Minutes
Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting
City and County of San Francisco

Friday February 26, 2021
9:00 – 11:00 am
WebEx event

Members
Taraneh Moayed – Chair, Assistant Director, Office of Contract Administration
Blake Valenta – Analytics Strategist, DataSF, City Administrator's Office
Brian Roberts – Policy Analyst, Department of Technology
Mark de la Rosa – Acting Chief Auditor Executive, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office
Maria McKee - Director of Research & Planning, Juvenile Probation Department
Matthias Jaime – Director, Committee on Information Technology
Todd Rydstrom – Deputy Controller, Controller's Office
Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Nnena Ukuku – Public Member

1. Call to Order by Chair

Ms. Taraneh Moayed called the meeting to order at 9:01 am.

2. Roll call
Taraneh Moayed
Blake Valenta
Brian Roberts
Mark de la Rosa
Maria McKee
Matthias Jaime
Todd Rydstrom
Guy Clarke
Nnena Ukuku

COIT Staff
Emma Fernandez

Department Representatives
Kevin Quan
Penni Eigster
Michelle Geddes

Francis Chan
Joe Reilly
Valeri Shilov
Jeff Harp
Michael Solomon
Christine Nath
Marcus Santiago
Eric Pawlowsky
Andrés Patino

Public Members
Julia Chrusciel

3. **Approval of Minutes from February 12, 2021 (Action Item)**

   The minutes from February 12, 2021 were approved unanimously.

4. **Review and Approval of Surveillance Technology Policy: Security Camera (Action Item)**

Discussion began with departments using the citywide policy standard.

Arts Commission
   Kevin Quan presented the Arts Commission's Security Camera Policy. The department adopted the standard security camera template and provided department-specific answers.

   - Location of the cameras
       o Cameras are located in galleries and cultural centers.
   - Public noticing
       o There is general signage indicating cameras are in use.
   - Crime statistics
       o Department incident logs are maintained on site.
   - Process for sharing information with law enforcement
       o Camera footage is shared with law enforcement if requested.

Child Support Services
   Penni Eigster presented Child Support Services' Security Camera Policy. The department adopted the standard security camera template and provided department-specific answers.

   - Location of the cameras
       o Cameras are located at the 617 Mission St location and behind the building. Cameras cover points of entry, intake, and interview areas. Cameras in the lobby and the alley also capture some sidewalk footage.
   - Public noticing
       o There are signs indicating that cameras are being used at both points of entry.
   - Crime statistics
       o The Department maintains an incident log detailing the date, description, and whether the footage was pulled or shared.

- Process for sharing information with law enforcement
  - In cases of an internal incident, the Department first develops an internal report, and then reviews footage and shares clips as needed.
  - If SFPD requested footage, they would review the footage and pull the clips if available.
  - Storage overwrites every 30 days for less frequently used cameras and every 60 days for the cameras covering points of entry.

Department of Emergency Management

Michelle Geddes presented the Department of Emergency Management's Security Camera Policy. The department adopted the standard security camera template and provided department-specific answers.

- Location of the cameras
  - Cameras are located at the 1011 Turk St building which is the citywide 911 center and emergency operations center.
  - There are 26 cameras throughout the premises that monitor the building perimeter, garage, all entries and exits, and buffer zone and street and sidewalk around the building.
  - The building is staffed 24/7 by Sheriff's deputies.
  - The camera system is nearing end of life and currently retains video recordings for 30 days.
- Public noticing
  - Department is investigating adding public noticing and happy to take guidance.
- Crime statistics
  - The Sheriff maintains the incident log and any call is maintained in the CAD system.
- Process for sharing information with law enforcement
  - There is a standard evidentiary process for sharing data with SFPD, through the custodian of records.
- Data storage
  - Data is stored in house on two servers at 1011 Turk St.

Office of Economic and Workforce Development

Francis Chan presented the Office of Economic and Workforce Development's Security Camera Policy. The department adopted the standard security camera template and provided department-specific answers.

- Location of the cameras
  - In the current phase of the project (Phase 1) cameras are located on Stockton St between Sacramento and Washington.
  - In Phase 2, camera use will expand from Washington to Broadway.
  - The project is a collaboration between OEWD, SFMTA, and SFPD. OEWD provided grant funding to the nonprofit SF SAFE to maintain the cameras.
- Public noticing
  - There is no current public noticing. A public announcement was made about the project.
- Crime statistics

- o OEWD does not maintain an incident log. SF SAFE contacts the Union Square Business Improvement District, who contacts SFPD.

Port

Joe Reilly presented the Port of San Francisco's Security Camera Policy. The department adopted the standard security camera template and provided department-specific answers.

- Location of the cameras
  - o Approximately 160 cameras are located on several piers over 7.5 miles of waterfront and used to protect infrastructure and maritime security at 14 facilities.
- Public noticing
  - o No current public noticing. There are challenges with noticing over such a wide area, but the Port wants to keep the public informed.
- Crime statistics
  - o The Department is developing a more comprehensive incident log.
  - o The Department currently keeps a log of incidents that have required reporting for the Maritime Security Act, but wants to expand to non-mandated incidents.
- Process for sharing information with law enforcement
  - o Footage is shared when requested for an incident. Footage may also be shared with the Coast Guard for reportable facilities.

The committee requested the Port to provide information on the costs of public records requests.

Rent Board

The department adopted the standard security camera template and provided department-specific answers.

- Location of the cameras
  - o Cameras are located in building lobbies.
- Public noticing
  - o There is general signage indicating cameras are in use.
- Crime statistics
  - o Department incident logs are maintained on site.
- Process for sharing information with law enforcement
  - o Camera footage is shared with law enforcement if requested.

The committee unanimously approved the Security Camera policies for the Arts Commission, Child Support Services, Department of Emergency Management, Port of San Francisco, and Rent Board for review at COIT, subject to the following amendments (previously discussed).

Amendments to Rent Board policy:
- Clarify answer to data storage question to indicate the Department uses local storage.

Action on the Office of Economic and Workforce Development policy was deferred to a later meeting.

Discussion then continued to evaluate Surveillance Technology Policies that did not use the citywide template.

Elections

Valeri Shilov presented the Department of Elections' revised Camera Policy, updated to reflect the use cases that are specific to the Department and do not align with the template policy.

Members discussed a desire to create shared standards for camera footage that is streamed to the public.

Public Utilities Commission

Jeff Harp presented the Public Utilities Commission's Security Camera Policy. The department created its own policy.

- Location
  - The PUC policy covers about 400 cameras, about 20 of which are in public areas. Those that are in public areas are in the perimeters of wastewater facilities, exterior cameras at the Hetch Hetchy, and at the Lower Crystal Springs Dam in San Mateo County.

Third Party Template

Emma Fernandez presented the draft template policy for departments whose security cameras are operated by a third party.

Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development

Michael Solomon presented the revised Security Camera Policy, reflecting the new third party template. MOHCD provides grants to nonprofits, including Mercy Housing. Mercy Housing manages the cameras, and does not come to MOHCD in case of an incident, but goes directly to SFPD.

Department of Recreation and Parks

Christine Nath, Marcus Santiago, Eric Pawlowsky, and Andrés Patino presented the Department of Recreation and Parks' Camera Policy. The department created its own policy.

The department uses four types of cameras: security cameras, community development cameras, education – urban wildlife network cameras, and education – bison paddock cameras.

Security cameras:
- There are about 300 cameras that are live streamed to Park Rangers headquarters. Cameras are monitored 24/7 and footage is stored for 30 days.
- The Department has a request process if footage is requested by law enforcement. Requests are tracked in the request management system, and verified to be a valid request. Video shared for a request is deleted when the court case closes or after two years, whichever is sooner.

Community development cameras:
- The department currently has cameras installed at Dolores Park as a pilot that are not currently active. Masking was applied to these cameras.
- There is a new project proposed to install cameras at Marina Yacht Harbor. Masking will be applied if needed.
- The cameras live stream to a public website so viewers can see the weather conditions and activities in the park. This project is similar to one created by the Golden Gate National Parks Conservancy.
- No data will be stored.

Education – Urban Wildlife Network
- Cameras are located in 18 wildlife corridors. They are angled downward and capture minimal images of people, usually feet and arms.
- The data is stored on the camera's memory card, and images are uploaded periodically to UWIN's database.

Education – Bison
- There is a temporary installation of two cameras on poles in the bison paddock. Masking is applied to the street images that are included.
- The footage is live streamed to a public website. This project is similar to the webcams at the California Academy.
- No data is stored.

The committee did not vote on policies for the Department of Elections, Public Utilities Commission, Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development, War Memorial, or Department of Recreation and Parks. The committee proposed developing standards for policies addressing streaming footage, and revisions to the policy templates for third party camera use.

5. Review of Crime Statistics Guidance (Discussion Item)

Emma Fernandez presented the proposed template for providing crime statistics for security cameras, based on SFPD incident data shared in the Open Data Portal.

6. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

7. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:57 am.