22 And having been pulled over and asked questions  
23 that are wholly unrelated to the stop, I can tell you it  
24 feels weird. I feel very small. Right?

25 And that's the type of harm I think that needs

1 to be centered in this conversation. And I think too  
2 often gets left out of the conversation.

3 So, to me, you know, I think --

4 PHELICIA JONES: That's why you need  
5 (inaudible) here.

6 BRIAN COX: I agree. That's -- I think when we  
7 talk to our clients at the public defender's office, this  
8 is the story that they tell. Right?

9 That is the story that's in the community.

10 And so from our perspective, it is not just  
11 about limiting, you know, banning a certain of number of  
12 codes. Also limiting what happens after that.

13 We have to be particularly pointed and  
14 aggressive in how we (inaudible) just based on what we  
15 see and what our clients say. Right? Because they're  
16 the ones in the community who are impacted.

17 PHELICIA JONES: That's right.

18 BRIAN COX: No one is debating, it's been  
19 consistent. And so I think it would be helpful if we  
20 can, you know, really drill down and think critically  
21 about how can we (inaudible) comprehensive, right? And  
22 also substantively reduce the disparity.

23 So I'm looking for this conversation. I think  
24 just the last point, I don't think that we should be  
25 ruled by fear in this process.

1 I think we should be bold and step forward.  
2 The city has had broad, progressive values and I think we  
3 should continue that.

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Ms. Jenkins.

5 ANGELA JENKINS: Okay. I have heard a lot.  
6 And I was wanting to just put a real case example to the  
7 discussion.

8 And it's a UPS driver, an African-American UPS  
9 driver was stopped on Haight Street who clearly felt that  
10 was based solely on race. There are, many, many trucks  
11 that were double parked on Haight.

12 I don't have video of the case, I don't know it  
13 all. But dropping something like that into a real life  
14 scenario, was it because -- well, was anyone else really  
15 to blame?

16 Nowadays, the whole community seems to be on  
17 some type of neighborhood watch and they see a Black  
18 body. They're right away texting: There's something  
19 wrong.

20 So I think there's an increase grouping on  
21 Black bodies that videos have gone viral of all of us  
22 running into all sorts of stores and stealing.

23 I'm an African-American woman. I don't steal.

24 But because there is a backdrop from media to  
25 focus solely on the Black body, there may be other people



1 contributing to pretext stops by saying: That UPS  
2 driver. She stopped there, why is she there?

3 But, I just had a real life scenario. I just  
4 wanted to draw what happened with that UPS driver? She  
5 was Black and she was pulled over and cited.

6 That's an example. If you want to ever look at  
7 something like that.

8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: She was pulled over  
9 doing her job.

10 ANGELA JENKINS: Yeah. And I bet there were --  
11 You know, I hear the officers I'm speaking  
12 about, I can concur with them that you want to enforce --  
13 that's what you were paid to do is enforce the law.

14 But, for me, I've been pulled over, would you  
15 believe that?

16 (Inaudible)

17 I've been pulled over -- I (inaudible) bicycle  
18 stuff, but -- that's what's bothering me. I wanted to  
19 see if we could parcel out -- we mentioned 96A. And the  
20 way you guys updated the website, Ms. McGuire, is you  
21 have to go from 96A, which does have 2016 statistics, all  
22 the way over to the quarterly data to keep the continuity  
23 going.

24 So I do look at the quarterly data. And I do  
25 recognize something that I brought up before, and in

1 biased policing is that there is the cops stopping  
2 people.

3 But if you review the reports that are always  
4 in the Executive Review, nearly 39 percent of  
5 African-Americans are identified by the general public  
6 when you look at the statistics for suspects observed and  
7 reported, which comes from the crime database.

8 It's still a lot of people focused solely on  
9 the movement of a Black body.

10 And I always have been saying from within these  
11 rooms we also want to see how the non police officer, the  
12 community members, the vigilante on NextDoor and Citizen  
13 are increasing the scrutiny on innocent Black bodies.

14 DOCTOR JAMES TAYLOR: Again, I just wanted to  
15 add that even if we could magically fix this issue today  
16 through a conversation, you still have to deal with every  
17 other part of the whole entire system that has the same  
18 exact problem.

19 So I don't know how you fix enforcement at the  
20 level of contact with citizens and then, you know, from  
21 the moment a person is contacted to whether they're  
22 charged, whether they're arrested, what kind of  
23 sentences -- what kind of charge they get, what kind of  
24 experience they have in the process, the voir dire  
25 process, the judge, the judge -- the rulings and then the

1 sentencing. And then the time spent.

2 So every -- I mean, in other words, we can fix  
3 this and be miracle workers and a model for the country.  
4 And it's still a completely broken system at every other  
5 stage of it.

6 So there's a contagious effect. I don't know  
7 how you fix this if you can't fix -- and that's too much  
8 for anybody. Right?

9 Like you said, centuries.

10 But I think we have to be panoramic in our  
11 perspective and understand that if we could actually see  
12 some concrete progress around these issues, we still  
13 would be behind a lot of obstacles related to every other  
14 stage of the process.

15 And I also sort of wanted to suggest that your  
16 metaphor for the book, the power that be taken from  
17 officers in terms of their discretion to enforce the law  
18 based on what little part they randomly choose.

19 But I think what Ms. Jones and others are  
20 conveying is that for everyday Black people, there are a  
21 lot of that book that gets used on certain groups and not  
22 used on others by officers. And that's the difference.

23 As a Black man, I have been pulled over scores  
24 of times, LA when I was an undergraduate student.

25 I was pulled over not long ago -- two years ago

1 in San Leandro. I got on Facebook I said I was a Black  
2 man that got pulled over by the police and -- and nothing  
3 happened to me. The young cop let me go.

4 I was speeding. He wrote down and lowered the  
5 speed rate so that I could go to traffic school and I  
6 announced that.

7 And I looked at myself, and I have two teenage  
8 sons and I told them when I'm living my own life -- and I  
9 have two brothers that are felons.

10 So nobody's sell out -- don't try to judge me,  
11 you don't know me.

12 Both of my brothers have felonies. And when I  
13 talk to my teenage sons, I tell them that 99 percent of  
14 my encounters with police officers all of my life have  
15 been positive.

16 Only one negative I had was right after the  
17 riots in LA where I was on the ground in 1992 as a  
18 graduate student and got pulled over by a sheriff, a  
19 white officer and -- a male, and a Black female officer  
20 and he pulled out a gun on me because somebody named  
21 James Taylor was wanted in Riverside County and we have  
22 the same height, age and stuff like that.

23 And she, from our conversation, said that -- I  
24 was coming from USC, from class. I had my books with me.  
25 She said, this is not him. And they had an argument in

1 front of me and they resolved it and they let me go.

2 That's the most negative experience I had with  
3 police officer in my life. And I'm from New York. And  
4 that's SoCal.

5 I'm from the projects, the ghetto, the 1980s, I  
6 got involved in all this work when crack hit. And I  
7 decided, as a Black boy in the projects, with my mother,  
8 grandmother, and all the Black women in the projects, to  
9 create an organization called United Parents Against Drug  
10 Abuse to fight crack in our community.

11 Then I became a professor 20 years later.

12 So, for me, it's not -- you know, I think  
13 what -- you know, I look at this, it's -- it's a  
14 difficult project because if we could come up with a  
15 solution, concretely, we still would have to go back and  
16 try to fix these other aspects. Otherwise it can't hold  
17 itself.

18 Sorry to take up so much time.

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: You know, I want to  
20 thank you for sharing your story. Also Ms. Jenkins and  
21 Ms. McCray and the officers.

22 I think this is why we're here. We want to  
23 have these difficult conversations that we normally don't  
24 have. And to be honest with you, we may not get it  
25 right. But we're trying. We're really trying.

1           And I, you know, I know that that's really all  
2 that we can do. And we are open -- you know, I won't  
3 speak for my fellow commissioners, but I know that we're  
4 open to hearing how we make this better. What we can do.  
5 And how to solve this. Right?

6           Like give me solutions, because we all know the  
7 data, we all know the problem. We all know that this  
8 issue exists.

9           And I have really tried to focus things on  
10 getting solutions. Give me solutions. How do we fix it?  
11 What do we do? Where do we go from here?

12           And so that's the perfect -- you know, one of  
13 the other purposes of this working group, the listening  
14 sessions, we're trying everything we can to get out to  
15 everyone we can to give us input, to give us your subject  
16 matter expertise. Tell us what's going on from your  
17 perspective, from your perspective, so that we can get  
18 this right.

19           And we may not get it right, but we're going to  
20 try.

21           And I really want to thank all of you for being  
22 here and participating and trying with us. Because we  
23 can't do it alone. You know, we can -- we really can't.  
24 And we have to have these difficult conversations.

25           And I'm grateful that we're here and grateful

1 that we're doing this.

2 So thank you again for being here and sharing  
3 your stories and creating a space where people can say  
4 things and be in a space where we're allowed to say  
5 things that may not otherwise be safe to say outside this  
6 room or in public.

7 So, Ms. Jones.

8 PHELICIA JONES: Yes, I just want to say, thank  
9 the ACLU. And you are from the DA's office? Is that  
10 right?

11 (Multiple speakers; indecipherable.)

12 PHELICIA JONES: I didn't hear what he said.

13 I was like: He's from the DA's office?

14 Okay. So, okay. Now it makes sense.

15 And what you're saying is, and I think, you  
16 know, as we all move forward to, you know, developing the  
17 working group, the working group is really never going to  
18 be a true working group, Chief, until you get the stories  
19 of the people who have actually been through the stops  
20 and the trauma that they have been through.

21 And this is why, you know, I come in, you know,  
22 just saying what I need to say.

23 Because one, you know, we have these groups and  
24 Wealth and Disparities, we're the ones responsible for  
25 all this work that is going on now, before. We're the

1 ones who brought the DOJ to San Francisco around Mario  
2 Woods' killing. Okay?

3 This is why we are all here seven years later.  
4 Right?

5 And so the thing of it is, is that you know, it  
6 may not -- all of it may not ever go away, Jay.

7 However, when you look at Black people in  
8 San Francisco, the -- the rates are just absolutely too  
9 high for the population.

10 And then the other thing is, is that, you know,  
11 as a working group, right? And I'm just going to keep it  
12 real. I'm going to keep it 100. Because that's what I  
13 do.

14 A lot of times we do this work that we're doing  
15 right here so you can feel good. See?

16 Because if it was about a Black folks, and as I  
17 said I'm not anti-white, I ain't anti-Hispanic, I ain't  
18 anti-Pacific Islander, I ain't anti-Latino. But I am pro  
19 Black. This is where I move. This is how I move in my  
20 life every day. Pro black.

21 And so, if we don't have those stories here,  
22 then what we do is we're just making ourselves feel good  
23 about the work that we're attempting to do rather than  
24 the work that is needed to be done in the communities  
25 that we serve.



1 I am a servant.

2 But also, too, is that, you know, with these  
3 working groups, based upon the DOJ and the community  
4 policing and bias and, you know, I probably been at -- I  
5 am the one who helped bring it here, so I follow the  
6 working groups.

7 The working groups, you know what? You always  
8 put them in the middle of the damn day. You always put  
9 them in a location where community people don't have  
10 access. And that needs to stop.

11 If you want a true working group, I can see  
12 even you rotate. You know what I'm saying?

13 You can do it here one month, you done already  
14 said we coming back here in August 25th.

15 So the mind span on how people are feeling and  
16 what needs to be done for community, you're not even  
17 there. You're not there.

18 It's about helping you on how you feel. And  
19 until we get bold enough, courageous enough, to go to  
20 these communities and hold some of these working groups  
21 so people can have access to the working groups, then,  
22 you know, I'm going -- Chief, I'm going to stay. I'm  
23 going to stay in this group.

24 But y'all better be ready for me to say  
25 whatever the hell I need to say, because I'm not backing

1 down from the truth.

2 And I want to see a difference made. It is not  
3 going to come overnight. But again, you have to start  
4 making some concessions.

5 Because all your working groups going back to  
6 the DOJ never has taken place in the communities of  
7 marginalized people. And that's what the DOJ says.

8 For the relationships between the police  
9 department and marginalized groups, then you need to go  
10 to those marginalized group. And that has never been  
11 done with working groups.

12 So, it's time for a change.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you for those comments.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can I just say I agree.

15 We really tried, you know. I mean, there were  
16 recommendations from people in working group that we  
17 needed to be meeting elsewhere. It didn't happen.

18 I've said we need to do that. I agree with you  
19 completely.

20 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible) debates were  
21 completely open to the public. Chief Scott was there --

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Well, the working  
23 groups --

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: All kinds of groups were  
25 there. Everybody was involved.

1           Yeah, I know.

2           It was at the Cow Palace. Boys Club, Girls  
3 Club.

4           UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Those were different  
5 from the working groups.

6           UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Right, those kinds of  
7 forums might help, different sites throughout the city,  
8 including in Bay View.

9           PHELICIA JONES: So basically --  
10 (Multiple speakers; indecipherable.)

11          THE CHAIR: Wait a moment. Let's have chief  
12 Scott.

13          Let's have -- Rome has had his hand up and  
14 we're already over time, so I think those will have to be  
15 the last two comments.

16          CHIEF SCOTT: I think we're all in agreement.  
17 This Commission is committed to bringing this to the  
18 community. You're absolutely right. The first day we  
19 meet, you came to my office and we had it out.

20          That's what we plan to do.

21          So, you know, I'm not trying to shut anybody  
22 down. But that's why this -- these conversations are  
23 happening. And the Commission has committed to bringing  
24 these discussions to the communities that are the most  
25 impacted.

1           We're drawing some of this up as we get the  
2 comments and feedback. (Inaudible.)

3           You but I think we're all in agreement that  
4 that needs to happen, so either, her, her, her, whoever  
5 else has said it. The Commission is already committed to  
6 that.

7           UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We tried to get it out  
8 of police headquarters, but logistically, given the time  
9 frame we had, we couldn't. So today it's here. We hear  
10 your comments. We will try to accommodate.

11           Rome?

12           ROME JONES: The thing of it is, one I agree  
13 (inaudible). But, like don't put it in community and  
14 then fill the room with like the same people who are  
15 here. You know.

16           Like actively outreach to the community to have  
17 them in the room.

18           And then understand my community doesn't really  
19 trust the police department and it won't be easy the  
20 first meeting or the second one or the third one.

21           You have to consistently try to do it. So  
22 that's one. First thing I would say.

23           Second thing is right. I'm 23. I don't see  
24 anybody who's, like, in my immediate age group.

25           I could be wrong. I don't know.

1           But, like 99 percentage of my experiences with  
2 police have not been positive. Maybe that's because the  
3 police killed my brother in '09. Maybe not.

4           But specifically talking about the SFPD, I  
5 actually know the chief. You would say he recognizes my  
6 face. And I still get pulled over for no reason.

7           So like even though like sometimes they haven't  
8 given me tickets, or I'm not going to jail, I'm not  
9 like -- they're not positive experiences because why are  
10 you disturbing my day for no reason? Which it's usually  
11 for no reason.

12           They got a guy like one, two, speeding tickets  
13 in my life. And neither of them were SFPD, both were  
14 from the Highway Patrol.

15           Every time I got pulled over by SFPD, it was  
16 almost no reason, usually they let me go without a ticket  
17 only after asking me if I was on probation. Which I'm  
18 not. And it's a violation.

19           It's would also say, like, very briefly, let me  
20 add this document. For some reason, you made a comment  
21 about people riding bicycles on the sidewalk.

22           I see how that can be unsafe. That makes sense  
23 to me. I would not tell the police not to enforce that.

24           Also, as someone born and raised in  
25 San Francisco with a physical disability, I don't want

1 you riding your bicycle next to me.

2 I don't think that's equivalent, though, to  
3 having a front license plate.

4 So like when you put those two things on the  
5 same document, I see how it could be easy to be like:  
6 Well, this document doesn't make sense.

7 When actually, one thing kind of makes sense  
8 and the other doesn't. So, that's kind of silly there.

9 Yeah. I think that's all I really want to say.

10 The comments were kind of all over the place.  
11 I came in a bit late so I tried to catch up.

12 But my main thing is if you're going to look  
13 for community, actively look for them, actively put them  
14 in positions, like, to be involved.

15 And then, like, to be honest, what does that  
16 report back look like?

17 What are you going to tell them that you've  
18 actually done? And how you deal with their words and how  
19 you took them in and what came from them because that  
20 usually doesn't happen either.

21 You have meetings in the community and you  
22 leave and there's no real report back and there's no  
23 checking in and there's, no, like, status reports.

24 But then, 30 of you all will work together  
25 every day and have person relationships, will report back

1 to each other.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you for that Rome. I think  
3 that's a great comment to end on before we move on to the  
4 next item.

5 I just want to say how much I appreciate the  
6 diversity of this room.

7 And like you know, vice-president Elias said,  
8 none of this is easy. There's a lot of gray area.  
9 There's a lot of good arguments to make on both sides.

10 I heard a service member point out that maybe  
11 you shouldn't be banning riding bicycles on the street.

12 They make very good arguments for that why that  
13 is. I heard my friend from the ACLU say we need a more  
14 robust list.

15 I think there is arguments to be made on both  
16 sides. That's why it is important to have everyone in  
17 the room.

18 You just heard right here a response to someone  
19 else's comments, (inaudible) and coming to agreement.

20 I really hope and I expect there that there  
21 will be more of that as we continue to have these  
22 dialogues.

23 I know that the Chief wanted us to play a video  
24 about the department's race and reconciliation work. I  
25 don't know if you want to say --

1 (Indecipherable comments.)

2 THE CHAIR: I think if -- well, (inaudible) not  
3 here, so we can do whatever you want.

4 Now, I think the plan -- I think what the law  
5 requires is for the tape to run first and then get public  
6 comment.

7 CHIEF SCOTT: Thank you, Commissioner.

8 All right. I'm going to stand up for this.

9 Residents, very good conversation. Tracy?

10 I'm obviously Black. I've been stopped, I've  
11 been stopped on muni in uniform.

12 PHELICIA JONES: Really?

13 CHIEF SCOTT: Yes.

14 PHELICIA JONES: That's a damn shame.

15 CHIEF SCOTT: It not only happened to me, the  
16 person that got me in this profession, my cousin, LAPD  
17 officer, it also happened to him. So this is very real  
18 for all of us. Very real.

19 Couple things that you're about to watch here,  
20 I want to lay just some really quick context.

21 This conversation is about change and change in  
22 a positive direction.

23 We've been involved in a racial reconciliation  
24 conversation for about a year in the department and this  
25 policy discussion has been woven into that.



1           We talk about the history of how we got here.

2           It's important for us to know that. And it's  
3 important for us to make the connection about how things  
4 have been and how that relates to this very day.

5           So what we've done is we sit in this room,  
6 command staff and others, we've brought speakers in and  
7 then we started taking trips to where a lot of the civil  
8 rights progress in our country was made. And that's the  
9 south.

10           Now, I'm going to -- and there are several  
11 people, of African-American heritage. I want to ask a  
12 quick question.

13           How many people who are Black or of Black  
14 heritage have roots in the south?

15           Every last one of us.

16           Here is the connection of why we started this  
17 in the south.

18           There's plenty of stories to tell about  
19 San Francisco. We've done that too.

20           But the things that I learned, the things that  
21 me and you learned, and the things that were happening in  
22 the south when our parents and our grandparents were  
23 coming up. That was my first impression about police and  
24 what to be aware of.

25           And I grew up down there.

1           So we've been taking officer and community  
2 members on these journeys we've done two, we plan three  
3 more.

4           And this really is about understanding where  
5 we've been. And I appreciate if you don't understand the  
6 history, don't remember it, we're bound to repeat it.

7           I think that's true.

8           Here's another thing. Many of us that consider  
9 ourselves to be leaders in this room, when you go and you  
10 see people that have laid their lives on the line, and I  
11 mean literally, laid their lives on the line to change  
12 the way things are, this is really nothing.

13           None of us are going to walk out of this  
14 building and probably get shot because we're in here  
15 arguing about traffic stops.

16           We talked to people who lost their loves ones.  
17 We talked to people who were maimed because they were  
18 trying to make change just to vote, just to end police  
19 brutality.

20           If that doesn't motivate us to be bold, I don't  
21 know what else will.

22           So we're trying to hit this from all angles. I  
23 want you to see this because I want you to understand  
24 what this department's commitment is to this issue.

25           And we can talk about data all day long. Data

1 sometimes you get vaunted and it just becomes a number on  
2 a page.

3 All this is connected to people.

4 So that's what this journey is about. And I  
5 want to lay this context because this work, to me, is  
6 what really is going to lay our foundation to really have  
7 an understanding of where we are and how we got here.  
8 And what we need to do to get ourselves in a better  
9 place.

10 I don't think we're going to come up with all  
11 the answers about how to fix everything. But we can fix  
12 some things.

13 So this is about a 13-minute video.

14 Hope you -- I hope you get some value from  
15 seeing what we've done.

16 (Video played.)

17 THE LADY: Can you turn it up?

18 (Video continues playing.)

19 CHIEF SCOTT: So this is ongoing. And let's --  
20 for the two trips that we've been on, we had community  
21 have community part of the process.

22 We need some funding to get it started and  
23 we're trying to get funding at this moment, but this is  
24 really what this work is about.

25 (Inaudible.) we're not going to agree on

1 everything. But we have to move forward.

2 It's not about popularity, it's not about who  
3 likes it and who doesn't. It's about are we willing to  
4 do what we need to do to address these issues as much as  
5 we can do in this city and work for both sides of public  
6 safety.

7 Not just addressing the disparity, but getting  
8 the officers who have done the work a means to do that.

9 In a thoughtful manner.

10 So thank you for allowing me to play that. I  
11 hope it gives you some context about how we are trying to  
12 address these issues around really understanding  
13 everything that goes into this.

14 It's not just a narrow conversation.

15 Thank you.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Chief, for that context  
17 and perspective. I think we all really appreciate that.

18 PHELICIA JONES: You need some funding, Chief.  
19 I think that's really good, that you do this again. You  
20 need to find some funding.

21 CHIEF SCOTT: Thank you.

22 PHELICIA JONES: Maybe we can help on that.

23 DOCTOR JAMES TAYLOR: The academic in me is  
24 screaming out. I think the SFPD is the third police  
25 department in the country's history, behind Boston and

1 NYPD. And there's a fascinating California history of  
2 law enforcement with SFPD, LAPD.

3 Race is different in California than it was in  
4 Alabama. Blacks weren't a major focus of racism here  
5 until the 1940s, even though there's some evidence in the  
6 1840s. But clearly the 1940s.

7 So it's just a policing -- I try to teach my  
8 students in my classes, evolves differently in different  
9 regions.

10 The south is one way. Everybody says slave  
11 patrols. That's not accurate here. Slave patrols are  
12 not accurate in Boston or New York.

13 New York comes out of (inaudible) system of  
14 London. Right? And Boston and New York have their  
15 different reputations. SFPD emerges, LAPD comes.

16 So SFPD to me is a unique police department in  
17 American history, because it was one of the earliest.  
18 But because the west coast being so far removed from the  
19 east. And Blacks were back east. So the racial policing  
20 here was not focused on Blacks until much later. And so  
21 it's very young still. It's still very young. Racial  
22 policing in San Francisco, focused on Blacks, black  
23 focus.

24 But, if you go back further, it's Mexicans, and  
25 Indians and Chinese people who were the targets of

1 exclusionary laws, of gentleman's agreements, of  
2 internment.

3 So I just -- I loved this. I also hope we can  
4 do a video about the west coast nature of race and  
5 policing because it's culturally different than  
6 Black-white. It's -- it's blue versus brown, yellow,  
7 red. Where Alabama, Chicago, New York, Philly, it might  
8 be Black and blue.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Very well taken.  
10 That's part of the division.

11 (Multiple speakers; indecipherable.)

12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Happy to work with you  
13 one on one. And happy to talk about future funding.  
14 That is what we wanted (inaudible) as a native  
15 San Franciscan and someone that identifies as indigenous.

16 First thing I appear here was, you know, the  
17 context here is indigenous and Latino issues.

18 So I completely agree (inaudible.)

19 Chief, we're headed there.

20 Hopefully we can (inaudible.)

21 So happy to be --

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What was just pointed  
23 out by Professor Taylor, and all the Black people in this  
24 room, our last names are the names of people who owned  
25 our family; right?

1           So we don't even have our original last names.

2           For some of us, we can't even trace -- very few  
3 of us can even trace our origins in this country; right?

4           So our experience, even in the positions that  
5 we are in right now, are unique. Just what you said,  
6 right?

7           Just what the chief said.

8           You know, we're -- what Ms. Jones said,  
9 Mr. Cox, Ms. Jenkins said, right? Our experiences are  
10 varied and they do speak to the communities that we've  
11 grown up in whether it be here or other places.

12           But it's a unique experience.

13           And race is at the forefront of all of this.  
14 Right?

15           And we're not running from it. We're not  
16 hiding from it.

17           Even me being a Black in a association that is  
18 predominantly white and male. Right? Where else would  
19 that happen? Right?

20           So all these things are out there that, yes, we  
21 need to talk about. And we need to have these tough  
22 conversations, because it is real.

23           (Multiple speakers; indecipherable.)

24           DOCTOR JAMES TAYLOR: Anti-Black term occurs  
25 when Blacks come.

1           That's when -- from the south.

2           So there is a direct southern connection. As  
3 Blacks migrate, all of a sudden, the yellow, red and  
4 brown person is less a threat and it turns to more Black.

5           So SFPD's reputation is really since the '40s,  
6 about '43 on.

7           It's so young, we can correct it.

8           Black -- that's the point I'm trying to make.  
9 Whites should think about this, it's relatively young  
10 with this anti-Black emerges when Blacks come here. And  
11 there were no ghettos. They created ghettos when there  
12 were none. Right?

13           And things of that sort.

14           So, I think if you can sort of acknowledge  
15 that, the use of this racism, perhaps we can begin to  
16 think about the fact that it's not permanent and it can  
17 be eradicated.

18           THE CHAIR: Thank you everyone. I really  
19 appreciate all of this additional conversation.

20           We are -- I know we kept everyone here well  
21 over time. There will be many more of these working  
22 groups, where we can continue having these discussions.

23           And I just want to reiterate again, you know,  
24 what everyone's already said. I want to express my deep  
25 thanks.



1            PHELICIA JONES:  Can I just say, if we're going  
2 to be long, I don't mind catering lunch, because you all  
3 gotta eat.

4            Two and three hours.  I'll foot the bill for --  
5 you know.  We don't want to get hangry.

6            (Multiple speakers; indecipherable.)

7            UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:  Let's take one comment  
8 and recommend adjournment.

9            THE CHAIR:  There's no need to stay.

10           There's no need to stay for public comment,  
11 folks, obviously.  But we will comply with our public  
12 meeting laws.

13           SERGEANT YOUNGBLOOD:  Anyone want to make a  
14 public comment regarding line item 4?

15           There is no public comment.

16           Line item 5, adjournment.

17           Meeting adjourned.

18           (Meeting concluded.)

19           ---o0o---

20

21

22

23

24

25