

MEETING OF THE CIVIC DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE

Monday, October 17, 2022

2:00 p.m.

Remote Meeting

Draft Minutes

Chair Stryker called the meeting to order at 2:05 p.m.

1. Call to Order, Roll call, Agenda Changes, Land Acknowledgment (00:18)

Commissioners Present:

Kimberlee Stryker (Chair)

Abby Schnair (left the meeting at 5:00p.m.)

Patrick Carney

Yiying Lu

Janine Shiota

Staff Present:

Deputy Director of Programs, Joanne Lee

Commission Secretary, Alyssa Ventre,

Program Associate, Paris Cotz

Chair Stryker announced the hybrid meeting instructions. Chair Stryker announced a change to the agenda: Item 7 (Chinatown Public Health Center) was moved and heard after Item 2 (General Public Comment).

Paris Cotz announced public comment instructions.

Chair Stryker began the meeting reading the Arts Commission's land acknowledgement statement.

2. General Public Comment

(7:56)

There was no public comment.

7. Chinatown Public Health Center – Phase 1 and 2 Review

(9:27)

The project team presented the item. Colin Mosher brought up the five comments that were brought up at the previous meeting. These include: feng shui, placement of *Dragon*, artwork visibility and location, signage, and maintenance.

To address the need for feng shui consultation, the project explained that since the building already exists, the orientation and entrance cannot be changed. They raised the entrance canopy and incorporated Chinese Red into the entrance which signifies prosperity and luck. The team added an angled wall on the entrance to allow for additional seating and a nature wall. The team also opened up the stairwell to bring in daylight to the corridor. The team recommended that *Dragon* be placed on the very top of the building which would also allow for the dental clinic to receive more natural light.

The team said they are looking at the feasibility about the placement of *Dragon* on the roof of the building. The team discussed the finish of the armature and overall look of this proposed new location. The team also discussed the visibility of new artwork within the building.

The team showed their plans for the proposed floating signage and discussed future maintenance plans for the façade of the building, and that the new façade will maintain natural light while blocking harsh sun and have better defenses against graffiti.

Commissioners appreciated the way the team integrated their initial comments. Commissioners were concerned about noise on the Broadway entrance tunnel and inquired about glazing and noise reduction. The team responded that they have an acoustic consultant advising them on this topic.

Commissioners urged the team to conduct a survey amongst the community about what they actually see in the sculpture currently on the façade. Commissioners brought up the fact that moving the sculpture to the roof of the building will create new conversations.

Commissioners commented that after cleaning, the sculpture may return to its original color (not black, perhaps). Director Chou responded to questions about the sculpture and explained that the Arts Commission staff needs to conduct further research on the condition of the Dragon and the proposed placement on the roof.

Commissioners also inquired about placement of Chinese language next to English language signage on the façade at a lower, human-level for all members of the community. Commissioners urged that the signage and sculpture be lit at night, as well.

Public Comment:

There was one public comment, by an anonymous caller, who spoke enthusiastically about the remodel which will bring more light and color to the nearby elementary school, Jean Parker Elementary.

Commissioner Shiota, second by Commissioner Carney, moved to approve **Phase 1 and 2 of the architecture** of the **Chinatown Public Health Center** with the following contingencies: art placement will be studied in tandem with public art staff, armature will not be visible if used, lighting as appropriate, characters that name the clinic be more human scale and are down lower on street level and will have bilingual version of English and Chinese.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: Carney, Shiota, Stryker, Lu

Nay: Schnair

4. Transbay Block 3 Park – Phase 2

(1:32:00)

The project team including Lawrence Cuevas, Kathleen O’Day, Eonna Goodwin, Lizzy Hirsch and Monica Scott, shared that the project would go out to bid in Spring 2023, and construction will take two years, to be complete by late Fall 2025. The site is located at one of three blocks that was the site of the temporary Transbay Terminal. The project is focused on community space, ecological value, and celebration of the site’s original history. Mark Baugh-Sasaki’s work entitled *Granite City* has been chosen as the site-specific art enrichment for the project.

The team explained how they incorporated commissioner comments into their Phase 2, reworking the paths and central deck to create a better connection between the nature exploration area and the children’s play area which prioritizes soft and natural materials.

The team reviewed the ecosystem network they are providing to the local flora and fauna, to ensure that there is an overlap and redundancy of food, shelter and other sorts of habitat value throughout the year. The project team also described the materials and palettes for the Stewardship Building, as they were previously advised by commissioners to simplify the building design. The building contains storage for Recreation and Parks, community storage, and a restroom.

Commissioners had questions about whether there would be an educational aspect to the native garden and outdoor lighting for the evening. The team answered that there will be nighttime lighting and that

there is room in the project budget for signage that will help the public learn about the evolution of the landscape and its seasonal phases.

Commissioners questioned if the washroom would be closed at night, and the team responded that the washroom will close around dusk but that the park will be open for the public to walk through at night as there is no fence. Commissioners asked if there would be electrical access for live events, and the team answered that there will be outlets in the Stewardship Building.

Public Comment:

There was a public comment given by an anonymous caller from the California Native Plant Society, enthusiastically supporting this project's urban biodiversity priorities.

Commissioner Schnair, second by Commissioner Shiota, moved to approve **Phase 2 Review** of the **Transbay Block 3 Park**.

The motion unanimously carried by the following vote:
Ayes: Stryker, Carney, Lu, Shiota, Schnair

5. Ingleside Police Station Replacement – Conceptual Review (2:05:55)

The project team, consisting of Magdalena Ryor, Matt Jasmin and Nicholas Ancel, presented the item. They described the location of the along the 280 Freeway in the Balboa Park neighborhood, accessed only via San Jose Avenue along John V. Young Lane and is situated on a rise that offers views of the surrounding area. They explained the project is funded by the Earthquake Safety and Emergency Response Bond for first responder facilities with high seismic risks. The team laid out the goals of the project: expand facilities to accommodate current program needs, be a resource for the community, rehabilitate and upgrade one-hundred-year-old building, develop a unified campus, be sustainable and durable, and provide a safe and secure work environment.

The team described the site challenges: noise from Highway 280, BART's tunnel underneath, small site, site visibility and entrance vulnerability. The project team shared the history of the original building, built in 1910 by Acting City Architect, Emil De Neuf, and shared that the building is eligible for California Register of Historic Places, National Register of Historic Places, and Balboa Park Historic District.

The project team reviewed their designs, explaining that the goal was to unify the buildings with materials and proportions. The team described the plans for perforated fencing and landscape design, for which space is tight, but includes a palm courtyard, basketball court, and paved community space. The team stated that the planting would consist of solely California natives and that they will be meeting with Recreation and Parks Department to plan the civic access side of the site and to connect it with Balboa Park and the greater community.

Commissioners encouraged the team to continue with their design as it solves multiple issues the team is facing. Commissioners thought that the support building did not unify the community building with the historic building, even though they utilize similar materials. A suggestion about color might help in this visual unification of the complex, specifically coloring the support building in a similar way to the historic building, and to avoid installing a white fence.

Commissioner Stryker invited Captain Falzon to speak and commented that this project is unlike any other police infrastructure project, how it focuses on community space while also integrating the needs of the police force. The Captain emphasized the exciting partnership with Recreation and Parks Department and that this project is 'community policing in action.'

There was no public comment.

6. Japantown Peace Plaza Project – Single Phase

(2:40:30)

The project team, consisting of Marien Coss and Jenniffer Cooper, presented the single phase Japantown Peace Plaza Project. They provided historical context of the site, which is located between Post Street and Geary Boulevard, as well as past iterations of the plaza. The team reviewed their outreach and engagement process, which involved festivals, focus groups, surveys, design charrettes, committee and community meetings. The design goals which emerged from the community process were described: to make Post Street visually open, provide a large permanent stage, make Peace Plaza an inviting and playful space, create visual expression along Geary Boulevard edge, and incorporate significant cultural elements.

The team described the functionality of the multilevel space unified by curved wooden furniture. The team presented multiple seating nooks, vegetative planters, bamboo deck, and updated Geary Boulevard entrance. The team described the inspiration of paving, *kasumi*, meaning fog or mist. The team described the planting, which consists of bamboo, Japanese maples, Japanese cherry trees, as well as consistently colorful plants throughout all seasons. The team is attempting to translate traditional Japanese garden varieties into the California landscape and environment. The peace pagoda and eternal flame concepts are still in development.

Chair Stryker agreed to allow for public comment to come before Commissioner comment.

Public Comment:

Lori Yamauchi, Vice President of the Board of Directors for the Japantown Task Force, urged support for this project so that it may move forward.

Dr. Emily Murase, Executive Director of Japantown Task Force, shared the extensive community outreach that occurred on this project and requested commissioner support for the project.

Jon Osaki, Co-Chair of Peace Plaza Committee, urged commissioner to help move this project along that the community has been waiting decades for.

Karen Kai expressed concerns over the water and flame elements and hopes that the project returns for multiple phases of review rather than just the one phase.

Masahiro Inoue, cultural design advisor for the project, expressed his appreciation for both Japanese and Japanese American cultural aesthetics and wishes.

Rich Hashimoto, Co-Chair of Peace Plaza Project, said he was pleased that the waterproofing of the garage will be properly addressed.

Susie Kagami, Manager of Japantown Cultural District, urged support for the single phase review of this project.

Commissioner Stryker inquired to the Project Manager why this project has only come in for one phase of review, whereas most projects of this substance come in for three phases of review. Project Manager responded that they are happy to rectify.

Commissioners expressed similar concerns to the chair and understand that the community ardently wants to the project to be expedited. Commissioners urged the team to reexamine the tile materials to be durable, and to properly light the Peace Pagoda, including the roof. Commissioners wanted to hear how the water element might be incorporated. The project team responded that the Plaza will have the same lighting as Coit Tower. Regarding the water element, the team

explained the many challenges that the site faces and hope that lighting design can convey the elemental nature of water.

Commissioners expressed that it is okay to irrigate in order to have flowers like irises. Commissioners asked the team to return for a Phase 2 and 3 review to allow the team to move forward and return for final approval.

Commissioner Carney, second by Commissioner Shiota, moved to approve **Phase 1 Review** of the **Japantown Peace Plaza Project** with the following contingencies: the team investigate and propose a plan for lighting, paving, water element and the peace flame.

The motion unanimously carried by the following vote:
Ayes: Stryker, Carney, Lu, Shiota, Schnair (left at 5:00pm)

7. Sunol Valley Water Treatment Plant Ozonation Project – Phase 2

(3:43:00)

The team, including Servando Molina, Bryan Dessaure, Reggie Stump and Myles Stevens, presented the project. They shared updates on the project, including construction timelines and materials, and shared updated designs and aerials of the site. The team addressed previous commissioner comments about axial orientations and stated that they cannot reorient the buildings due to their critical operational functions.

The team explained the scientific functions of the new buildings that relate to the ozonation project. The team addressed the changes made to the massing of the generation buildings brought up during their Phase 1 review. The team showed their previous drawings and then shared the updated drawings that took previous commissioner comments into account.

The team shared that they listened to previous comments regarding landscape design. The team substantially reduced the hydroseeding, incorporated existing trees into site, simplified plantings in front garden,

added shrubbery by parking, conveyed a clear design intent for the water wells, addressed potential wildfire hazards in proximity to buildings, and added native shrubbery closer to buildings and walkways for weather relief. Due to the complex nature of the systems on-site, deep rooted plantings are not possible.

Commissioners lauded the native plantings and were amazed by the thoughtfulness put into a facility not open to the public. Commissioners appreciated the texture on the façade of the contractor structure and the team's intent to break up the monotony of the wall. Commissioners appreciated the effort made to create a pleasant environment for the people who work there.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Shiota, second by Commissioner Lu, moved to approve **Phase 2 Review** of the **Sunol Valley Water Treatment Plant Ozonation Project**.

The motion unanimously carried by the following vote:
Ayes: Stryker, Carney, Lu, Shiota

8. Staff Report

(04:12:15)

There was no staff report.

There was no public comment.

9. New Business and Announcements

(04:13:40)

There was no new business or announcements.

There was no public comment.

6. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:20p.m.

Posted 10/31/22, 12:00p.m., pc

Archives Available

A recording of this meeting will be available online after the meeting at the following address: <https://sanfrancisco.granicus.com/player/clip/40845>

Language Accessibility

Translated written materials and interpretation services are available to you at no cost. For assistance, please notify Paris Cotz, 415-252-2252, paris.cotz@sfgov.org.

我們將為閣下提供免費的書面翻譯資料和口譯服務。如需協助， Paris Cotz, 415-252-2252, paris.cotz@sfgov.org.

Materiales traducidos y servicios de interpretación están disponibles para usted de manera gratuita. Para asistencia, notifique a Paris Cotz, 415-252-2252, paris.cotz@sfgov.org.